

# Public Personnel Review

---

## 1961

**Volume 22, Pages 1-296**

*The Quarterly Journal of the*  
**Public Personnel Association**

---

Office of Publication, 1313 East 60th Street, Chicago 37, Illinois

P

Pers

Use

The

Unic

T

Two

Pub

Port

Aron

The

# Public Personnel Review

**SOCIAL SCIENCES ✓**

**JANUARY, 1961**

**Personnel Panorama—1960**

**Use and Abuse of Intelligence Tests**

**The Public Service in Iran**

**Unions in City Government:  
The Cincinnati Story**

**Two Case Studies in Salary Setting**

**Public Personnel Association Business—1960**

**Portable Pensions for Public Employees?**

**Around the Personnel World**

**The Bookshelf . . . Personnel Literature**

**Journal of the Public Personnel Association**

# PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

The Journal of the Public Personnel Association

Formerly Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada

1313 E. 60th Street

Chicago 37, Illinois

## EDITORIAL STAFF

KENNETH O. WARNER, *Editor*

J. J. DONOVAN, *Managing Editor*

SADIE J. DOYLE, *Editorial Assistant*

## EDITORIAL BOARD

CHARLES A. MEYER, *Assistant Secretary and Chief Examiner, Detroit, Michigan, Civil Service Commission*

JOSEPH A. CONNOR, *Regional Director, Seventh U. S. Civil Service Region, Chicago*

JOHN D. FOSTER, *Personnel Director, Port of New York Authority*

J. STANLEY FRAZER, *Director of Personnel, State of Alabama*

WAYNE L. HIGBEE, *Personnel Director, Santa Monica, California, Personnel Department*

B. H. PETERSON, *Personnel Director, City of Vancouver, B. C.*

HARRY F. SMITH, *Director of Personnel, New York State Department of Labor, Division of Employment*

## EDITORIAL CONSULTANTS

O. E. AULT, *Director, Economic & Technical Assistance, Department of Trade & Commerce of Canada*

SCHUYLER HOSLETT, *Vice President, Reuben H. Donnelly Corporation*

JAMES M. MITCHELL, *Director, Conference Program on Public Affairs, The Brookings Institution*

ROLLIN B. POSEY, *Managing Director, College Department, Row, Peterson & Company*

DONALD PRICE, *Dean, Graduate School of Public Administration, Harvard University*

FOSTER B. ROSER, *Personnel Director, Philadelphia Personnel Department*

ED SHELLEY, *Personnel Director, Tennessee Valley Authority*

O. GLENN STAHL, *Director, Programs & Standards Bureau, U.S. Civil Service Commission*

KATHERINE TAYLOR, *Regional Representative, U.S. Health, Education, and Welfare Department, Dallas*

PAUL VAN RIPER, *Professor of Administration, Cornell University*

ARNOLD S. ZANDER, *International President, American Federation of State, County, and Municipal Employees*

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW is published quarterly, in January, April, July, and October, by the Public Personnel Association, 1313 East 60th Street, Chicago 37, Illinois. U. S. and Canada subscription rates, \$6.50 per year; foreign \$7.50 per year; single copies, \$2.00, in advance. Second class postage paid at Chicago, Illinois, and at additional mailing offices.

**POSTMASTER: Send Form 3579 to Public Personnel Review, 1313 East 60th St., Chicago 37, Ill.**



## CONTENTS

	PAGE
Personnel Panorama—1960	
I. The Federal Civil Service in Canada . . . . . Samuel H. S. Hughes	5
II. Canadian Provincial Developments . . . . . Hugh M. Morrison	10
III. U. S. Civil Service Looks Ahead . . . . . Roger W. Jones	13
IV. U. S. Federal Personnel Management . . . . . O. Glenn Stahl	17
V. State and Local Developments . . . . . Keith Ocheltree	20
Use and Abuse of Intelligence Tests . . . . . John C. Flanagan	24
The Public Service in Iran . . . . . Richard W. Gable	29
Unions in City Government: The Cincinnati Story . . . . . W. D. Heisel and J. P. Santa-Emma	35
Two Case Studies in Salary Setting . . . . . Louis J. Kroeger	39
Public Personnel Association Business—1960 . . . . . Kenneth O. Warner	44
Around the Personnel World . . . . .	50
Personnel Opinions . . . . .	55
"Is it desirable as a matter of broad public policy to facilitate mobility in the public service by enabling employees to transfer retirement credits from one retirement system to another?"	
The Bookshelf . . . . .	63
Book and Pamphlet Notes . . . "Recruitment for the Public Service" (An An- notated Bibliography, Library, U. S. Civil Service Commission).	
Personnel Literature . . . . .	74

### Public Personnel Review . . . .

The quarterly journal of the Public Personnel Association provides a medium for the publication of factual material and for materials that may represent divergent ideas, judgments, and opinions. The views expressed in articles and other contributions are those of the authors and may not be construed as reflecting the views of the Association or the editors unless so stated.

**Subscription Rates.** U. S. and Canada, \$6.50 per year; foreign, \$7.50; single copies, \$2.00, in advance. Prices on back issues quoted on request.

All correspondence regarding manuscripts, subscriptions, and advertising should be addressed to the editorial and business offices of *Public Personnel Review*, Room 456, 1313 East 60th Street, Chicago 37, Illinois.

## Making Personnel a Profession

LAST YEAR members of the Public Personnel Association voted to create a professional member category. One can apply for professional membership when he has been an individual member of this Association for five years and meets standards now being developed. The establishment of this membership category can mean much to improve the quality of public personnel administration and raise the standing of people in that endeavor. But to meet those objectives we need a clear notion of what is meant by a "profession."

In common parlance the term "profession" is used casually and with different meanings. For example, we speak of "professional athletes," "professional barbers," "professional beauticians," and a host of other similar occupations. In this sense we refer to someone who specializes in an occupation and demonstrates superior performance or meets certain requirements of licensure.

At the same time, we also use the term to describe callings such as law, medicine, and theology. Here, "professional" takes on overtones which carry deeper meanings. Probably when we think of personnel work we have in mind the loftier status symbols implicit in these long-established, well-recognized professional fields.

The abundant literature on concepts of a profession contains a variety of criteria which must be met if a field of endeavor is to be regarded as a profession. In their article, "Is Training a Profession?" (*Journal of the American Society of Training Directors*, April, 1960), Messrs. Lippitt and This noted seven criteria which appeared at least twice in several standard works on the subject, in this order:

1. A body of specialized knowledge.
2. Standards set by the group.
3. Intellectual activities are involved.
4. Extensive preparation is required.

5. Communicable specialized knowledge.
6. "Service" is placed above personal gain.
7. A strong professional organization exists.

Whether personnel work ranks as a profession depends upon how strictly the foregoing criteria are applied to the pursuit called "personnel." In my view it is a barren intellectual exercise to debate whether or not personnel is now a profession. Of far greater importance is the recognition that each mark of a profession embodies an intrinsic value; each represents a goal worth striving for, and each can be improved.

We doubt that a true profession of personnel can come into being by isolated and uncoordinated acts of individuals, no matter how dedicated. To be successful, the quest demands that organizations in the field accept and meet the challenges so clearly set forth in the tenets on which a profession stands. Indeed, the first PPA professional members will bear a special responsibility to combine their energies toward making each mark of a profession really meaningful. Every one of the criteria must be made a matter of substance and not a mere matter of form. The task is tremendous; its accomplishment calls for the rallying of personnel people everywhere to the importance of the calling in which they engage.

Personnel can be made a profession. But it will achieve that status only through the arduous and constant efforts of thousands of people willing to give their talents and time to develop, expand, and perfect the body of knowledge we now call "personnel." It takes dedicated people to make and maintain a profession.

*Kenneth O. Varner*  
EDITOR

## Meet the Authors

● **John C. Flanagan**, author of *Use and Abuse of Intelligence Tests*, is President and Director of Research of the American Institute of Research at Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. He holds B.S. and M.A. degrees from the University of Washington and received his Ph.D. from Harvard. Prior to taking his present position in 1946, Dr. Flanagan was Associate Director of the Cooperative Testing Service and Director of the Aviation Psychology Program of the U. S. Air Force. He has been a professor of psychology at the University of Pittsburgh since 1946, was elected a Fellow of the American Psychological Association in 1938, and is a diplomate in industrial psychology of the American Board of Examiners in Professional Psychology.

● **Richard W. Gable**, Ph.D., author of *The Public Service in Iran*, is Associate Professor in the School of Public Administration, University of Southern California. From 1955 to 1957 he taught in the Institute for Administrative Affairs, University of Tehran, Iran, as a participant in a project in technical assistance which USC was conducting under contract with the International Cooperation Administration. Currently he is the campus director of a similar USC project in Brazil under an ICA contract, and is serving as a consultant to an Executive Development Project USC has developed for civil servants of Pakistan under another ICA contract. He has taught at Stanford University, Ohio State University, and UCLA. His publications include *Public Control of Economic Enterprise*, co-authored with Harold Koontz, and articles in scholarly journals.

● **W. D. Heisel**, co-author of *Unions in City Government: The Cincinnati Story*, has been City Personnel Officer and Civil Service Secretary in Cincinnati for the past five years. He is now in his twenty-fourth year in Cincinnati's Personnel Department which, among its many other functions, acts as the

City Manager's representative in all negotiations. A graduate of DePauw University, he has a master's degree in public administration from the University of Cincinnati.

● **Samuel H. S. Hughes**, author of "The Federal Civil Service in Canada" section of *Personnel Panorama—1960*, is Chairman of the Civil Service Commission of Canada. He holds the degree of Bachelor of Arts from the University of Toronto and Master of Arts from the University of Oxford. Mr. Hughes taught history at Ridley College, St. Catharines, Ontario, from 1936 to 1939, when he commenced studies for the Bar of Ontario at Osgoode Hall in Toronto. He served overseas in the Canadian Army from 1941 to 1946 and was discharged with the rank of Lieutenant-Colonel. Called to the Bar in 1947, he practiced law in Welland, Ontario. In 1955 he was created Queen's Counsel and later in the year was appointed first Chairman of the Ontario Highway Transport Board. He became a Judge of the Supreme Court of Ontario in 1958 and resigned the following year to accept his present position.

● **Roger W. Jones**, author of the "U. S. Civil Service Looks Ahead" section of *Personnel Panorama—1960*, is Chairman of the U. S. Civil Service Commission. At the time of his appointment in 1959, he was Deputy Director of the Bureau of the Budget. A long-time career civil servant, he entered the federal service in 1933. His career in the Bureau of the Budget (1939-1959) was interrupted by a term of military service for which he was awarded the Legion of Merit and the Order of the British Empire. He received the National Civil Service League's "Career Service Award" in 1955 and the "President's Award for Distinguished Federal Civilian Service" in 1958. He holds a B.A. degree from Cornell University and an M.A. degree from Columbia University.

● **Louis J. Kroeger**, author of *Two Case Studies in Salary Setting*, is Executive Vice President of Griffenhagen-Kroeger, Inc. He draws on a background of personnel technical and administrative experience, general administration, teaching, and consulting. Following ten years with the California State Personnel Board, four of which were as Executive Officer, he served in the federal Office of Price Administration as Executive Officer for Rationing and as Director of Administrative Service. He established the consulting firm of Louis J. Kroeger & Associates in 1945, and since its merger with Griffenhagen & Associates in October, 1959, has directed their combined operations.

● **Hugh M. Morrison**, author of the "Canadian Provincial Developments" section of *Personnel Panorama—1960*, is Chairman of the Civil Service Commission, Province of British Columbia. He received a B.A. degree with Honours from the University of British Columbia and his M.A. and Ph.D. from Clark University in addition to doing postgraduate work in Education from the University of Chicago. A former Inspector of Schools in British Columbia, he was appointed Chief Personnel Officer by the government of the province in 1945. He became Chairman of the Civil Service Commission in 1948. In 1957-1958, he served as Chairman of the Western Regional Conference of the Public Personnel Association and has written various articles on history and education for such journals as the *Canadian Historical Review* and the *School Review*.

● **Keith Ocheltree**, author of the "State and Local Developments" section of *Personnel Panorama—1960*, is Senior Staff Member of the Public Personnel Association. His background includes graduate work in public administration at Syracuse University, a

public administration internship in New York state, and work in the Training Division of the New York State Civil Service Department. Prior to joining the Public Personnel Association staff, Mr. Ocheltree was for five years a field staff member of Public Administration Service.

● **Joseph P. Santa-Emma**, co-author of *Unions in City Government: The Cincinnati Story*, is a new addition to the Cincinnati Personnel Department staff. He is a graduate of Kent State University and received his master's degree from The Ohio State University. Joining Cincinnati's staff as an administrative intern in 1959, he has since become a member of the permanent organization, assisting in labor relations.

● **O. Glenn Stahl**, author of the "U. S. Federal Personnel Management" section of *Personnel Panorama—1960*, has been identified with federal personnel administration for many years. Following service with TVA and the Federal Security Agency, where he became Director of Personnel, he served as Executive Vice Chairman of the Federal Personnel Council, and moved to his current assignment as Director of the Civil Service Commission's new Bureau of Programs and Standards in 1955. During the winter of 1958-59 he was on loan to the United Nations on a Technical Assistance assignment in Venezuela. In January, 1960, he received the Civil Service Commission's Distinguished Service Award. He holds a master's degree from the University of Wisconsin and a Ph.D. from New York University; has taught at New York University; served as visiting lecturer at numerous universities; and is currently Adjunct Professor of Public Administration at The American University. He is the author of the standard work *Public Personnel Administration* and many articles in professional journals.

# Personnel Panorama—1960

## I. The Federal Civil Service in Canada

Samuel H. S. Hughes

*Pay revision, a group health insurance plan, and a proposed new federal civil service law highlight the past year.*

AFTER a little more than a year in office as Chairman of the Civil Service Commission of Canada, I have been asked to indicate what lies ahead for the federal service. If it were a matter of prophecy alone, the task might prove insuperable; but fortunately, the crowded experiences of fourteen months have served to illuminate rather than obscure the road ahead.

For my colleagues in the commission, the period has been busy enough. As for me, unfortified by their lifelong experience as civil servants and with much to learn as well as to transact, the pace has been particularly strenuous. It is largely due to their staunch support, and that of the hard-working and capable staff of the commission, that I can approach the task with at least the outward appearance of reflection and calm.

It will be seen that the immediate future prospects of the civil service of Canada are stimulating. Interest in the service, both inside and outside Canada, is at a high pitch. All our records indicate that we have few recruiting problems and that retention in the service is normal and subject to the usual turnover.

### Developments in Personnel Policy

While I have been in Ottawa I have observed, and to some extent participated in, the government's intense preoccupation with personnel policy. One evident result of this has been the establishment of a new group medical-surgical-hospital plan for the public

service—long meditated by the National Joint Council—in which the government has assumed the responsibility of paying half the value of the premiums required. The similarity between this undertaking and the current practices in industry is significant.

Important amendments were made to the Public Service Superannuation Act in the last session of Parliament. The most important of these, from the standpoint of civil servants, was the utilization of the average of the best six years of employment as the basis for calculating superannuation rates, rather than the ten-year period as previously adopted. The practical result in virtually all cases will be to increase the scale of superannuation with a proportionate rise in the amount of pensions in the civil service and those other government agencies in which contributors are employed.

### New Civil Service Bill

A new bill has been drawn and read the first time in the House of Commons to replace the present Civil Service Act of 1918. This new Civil Service Bill is based upon the recommendations of the Report of the Civil Service Commissioners on Personnel Administration in the Public Service. This report is known colloquially and universally as the "Heeney Report" because of its close association with my distinguished predecessor, Mr. Arnold Heeney, Q.C., now our ambassador at Washington.

It will be appreciated that, in the course of over forty years, the best of laws—and the Act of 1918 was indeed one of the most enlightened of its day—becomes encrusted with a gloss of interpretations and proce-

Editor's Note: This article was adapted from a paper presented by the author at the Public Personnel Association's 1960 International Conference on Public Personnel Administration, New York City, October 23-27, 1960.



dures which blur its outlines and to some extent distort its pristine principles. The various governments hesitated to amend provisions which had evidently stood the test of time and been widely hailed as establishing the principle of selection known as the "merit system" upon everlasting foundations.

Therefore, the drafting of its proposed successor has been a delicate and exacting process. No doubt its subsequent consideration by a select committee of the House of Commons will be searching and prolonged.

### Pay Rates Reviewed

The Civil Service Commission has just completed, with some minor exceptions, a sweeping review of pay rates in the Civil Service, and has made recommendations to the government which have resulted in substantial increases in almost every category. This is the first such increase since 1957, when a similar sweeping upward revision was recommended and adopted, and the eighth since the end of the war (other increases had been granted in 1947, 1948, 1950, 1951, 1953, and 1956). The present activity is not only a sign of the economic times, but it represents a realization that pay determination must be approached scientifically and methodically. Of this I will have a word or two to say later.

### Civil Service Commission Reorganized

Within the Civil Service Commission itself, a thorough reorganization, first contemplated some two years ago, has now been implemented. The main feature of the changes created thereby has been the establishment of a Directorate of Operations to incorporate within itself the day-to-day functions of the Personnel Selection Branch and the Organization and Classification Branch.

Departmental requirements in both the fields of selection and classification will thus be met in the front line, as it were, of the commission. The more reflective pursuits of the advisory services will be disentangled from the operational routine. It is hoped that the results will be beneficial to both.

A more recent decision of the commission to enlarge the function of the Appeals

Branch and to pay ever-increasing attention to the important activities of the staff associations of the civil service has resulted in the emergence of a new Directorate of Appeals and Service Relations. Thus, the three-fold functions of appeals, public relations, and relations with staff associations will be co-ordinated and much essential planning for their future development undertaken.

This reorganization of the commission, although not consciously designed for operation under the terms of the new bill, undoubtedly reflects the thinking which was behind the drafting of the latter. It will no doubt be carefully watched, both within and outside the commission, to see whether or not it fulfills the expectations which inspired it. Needless to say, it may well be refashioned in the coming months to meet needs and developments which may hitherto have been unforeseen.

### Royal Commission Study

Finally, the government has realized its long-standing determination to have the whole organization of the federal government examined by a Royal Commission with powers and duties similar to those of the celebrated Hoover Commission in the United States. The recommendations of the commission are not likely to appear for at least two years, but they will no doubt deal thoroughly with the question of government spending and the elimination of duplication in government operations, which in turn may be expected to save money for the Canadian taxpayer.

On the other hand, it is to be hoped that the Royal Commission will deal faithfully with all those fundamental assumptions upon which the organization of government is now based. Its proceedings and report will be eagerly watched and awaited by the civil service of Canada, who wishes it well and welcomes the type of scrutiny which is forecast.

### Technical Aid to Underdeveloped Areas

There has been a great deal of interest shown in the civil service outside of Canada, particularly among peoples who for the first time are confronted with unfamiliar administrative problems and are happy to seek

## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

technical assistance in a quarter which does not appear to demand the rendering of hostages to fortune. Since the last war, experience has shown that, in addition to financial aid, the underdeveloped countries of the world require the aid of trained administrators, both individually and in teams.

A great deal of valuable work of this type has been and is being done; but in this connection, the Prime Minister of Canada, speaking to the General Assembly of the United Nations, had the following to say:

We intend, in Canada, to establish a roster of Canadian experts in various fields—ready at short notice to be sent under United Nations auspices to newly independent states requesting them. They can help in setting up or restoring civil administration such as in the Congo, in distress areas or in disaster areas. National action of a stand-by nature is obviously desirable to supplement the United Nations OPEX proposal. We suggest that experts, in an experts' bank, if you will, might be recruited for medicine, public health, sanitation, public welfare, distribution of supplies, communications, transportation, and police services. To set up an experts' bank would make for administrative stability instead of having to rely on a crash recruiting campaign for this purpose after the need arises.

Implementation of this proposal will hardly fail to increase the responsibilities and challenges of our federal civil service. Canadian civil servants will, I am sure, play their parts in this venture as manfully in the years ahead as they and their fathers did in two great wars fought for the establishment of individual rights and the preservation of human freedom.

### Pay Determination

Not the least of the great questions to be decided in the future is the extent to which employees and their associations, generally referred to as "staff associations," will participate in the process of pay determination. The new Civil Service Bill pays recognition, for the first time in our history, to an obligation placed upon the Minister of Finance, or the Civil Service Commission, or both, of consulting employees' organizations on matters of pay and other conditions of service.

For purposes of background information,

the Act of 1918 gave the commission the sole right to make recommendations to the government in matters of pay. In recent years the process leading to the submission of these recommendations has become elaborate. It has long been recognized that increases or adjustments could not be based upon a mere percentage increase "across the board."

Three years ago the government established the Pay Research Bureau, a component of the Civil Service Commission. This bureau was charged with the responsibility of collecting information from among private concerns on rates of pay prevailing outside the service for purposes of comparison. It was not to be expected that this delicate process could be brought to full perfection overnight, and much of the work of the bureau has been experimental.

However, many questions that arose during the survey have now been very largely answered, and the Pay Research Bureau delivers its statistically digested and analyzed conclusions confidentially to the Civil Service Commission itself, to the Treasury, and to the staff associations in a form which preserves the anonymity of the sources of information. The commission, after considering the bureau's reports and such submissions as may be made by the staff associations, makes its recommendations to the government.

### Pros and Cons on "Systematic Discussions"

The proposals of the Heeney Report for change and development in this area contemplated the establishment of "systematic discussions," wherein the Civil Service Commission would preside over regularly called and constituted meetings between representatives of the Treasury Board—the government's agent in these matters—and the staff associations.

Somewhat naturally, the doctrinaire advocates of what is known as "collective bargaining" were not satisfied by a proposal which would leave the last word with the commission, claiming that such systematic discussions would be only of a fact-finding and advisory nature. They further felt that these proposals lacked the spectacular climax to collective bargaining in industry

when, after much and sometimes almost interminable discussion, the balance between demand and concession is finally achieved and a firm agreement is reached across the table.

Since staff associations generally are united in disclaiming any intention to promote the right to strike against the state, some of their more studious members regard arbitration as the ideal solution. These views, not unnaturally, cause misgivings in the minds of the official advisers of the Government who feel that, since the state is not a normal employer, the polite and sometimes not-so-polite intimidation which is imposed on private employers in the name of bargaining is not appropriate to the fixing of salaries for public employees.

Moreover, in their view, determination of the salaries of classified civil servants in a tremendous variety of occupations at an abundance of different levels is a deliberate and exacting task which must be done scientifically, methodically, and to schedule by experts and not merely be extruded by a combination of pressures.

It will be seen, therefore, that developments of the kinds proposed must be carefully and soberly considered and only a large measure of good will from all quarters will suffice to settle a question which perhaps has only a limited interest for the nation as a whole.

### Effects of the New Bill

The new Civil Service Bill, if enacted by Parliament, will produce a number of changes of emphasis which will necessitate adjustments in current thinking and attitudes. The position of the Civil Service Commission as an agency controlling the organization of government departments will be at an end, and it will retain merely an advisory function in this field. The extent to which that advisory function will be used, either by the departments and agencies or by the Treasury, remains to be seen.

**Appeals.** An area of special interest in this connection will be that of appeals. The provisions of the bill have added to the employee rights already in existence the important right of an appeal against dismissal.

The provisions also confer on Civil Service Commission appeal boards extensive powers of investigation second only to those enjoyed by the courts of the country.

The commission has recently extended to an appellant the right of representation by counsel or other agent before an appeal board. In addition, the new bill provides that the selection of appeal boards be made entirely by the commission. It does not contemplate the sitting thereon of representatives of the appellant's staff association and his employing department.

Thus, it will be appreciated that a new field of activity will open up for both the staff associations and the personnel branches of government departments by reason of the change in their role from that of judge to that of advocate.

It seems to me unlikely that many civil servants will engage the services of lawyers at their own expense, if the staff associations provide advocates for their members specially trained in personnel practices.

**Training.** A second area affected by the new bill involves the commission's responsibility for staff training. Preoccupation with general courses of instruction, as opposed to specialized training of a departmental type, has always been recognized in practice. Under the new bill it will be explicitly proclaimed.

Several important questions must be decided in this area, covering such matters as the extent that the commission can provide assistance to departments; the circumstances under which the departments should rely on the commission's resources and coordinating functions; whether the civil service does enough in this field and whether it is possible ever to be satisfied with any current level of achievement; the advisability of permanent training establishments such as those that are so successfully employed by the armed forces.

### Merit System on Firm Ground

The merit system as we know it in Canada involves recognizing that entry into the civil service, and promotion within it, must be based on merit and not on favour either political or departmental. But it also involves the erection of cumbersome ma-



## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

chinery—the advertising of vacancies, the administering of examinations, the interviewing of candidates, and the hearing of appeals.

Even the most callow investigator could put his finger on something wrong here. What a waste of time and manpower! My colleagues and I are the recipients of daily expostulations along these lines from senior public officials.

Indeed, some government agencies which are outside the jurisdiction of the Civil Service Act, find in the machinery of the merit system powerful arguments for *remaining* outside. If we want a man, they say, we know where to find him and we run no risk of losing him to our competitors by submitting him to this tedious process of selection; and we also know whom to promote and when, without going through the mummery of competition.

It has long been recognized that we must pay a price for our indulgence in the luxury of democratic government. The same must be said of our enjoyment of the merit system, which is inspired by the principles of democracy as distinct from the practices of party politics.

The institution of Parliament! The very words have the ring of trumpets. I hope we shall never live to see the day when even its weaknesses will be threatened with extinction, because its weakness in one direction is merely the complement of its strength in another. It has stood the sternest test of all—the test of time.

### Thought for the Day . . .

We must not create such rigid rules in our organisation as to eliminate entirely the element of humanity in administration. We must always reserve a little discretion to meet the really deserving case and try to maintain respect for personality and individuality at all costs. However high one's office, it never hurts to be human.—Wallace C. Wurth, C.M.G., Chairman of Public Service Board of New South Wales, Australia. From *Public Administration*, March, 1960.

### "The Past Is Prologue"

What we call the merit system—what during the French Revolution they called *la carrière ouverte aux talents*—has stood the same test, albeit a shorter one.

And what a time it has been! Our representative institutions and our public services have, in both the United States and Canada, as in Britain and other countries of the Commonwealth, survived the two most frightful and closely related wars in history, the convulsions of which have swallowed up many ancient states with deep-rooted public institutions of their own.

Ours have survived, and their survival has been no accident. It is a result of their inherent strength regardless of their apparent weakness in terms of administrative convenience.

If we are to look ahead in civil service matters, we must adopt the highest possible vantage point from which to see the expanding scene in all its proportions. In Canada it is one of great activity which will undoubtedly result in the employment of new techniques and in the recommendation of new remedies calculated to reduce waste and delay.

It is to be hoped that those of us who are engaged in this type of enquiry and in the consideration of such recommendations do not descend from the high ground and allow the dust of conflict to blind us to the relative importance of waste and delay, on the one hand, and justice and freedom on the other.

# Personnel Panorama—1960

## II. Canadian Provincial Developments

Hugh M. Morrison

*Complete program studies, revised sick leave and vacation policies, group insurance plans, and extended training and recruiting featured in the provinces.*

IN THE TEN Canadian provinces there were five general elections in 1960. Two of these five elections resulted in changes in government. However, the merit systems in the two provinces affected were in no danger. This was a heartening sign to the public personnel administrator.

The personnel policies that were adopted in many of the provinces during the past year indicated that steady progress in consistent administration has been made in the support of merit systems. The following is a brief account of the developments in seven of the provinces in 1960.

### Nova Scotia

The implementation and completion of the Job Evaluation and Salary Adjustment Program, which was started three years ago under the supervision of the firm of Jerome Barnum Associates of New York, occupied the full attention of the Civil Service Commission during 1960. This task, although completed for most departments, is not yet finished. The Group Insurance Plan is undergoing a thorough study, and an interim report has been prepared for presentation to the government, which, if adopted, will result in a refinement and extension of benefits for eligible employees.

The sudden passing of the Civil Service Commissioner, Mr. W. J. (Bill) Finn, in May was a great shock to the entire province, and to his many colleagues and friends in personnel administration circles throughout Canada. Mr. G. E. Perry, a senior official in the Department of Education, was appointed to the position on June

1st. A general election resulted in no change of government.

### New Brunswick

A change of government resulted from a general election in June. Mr. Louis J. Robichaud, the first Acadian French Premier to receive a mandate in New Brunswick, led the Liberal Party to a victory.

The Civil Service Commission conducted a province-wide recruiting program for typists and stenographers in the commercial schools, and administered examinations to 1,197 candidates in 38 schools. For the first time since World War II, the commission had a surplus of applicants in these classifications.

A general salary increase, amounting to one annual increment within salary ranges, was granted to all employees. An in-service training program for mechanics in the Public Works Department was continued.

Through assistance from the Test Exchange Service of the Public Personnel Association, examining techniques for psychiatric aides and attendants were improved. The adoption of a driver examiner program in the province resulted in an extensive recruitment and examining program for the commission.

### Ontario

The Honourable James N. Allan, Provincial Treasurer, announced in the Legislature on March 31st, that the firm of Stevenson and Kellogg, Ltd., of Toronto had been retained to study and report on personnel practices in the Ontario Civil Serv-

## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

ice. These studies were to include establishment, organization structure, job evaluation, and salary rates. The Civil Service Commission's staff co-operated fully with the firm in the pilot project, which was a study of one department.

The new grievance procedure completed its first full year of operation in 1960. This procedure was formulated in October, 1959, after discussions between the government and the Civil Service Association of Ontario. Under the regulations, a "grievance" means any complaint made by a public servant with regard to working conditions or terms of employment.

Grievances concerning position classifications or promotion are heard at the final stage by the Civil Service Commission, while those pertaining to other aspects of working conditions go to the Public Service Grievance Board.

During the year, also, new regulations under the Public Service Act greatly strengthened the operation of the Joint Councils system, particularly in respect to bringing recommendations to the government, and in the creation of departmental councils.

### Manitoba

A new Civil Service Act was passed which brought personnel administration up to date. Although there were no radical changes in legislation, the new act incorporated modern concepts of personnel administration while retaining all the safeguards of the established merit program.

Civil servants, for the first time, were provided with a group insurance program, effective May 1st. The province pays one-third of the cost, and the employee the balance. Casual employees—those regularly employed on an hourly, daily, or monthly basis, on construction, maintenance, etc.—are also eligible.

During the year an educational program for senior and middle management levels of the service was instituted. This course was designed as a refresher course in general practices and problems for staff members who have had considerable experience or training in government administration.

### Saskatchewan

A 1960-1961 collective-bargaining agreement between the government and the Saskatchewan Civil Service Association was signed. For the first time in five years there was no across-the-board increase. Dual and triple salary ranges for teaching jobs in the service were introduced, bringing such salaries into more realistic relationship with the long salary ranges prevailing in the public school system.

As with agricultural classifications last year, two training steps and a six-step salary range were introduced for entrance-level engineering positions, for the purpose of keeping compensation in line with other jurisdictions, without granting automatic promotions or reclassifications.

Annual vacation leave for employees with twenty-five years' service was increased to four weeks. The question of longevity increases was considered and rejected. At a general election in June, the government was returned to power.

### Alberta

Alberta continued its implementation of its new classification and pay plan, prescribed by the Public Administration Service of Chicago. Also, it completed the first year of its new Suggestion Award Program.

### British Columbia

Vacation and sick leave regulations were revised. A graduated system of annual vacations in line with continuous service rendered was implemented on April 1st. As a result, an employee with twenty years or more of service now receives four weeks' annual vacation. Sick leave regulations were also revised so as to encourage careerists and safeguard against malingering. The new regulations were also applicable on a proportionate basis to seasonal and daily rate personnel.

A government-employee contributory group insurance plan, covering all steadily employed personnel was also inaugurated. The policy of granting a payment equivalent to three months' salary to dependents of employees who die in service, was retained.

Although there was no across-the-board

wage increase in 1960, increases based on recruitment and "fair-wage" comparisons were implemented, mainly to professional and administrative classifications.

Training courses were expanded and continued. Those in property appraisal were continued, and a first course for official court reporters was established. An electronics course for business machine mechanics was sponsored, and the second class of twenty-six in the Executive Development Training Program received their diplomas in Public Administration at the University of British Columbia's autumn convocation.

The commission made a positive attempt to improve its contacts with the civil service by the inauguration of a monthly "Civil Service Newsletter," a copy of which is mailed to the home of each employee. In addition, the chairman and his officials in-

creased their visits to the various government centres throughout the province.

In regard to government-employee relations, the Honourable W. D. Black, Provincial Secretary, announced in the legislature on February 22nd the government's intention to establish a Board of Reference. Under the chairmanship of Dr. Hugh Keenleyside, former director of the United Nations' Technical Assistance Program, this board would include a nominee from the appealing organization as well as a nominee from the Civil Service Commission. It would make final decisions in respect to references falling within established policy, and would make recommendations to the government regarding matters not within established policy.

At a general election in September, the government was returned to power.

### Time for a Change in Attitude . . .

[T]he responsibilities of colleges and universities today in helping to meet the federal manpower needs must be envisaged in the framework of the tremendous job which is to be done. A strong undergraduate program in a multitude of areas is required. A graduate program of diversity and strength is increasingly important. Beyond these requisites, we must have guidance, counseling and placement programs and officers who are consistently and continuously interested in the federal manpower problems. We must emphasize the opportunities of federal service. We can no longer give students the impression that "if you can't find anything else, you can fall back on federal positions." These positions are far too important for that kind of person or that type of attitude. The institutions of higher education can assist greatly in setting the scene for wholesome attitudes on the part of the persons who will enter federal service.—Dr. Frank G. Dickey, President, University of Kentucky. Sixth U.S. Civil Service Region Joint College-Federal Recruiting Symposium, 1958.

# Personnel Panorama—1960

## III. U. S. Civil Service Looks Ahead

Roger W. Jones

*The Chairman of the U. S. Civil Service Commission looks beyond the horizons to a better civil service in the future.*

THE CHAIRMAN of the Civil Service Commission is sometimes referred to as "the head of the civil service." This, of course, is a rationalization, and not a very accurate rationalization at that.

There may have been a time—perhaps in the era of Theodore Roosevelt—when the civil service commissioners, individually and collectively, were the "heads" of the civil service—heads in the sense that there was a pressing daily need for them to assume active, often belligerent, responsibility for (1) protection and advancement of the merit system, (2) development of new ideas for the exercise of positive leadership in civilian personnel matters, and (3) proposing adjustments of the federal personnel system which would be consistent with a new and still largely unfathomed law.

Today I suspect that if the real truth were admitted, we should find that the civil service needs little belligerent protection; that merit-system advances are advocated in many places besides the Civil Service Commission; that the civil service commissioners, including the chairman, echo the personnel thinking of others as often as they advance thoughts of their own. We know the limitations and the strengths of the civil service laws, and proposals for adjustment arise frequently from many sources.

This state of affairs, however, does not necessarily derogate from the leadership role of the Civil Service Commission. The commissioners are leaders in that they have a clear responsibility to analyze and

evaluate, to digest and discuss, and often to advocate or oppose proposals for advancement and protection of the merit system, and for improvement of personnel management generally. Theirs is no longer an empire to be carved out and protected, but a set of management tools to be kept sharp and used to teach others.

### Tripartite Leadership

In the 22 years since personnel offices became a permanent part of the management "tool bag," there has been less and less that the Chairman of the Civil Service Commission can do by way of effective innovation. In blunt reality, when he has a new idea, it is often found that the agencies also have it. When he does get there ahead of them, with good support materials for his proposals, the sooner those proposals are tested out on the agencies and bounced up against their experience and judgment, the better the result is apt to be.

There are exceptions, of course, but the chief point I am making is that courage, resourcefulness, and initiative in personnel affairs are not the exclusive property of the Civil Service Commission or its chairman. Nevertheless, the approach to most personnel problems by agency people has to be oriented, perforce, to the needs of that one agency and must reflect the luster of the fabric of the agency's thinking and program. This may not be good in universal application, so there is still a role for the central personnel agency.

I have argued that civil service history seems to demonstrate that most inventions, most ideas about processes and procedures, and, in fact, most discoveries about new

Editor's Note: This article was adapted from a paper presented by the author at the Public Personnel Association's 1960 International Conference on Public Personnel Administration, New York City, October 23-27, 1960.



policy, seldom spring full blown from one source. Some people will say that I am advocating evasion of responsibility. I would choose to call it something else.

The time has come, I would say, for the Civil Service Commission to look ahead. But in doing so, it should not be seeking brave new worlds awaiting discovery by its own efforts and pioneering. Rather, it should seek to give broader form and more fully usable substance to the new worlds which have already been discovered by the agencies. Their empiricism can be turned into something real and concrete.

I should like to discuss four aspects of the distant horizon, beyond which I think we should attempt to look. Each of these has been in the forefront of the minds of a good many people in the personnel business. Perhaps, however, I can give them, if not a new twist, at least a synthesis which is hard to manufacture except from the vantage point of the central personnel agency.

### The Individual Worker

My first bit of the horizon has to do with recognition of the individual worker. I have been very much encouraged the past 18 months to discover how wide a realization there is that the federal government accomplishes things as much through people and their efforts as through the application of money to the language and intent of laws. A personnel equation is usually the leavening ingredient in every aspect of federal programs. It produces good or bad loaves to the extent that it is skillfully used.

I think, therefore, that the civil service should look ahead to a whole variety of things which will bring about a better and a more productive climate for recognition of the individual and for the more effective utilization of the characteristic drive, imagination, and self-reliance which still mark most Americans.

As we have dared to be free, so we have dared to dream. As we have dared to dream, so we have dared to let others laugh at those dreams while we have turned ourselves to making them reality. And we have judged those realities in the best Biblical sense—not only against the dreams of young men, but against the visions of old

men. There is an excitement about this realization which I hope you will share with me for three specific thoughts.

**Recruitment.** First, we must put into our thinking a definite plan for the recruitment into the federal service each year of thousands of the very ablest young men and women of each high school and college graduating class. We must recruit them not for jobs but for careers, and we must plan their careers in such a way that their own capacity for growth, their own aspirations, and their own dreams are taken into account. I am suggesting that we now adopt wide-spread career planning for civil servants—planning which progresses from the day that the oath of office is first taken to the day some 30 or more years later when responsibilities are passed on to another generation.

**Employer-Employee Relations.** Second, there must go with this career planning better use of what, in industry, is known as the “employer-employee relations program,” ranging all the way across a broad spectrum from system of awards and incentives, disciplinary actions, and appeals, to more effective evaluation of individual performance, and to recognition and utilization of employee organizations as an effective channel of communication between employer and employee.

**Pay Systems.** Third, we must keep constantly in the forefront of our minds that the day of static pay systems is a thing of the past. This theme alone deserves a great deal more development than space permits. In essence, the Eisenhower administration has adopted the sound policy of advocating that there be internal consistency within its pay systems and a degree of relationship and comparability between government pay and pay received in American business and industry. If this policy is to be effective, discretion for pay administration must be vested in the Executive, not left wholly in the hands of the Congress.

### Training

The second look ahead to the horizon concerns training. Up to the present time we have tended to think of training pri-

## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

marily in terms of what benefit accrues to the individual in relation to a specific job. I believe that we are rapidly moving toward a requirement that we also judge training from the point of view of how it strengthens our federal personnel system.

Ideally, our training system should interlock at all of its points; it should be continuous; and it should culminate in a formal period of study in a civilian staff college by those relatively few top career people who are to have major administrative and staff responsibilities. Neither methodology nor content are matters of concern at the moment beyond suggesting that the training system involves four separate and distinct kinds of devices:

1. those concerned with personal development undertaken by the individual as a matter of his own interest and primarily for his personal benefit
2. the necessary in-service training within the agency concerned in large part with program, agency policy, and procedures, or the development of higher degrees of skills needed to make the agency's work more effective
3. academic training conducted primarily in institutions which are non-federal, but which are not necessarily of collegiate level
4. the in-service, interdepartmental training which is so necessary if we are to capitalize upon the skills and experience of our senior career people.

This final aspect of government training should find its highest expression in the civilian administrative staff college to which I have already referred.

### Total Work Force

The third vista on the far horizon about which I would express one or two random thoughts is concerned with the more effective use of the federal work force as a whole. I believe that eventually we are going to move in the direction of much freer interchange of personnel between agencies and within agencies; that we will some day have to seek and obtain authority to assign federal civilians to duties where they are most needed.

I believe, also, that it is time for us to start thinking about a much more effective way to protect the status of truly career people. It would, of course, be folly to argue that there will be no need for reductions in force, and at times substantial layoffs of experienced people. But I am absolutely certain that we have not yet begun to develop a system which would give real career protection against the vagaries of individual changes from year to year in appropriation levels, or sudden program shifts caused by the necessity of closing some particular installation.

Career status should not be acquired too soon or too easily. Once acquired, however, it is nothing short of tragic to have it all swept into the discard, say, after 20 years of service, because of a temporary reduction in force.

Perhaps for some of our jobs we are going to have to approach the rank-in-person concept, which protects not only the individual but protects, for the government, the skills which he has acquired. It may be necessary to do this by the device of authorizing the assignment of such persons to a pool, pending their reassignment elsewhere when, for reasons beyond their control, they are caught in work curtailments or in changing programs.

There is little that is equitable—and by the same token there is little that is not correctible—in a system where a man suddenly finds himself dismissed after many years of faithful and effective service, or, equally suddenly, finds it necessary to be downgraded, sometimes as much as four or five grades.

### The Personnel Agencies

Finally, I think we must look over the horizon to even more decentralization of our personnel system. I believe, however, that this can be done with full retention of merit-system principles, if we will work hard at the job of providing effective inspection and evaluation of agency personnel management programs. I think that there will be more, rather than less, responsibility placed in the agencies for recruiting, for examining, and for promoting federal workers.

In time, we will come to a realization that there are substantial advantages, and no threat to the merit system, to permitting a certain number of lateral entries into middle and higher grade jobs requiring a full degree of individual skill, rather than more general training. The people specifically recruited for those jobs may not have to meet the kind of wide-open competition which now prevails for most classes of jobs in which there are numerous similar or identical positions.

### Something To Work For

These have been random thoughts of one Chairman of the Civil Service Commission who is trying to gauge what he thinks the civil service of the future may look like. Its characteristics will be flexibility, competence, greater similarity to the pattern of American business and industry than now prevails, and less isolation and insulation than now exists. Then, and only then, will the civil service be what I think it is rapidly approaching—a true cross-section of America.

### Time and the Leader . . .

Leadership is a time-bending operation. Each moment is really a compound of past, present, and future. It is not difficult to find individuals who live successfully in *either* past, present, or future, and such individuals can often be of value. But the truly successful leader must somehow contrive to live constantly in all dimensions of time. He is extracting policy for the future from each decision of the present even as each decision is made in light of policy. The only time dimension in which the leader will *not* live is the pluperfect subjunctive where, as James Thurber once wrote, all is serene and uncrowded except by old regrets.—From "Leadership in a Democratic Society" by Robert A. Nisbet, in *Planning 1959*.



## Personnel Panorama—1960

### IV. U. S. Federal Personnel Management

O. Glenn Stahl

*Highlights include a group health program, stepped-up executive development, and preparing for a transition of political leadership.*

OF OVERRIDING significance among the 1960 developments on the personnel front in Washington was the installation of the largest health insurance program in the world. Based on the law enacted in September, 1959, the details of the program were hammered out in order to put it into operation on July 1, 1960.

The act offered federal employees, for the first time, a health-benefits system in which the government, as employer, contributes a substantial share of the cost. Approximately 1,800,000 employees and their families are enrolled in one of the 38 separate health-benefits plans offered under the program.

#### Launching the Government Health Program

The task of setting the standards for and approving the insurance carriers who were to participate in the new program, determining the exact benefits to be offered, and setting up the procedures needed to put it fully into operation fell to the Civil Service Commission. It was accomplished within the nine-month period between enactment and the effective date.

The commission's new Bureau of Retirement and Insurance, fortified by a statutory advisory committee, agency consultative groups, and experts from the insurance industry—

1. Approved 36 employee organization and comprehensive plans out of 113 applications
2. Identified 13 insurance companies, one a prime carrier, as eligible to underwrite the government-wide indemnity plan

3. Negotiated contracts with all approved carriers for a number of different types of coverage
4. Prepared and distributed 15 million brochures describing each of the alternative benefit plans available to government employees, which varied from location to location
5. Undertook a world-wide educational program to explain the health benefits to employees, including the training of 25,000 agency representatives as counselors to employees
6. Devised procedures and distributed standard forms and instructions to over 2 million federal employees
7. Kept interested publics informed of these implementation activities throughout these various processes.

As a result, more than 4 million persons—employees and dependents—are covered under the government health program at a cost of about \$300 million a year, of which the government contributes about 38 per cent and the employees pay the remainder through payroll deduction.

#### Career Development Program

Another important development during 1960 was the outgrowth of a presidential memorandum to the heads of all federal agencies. This memorandum asked the agency heads to give personal leadership within their respective organizations to meet the needs for high-level career executive personnel. It further asked the Special Assistant to the President for Personnel Management and the Civil Service Commission to oversee the establishment of sound

selection and development programs affecting key career managerial and professional positions.

The commission established an Office of Career Development at a top level to give priority and emphasis to this program and to other centralized training activities sponsored by the commission.

### Legislative Developments

Major legislation included the following:

1. Pay increases, averaging over 7½ per cent, were enacted by Congress for the over 1½ million white-collar employees under the Classification Act and the Postal Pay Act.
2. A new law authorizing the Department of Defense to grant return job rights to career and career-conditional employees assigned to posts of duty outside the United States.
3. New and permanent authority was provided for payment of travel and moving expenses of new appointees in shortage-category occupations.
4. Certain health benefits were made available by a new law to certain retired federal employees.
5. Injury compensation benefits were made more realistic through statutory amendments.
6. Employment allowances and differentials applying to all federal employees overseas were extended and improved by new legislation.

### Preparing for the Transition of Government

Another special activity of interest that commanded considerable attention during 1960 was in conjunction with preparation for the transition of government to a new administration in January, 1961. In the personnel field, the Civil Service Commission, through its chairman, Roger W. Jones, took particular leadership in sparking an appreciation and consciousness among key personnel throughout the executive establishment of the need to think through and plan for the adjustments that might be necessary upon the occasion of a new president's assuming office.

Starting with a conference of personnel directors held at Williamsburg, Virginia, in

January, the commission has been emphasizing this special area of interest throughout the year. A series of speeches and professional articles have been widely circulated. Attention was given to adjustments necessary not only to make certain that the concept of the career service is preserved, but also to make sure that key career personnel understand their responsibility for responsiveness to new political leadership and that both outgoing and incoming non-career executives understand clearly both their rights and their obligations.

A top-quality publication of an unprecedented character, "The Federal Career Service—At Your Service," designed for new incoming presidential appointees and other non-career executives will, we anticipate, become a "best seller." Never before has so much been done to alert all interested parties to their respective responsibilities in making the adjustments that are necessary during this critical period.

### Other Developments

Other events of special interest during the year included the following:

1. Inauguration of a new personnel publication, *The Civil Service Journal*. It is being issued quarterly and makes available to all of the commission's publics, official and professional information which often in the past reached only limited groups.
2. Continuous and renewed emphasis on recruiting in many fields, with special attention still being given to the attraction of college graduates to the federal service. Approximately 6,500 college caliber persons were appointed to the government service through the Federal Service Entrance Examination during 1960.
3. Through special institutes for operating managers, special publications, and new approaches to the content and dissemination of classification standards, the commission stepped up its drive to develop increased understanding and broader responsibility for intelligent application of the principles of job classification.

Other interesting and significant develop-

## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

ments in the personnel field, too numerous to include here, may be reviewed by reference to the Civil Service Commission's Annual Report for fiscal year ending June 30, 1960.

Without minimizing the gravity of the

serious problems that still remain before us—pay policy, executive development and replacement, a more orderly appeals system, the prestige value of federal employment—we can look upon the year 1960 as one of substantial progress.

### Why Not? . . .

This whole social situation that we call an interview is quite inadequately explored. . . . [A]n interview by an employing officer who says, in effect, "I like him, so you work with him," is quite ineffective. The interview needs to be by the people with whom the individual is to work. . . . The people who must work with any particular employee are not only those above him, but the subordinates as well, and I would like to suggest that the interview procedure that is likely to be most telling . . . would be the procedure whereby a candidate for a job was interviewed both by his superior . . . and by his immediate subordinates for that job.

. . . If I must work with a man immediately above me, I am as concerned that he should be capable, and at the same time that he should be workable with, as is his superior. . . . If the group is to work effectively, then it seems to me that the subordinate's views and judgment may be every bit as crucial as the judgment of the superior and I can see no reason why we should be tied to cultural and habitual patterns in operating this way. —C. A. Gibb, Professor of Psychology, Canberra University College. From *Public Administration*, March, 1959.

# Personnel Panorama—1960

## V. State and Local Developments

Keith Ocheltree

*Growth in number of merit systems, heavy emphasis on training, and relations with organized employees dominate 1960 scene.*

THE YEAR 1960 brought considerable progress along a number of important fronts. Several new state-wide merit systems came into being; personnel administrators tried new methods of recruitment and selection in their constant effort to locate competent people; training continued to receive heavy emphasis; and relationships with organized employee groups occupied an increasing proportion of the personnel administrator's time.

### Merit Systems Continue on the Rise

The ranks of civil service states were augmented during 1960 by the addition of Alaska, Oklahoma, and Kentucky. In the new state of Alaska, the Division of Personnel will be located within the Department of Administration, and the Director of Personnel will report to the Commissioner of Administration. The Kentucky merit system law formalizes the merit system established by executive order during the previous administration. Complete implementation of the new Oklahoma Civil Service Act was being delayed by lawsuits challenging its constitutionality as it applies to the employees of constitutional officers. These additions bring the total number of "general coverage" state merit systems to 27.

The merit principle was also making headway at the local level. Under provisions of a law passed in 1959, Puerto Rico municipalities must establish merit systems if their employees are to participate in the Commonwealth Employee Retirement System. A new law in Oregon requires that all cities employing four or more paid firefighters must establish a civil service system to cover them. In New Jersey, twelve out

of sixteen municipalities voted to come under the provisions of the state civil service act late in 1959.

### Agency Reorganizations

A number of state personnel agencies either underwent reorganization or were considering reorganization during the course of the year. In the state of New York, the legislature transferred to the State Civil Service Commission the functions of several independent bodies, including the State Merit Award Board, State Classification and Compensation Appeals Board, the State Commission on Pensions, and the Temporary Health Insurance Board. The Hawaii Civil Service Commission was relieved of its administrative functions and now serves as an appeals board. The former Department of Civil Service has been renamed the Department of Personnel Services. The personnel director is appointed by the governor and confirmed by the senate.

In Vermont, a newly-created Department of Administration includes personnel as one of its divisions. The personnel director is appointed by the governor and confirmed by the senate. The new organization provides for three ex-officio, non-voting members of the personnel board: the personnel director, the president of the state employees' association, and a state department head. A separate board of personnel appeals is provided.

The Merit System Council, which formerly served the Texas Department of Health, merged with that serving the State Employment Commission and the Department of Public Welfare. This change creates a single merit system agency cover-

## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

ing U.S. grant-in-aid programs in Texas.

After a two-year study, a Civil Service Advisory Committee established by the governor of Rhode Island recommended that the personnel division remain a part of the Department of Administration. The report also recommended the creation of a five-member advisory council to represent the public interest and perform some functions of the former civil service commission.

Colorado voters defeated a constitutional amendment governing civil service at the November general elections. A previous attempt had been defeated in 1958. Washington voters approved an initiative measure creating a state-wide personnel system. The law provides separate merit systems for each of the state institutions of higher learning and for the State Highway and Police Departments.

### Miscellany

Anniversaries were also in the news. The Maryland State Personnel Agency celebrated its 40th anniversary, and the Michigan State Civil Service Commission, its 20th. Also, the Milwaukee Fire and Police Commission observed its 75th anniversary. This commission was the first civil service agency in Wisconsin. It is the oldest fire and police commission in the United States and the fifth oldest civil service body in the country.

At least three states recognize the important contributions of public employees by setting aside weeks in their honor. Pennsylvania observed "Civil Service Week" and California, "California Public Employees' Week." Maryland's "State Merit System Employees' Week" was observed in conjunction with the celebration of the 40th anniversary of the Merit System Law.

One of the most noteworthy developments during the year was the increasing attention given to employee conduct on the job and in the community, through the promulgation of codes of ethics. Such codes were established or under study in the cities of New York, Cleveland, Honolulu, Philadelphia, Minneapolis, and Peoria, and in the states of Minnesota and New Jersey.

### Developments in Recruitment and Selection

Public personnel agencies continued to

seek better ways to recruit and select competent employees. Efforts to eliminate unrealistic barriers to recruitment included the elimination of examination fees by the state of New York, the elimination of age requirements for all positions except state police in Maryland, and the elimination of most maximum age requirements for positions in the city of Milwaukee.

A number of interesting new developments in the field of recruitment and selection also appeared during the course of the year. The state of New York established a promotional examination for junior administrative positions open to clerical employees without a college degree. All California counties, except Los Angeles and San Francisco, have cooperated in the development of a common examination program for beginning level social workers. Applicants may become eligible for these positions in any county by taking a single written examination.

San Diego, California, now permits city employees to serve as members of civil service interview boards for employment or promotion. Employees cannot be the sole or majority members of the boards, nor can any employee be in the same department as the promotional candidate. General acceptance of the program has been good, both among employee organizations and candidates for promotion.

In the field of police selection, Cedarville Township, New Jersey, has joined the list of jurisdictions using psychiatric tests for potential police officers. Stockton, California, reported that it has used the polygraph in personnel selection for the past two years. City officials are reported to feel that it not only is effective, but will, in the long run, be economical.

The Milwaukee City Service Commission has adopted a new policy intended to improve the city's position in the recruitment and retention of clerical and stenographic workers. Under the new policy, positions presently classified as first level are reclassified to the second level. Recruitment for these positions, however, will be at the first level, with the incumbents to be promoted to the higher level after successful completion of an appropriate examination.

It is hoped that the loss of the investment in training brought about by the tendency of these employees to transfer to higher-paying jobs in other departments or to private industry will be avoided by this policy. The program is voluntary for city departments and it now includes the great majority of first-level positions.

### Training Programs

In addition to experimenting with new methods of recruiting and selecting competent employees, public personnel agencies also continue to emphasize training in order to upgrade the skills of those already on the payroll. One of the areas receiving increasing attention is formal academic training to supplement traditional in-service training programs.

**Philadelphia Training Institute.** The Philadelphia Personnel Department has set up plans to establish an agency to be known as the Philadelphia Training Institute, which will be operated under the jurisdiction of a board composed of representatives of the city, the University of Pennsylvania, and other educational and training institutions. The Institute will provide specialized training specifically for city employees. The city will provide the physical facilities, but employees will take the training on their own time and at their own expense.

**Academic Training Programs.** Other developments in the field of formal academic training included: the establishment of tuition reimbursement programs by a number of agencies; the establishment of University of California extension courses for city employees by the City of Oakland, California; the payment of tuition and expenses for Iowa City employees who attend courses at the University of Iowa during working time; the course on municipal supervisory relations conducted for a number of "Bay Area" cities by the College of San Mateo; and the establishment of a degree curriculum for state employees at Springfield, Illinois, by the University of Illinois.

**Intern Programs.** An internship program in public administration has been developed in Massachusetts under a grant from the

Carnegie Corporation. Five senior college interns will work in the office of the Commissioner of Administration and will participate in seminars and other academic work, in addition to gaining practical experience.

**Executive Development.** The continuing shortage of competent executives led to increasing interest in executive development. The states of Illinois, New Jersey, and New York, the counties of Los Angeles, San Mateo, and Ventura in California, and the city of Portland, Maine, were among the jurisdictions conducting executive development programs during the year.

**Police Training.** Police training continued to grow in prominence. Seattle, Washington, has established a police cadet program, and the police departments of the cities of Delta and Montrose in Colorado have established a joint training program for law enforcement officers in their own and nearby cities.

### Employee-Labor Relations

There were a number of interesting developments in the field of public service labor relations. The City Council of Cincinnati authorized the City Manager to enter into an agreement recognizing the American Federation of State, County, and Municipal Employees as the exclusive bargaining agent for city employees where the union has a majority in a classification or agency. This agreement formalizes practices which had been followed informally for a number of years.

Several new laws regulating the relationships between governments and their organized employees also came into being. A new Florida law prohibits state, county, and municipal employees from striking or asserting the right to strike, and from belonging to organizations which assert that right. Recent California legislation permits firefighters to form or assist labor organizations in presenting grievances and to conduct other activities. However, such organizations may not strike or recognize a picket line while in the performance of their duties. The Iowa state legislature passed a law providing for arbitration between cities and associations of fire de-



## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

partment employees. The decisions, however, are advisory only. A new North Carolina law forbids policemen and firemen from belonging to labor unions.

There were new developments in other aspects of employee relations also. San Diego, California, established a personnel advisory council, whose membership consists of representatives of major city departments and employee groups. The plan also calls for improvement committees at various levels within the city's operating departments, which will discuss working conditions, work simplification ideas, deal with employee grievances, and review disciplinary actions. San Diego also worked out and found acceptance for a new service-rating procedure through consultations with the individuals and groups that would be most concerned. Although working out the new procedures in this way required a year, the method was felt to insure greater support and cooperation from both management and employees.

### Tapping Unusual Skills

With skills in constantly short supply, personnel agencies have begun to discover the importance of uncovering and utilizing the unused skills of employees. When it became imperative to provide interpreters for patrons who cannot speak English, Wayne County, Michigan, developed a procedure to locate people who can speak foreign languages. The commission found close to 200 county employees who collectively could speak 36 different foreign languages, including a number of rare ones. The city of Los Angeles has also developed a tabulating card form surveying language and other unusual skills not normally called for on the job.

### Retirement Systems Growing

Retirement systems continue to grow in importance as one of the leading elements of a well-rounded personnel program. According to a recent survey, the number of persons covered by state and local govern-

ment retirement systems has increased more than four times since 1935. Reserves and assets have grown from under \$2 billion in 1942 to nearly \$16 billion in 1958. The survey also reported that the investment programs of these systems have changed. For instance, in 1942, more than 87 per cent of securities holdings were in government securities, with only 7 per cent in other kinds of securities. By 1958, government securities represented only 61 per cent of investments, with 37 per cent including bonds, stocks, mortgages, member loans, and other investments.

The Pennsylvania legislature voted to activate the Municipal Employees Retirement Act, which had originally been enacted in 1943 but was never operative. The system will be coordinated with social security, and existing local retirement systems can be transferred to the state system by an affirmative vote of three-fourths of the membership.

The city of St. Louis also established a retirement plan for its employees. This move was made possible through the passage of enabling legislation by the 1959 Missouri legislature.

The town of Los Gatos, California, has adopted a fixed annuity, plus a share investment plan for the employees' retirement system. The fixed annuity portion, which is supplemented by social security, is handled by an insurance company. The employees' monthly contribution of 4 per cent is invested in shares of an investment company and dividend payments are automatically reinvested.

### What To Expect in 1961

Although the year 1960 brought many interesting developments, the foregoing are among the more important ones. Further progress in 1961 can be expected in the continued extension of the merit principle to jurisdictions and employees not now covered, in recruitment, in employee development, and in relationships with organized employee groups.

# Use and Abuse of Intelligence Tests

John C. Flanagan

*"General intelligence" is not as useful a concept in personnel selection as scores on tests of job-related mental abilities.*

THE INTELLIGENCE test has been the backbone of many civil service testing programs for the past fifty years. I wish to establish the point that intelligence tests as such have no place today in modern civil service testing programs. By this I do not mean that these types of items should not be used. Rather, I am suggesting that the functions of these items be measured in terms of more specifically directed types of aptitude-test items.

There has been a lag between research findings and examining practices in many centers. Research workers no longer find general intelligence a useful concept. They have substituted specific aptitudes for this general measure. But, in practice, many programs continue to lump together various aptitude measures into an intelligence test and weight this as a unit rather than in terms of the relevance of each of the components to the job for which the examination has been set.

## Intelligence Tests in the Schools

Let us review the development of tests of general intelligence. Fifty years ago the efforts of Binet, Stern, and Terman established that, through a series of simple test exercises, the mental age of a child could be determined. A remarkable characteristic of this mental age was that for children up to the age of approximately 16, the ratio of the mental age to the chronological age tended to remain constant throughout the period of the child's development.

Although the I.Q. has been criticized over the years, it has become a very valu-

able tool in measuring the intelligence of children in our schools. The relative stability of I.Q.'s derived from intelligence tests over the school years has created the impression that intelligence tests measure innate, inherited ability as contrasted with other types of tests. Experts have shown through many types of studies that intelligence tests, like other tests, are greatly affected by the quality of domestic, cultural, and educational experiences.

The typical intelligence-test items have included vocabulary, arithmetic reasoning, analogies, series types of items, and block counting. In practice, there has been a tendency for the intelligence tests used in the schools to become indistinguishable from the achievement tests. The principal use of intelligence tests was to predict achievement, and it was found that the best predictor of score on an educational achievement test was an earlier score on a rather similar type of educational achievement test.

## Need for Measure of Potential

Recently there has been a demand in some school systems for a type of intelligence measure which does not require such school-learned skills as reading and arithmetic. This type of test should be valuable in the identification of students who have greater potential ability than is shown by their school achievement.

If a measure of the individual's potential ability to learn, independent of his cultural background and former training, is needed, item types should be selected which emphasize (1) practical out-of-school learning, (2) reasoning in simple types of situations not requiring knowledge of arithmetic or science, and (3) stress on the application of well known principles in new situations. Al-

**Editor's Note:** This paper was presented by the author at the Public Personnel Association's 1960 International Conference on Public Personnel Administration, New York City, October 23-27, 1960.



## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

though such items may tend to reduce somewhat the influence of variations in the quality of domestic, cultural, and educational experiences on the individual's scores on intelligence tests, such scores will still be strongly influenced by these types of factors.

### Effects of Environment on Tests

There is evidence that in primitive societies, where babies are not weaned until some time in their second year, this dependence and close relationship with the mother provide a very rich environmental experience during the first year or two of life. This is reflected in the performance of these children on tests of infant development.

However, in the modern American home, the variety of toys, clothing, furniture, household utensils, and, in recent years, the added possibilities brought into many homes by television provide opportunities for learning between the ages of two and six years which are quite unmatched by the typical primitive or rural home environment. The quality of instruction in our schools today and the proportion of our population staying in school to take advantage of these opportunities have also had a tremendous effect on the ability of young adults to answer items correctly on the standard group tests of intelligence.

A dramatic example of this change in "intelligence" level was obtained during World War II by administering the famous Army Alpha Test of World War I to representative samples of eighteen-year-olds inducted into the military service. This group of World War II inductees achieved an average score which placed the group at the eighty-third percentile in terms of the scores made approximately twenty-five years earlier by World War I inductees.

What factors are responsible for the superior performance of the World War II inductees in comparison to the inductees of World War I? It appears that several factors including the quality of test administration and the familiarity with test items of these types as well as the average number of years of schooling for the World War II group influenced these results.

Recent experience in testing groups from other cultures illustrates that the practiced confidence with which the typical young American approaches a highly speeded test has no counterpart in the youth of other societies even though in some of these groups there is approximately equal ability to handle the most difficult types of problems. Since American culture and school experiences are not sufficiently uniform to have influenced all young people to the same extent with respect to this factor, the use of speeded tests of intelligence seems undesirable.

### Practice and Experience Lift Test Performance

It has been shown in recent studies that all tests are influenced by practice and experience. When a group of Air Force pilots was retested twelve years after they had taken the tests in the service, it was found that on certain types of tasks which the men continued to employ in their work—for instance, simple arithmetic and mathematical reasoning—their level of performance improved.

A dramatic example of how specific attention to one type of activity can influence some of the types of items used in intelligence tests was provided by a girl whose performance on most types of intellectual items was high average. However, on vocabulary tests, especially those of the usual literary variety, her score was at the highest one-tenth of one per-cent level. Questioning revealed that this girl spent her spare time writing poetry and, in this connection, worked many hours with the dictionary.

It does not seem reasonable to regard this score as evidence of high intelligence. It seems more appropriate to regard it as evidence of an unusually high level of achievement attained through special study. Many other examples have been cited showing that various types of tests were not good measures of general intellectual ability for specific individuals because of special practice or specific deficiencies in their cultural or educational activities.

### Intelligence Tests Not Enough

Another serious deficiency of intelligence

tests is that they ordinarily measure only one or two of the aptitudes important for various types of civil service positions. As indicated above, the more common type of intelligence-test items measure verbal factors primarily. A majority of intelligence tests also include a measure of reasoning or quantitative ability. These have been shown to be the most important factors in predicting general educational success. They are far from adequate, however, as predictors of success in most practical jobs.

A clear demonstration of the superiority of tests measuring aptitude for the specific elements in a job was provided during World War II in the use of the Aircrew Aptitude Classification Tests. The group of ten tests measuring the important job elements in the airplane pilot's job was found to provide a far superior predictor of success in pilot training (.63) to that yielded by intelligence scores of the type made on the Army General Classification Tests (.31).

Other studies have shown that specific patterns of aptitudes can be associated with most skilled, supervisory, technical, and professional jobs. Although much additional research remains to be done to identify these patterns with precision, there seems no justification for using traditional types of intelligence tests to select individuals for civil service jobs. Therefore, if measures of aptitude are needed to supplement tests of information and relevant job skills, the appropriate pattern of aptitude tests should be substituted for the commonly used intelligence tests which are usually limited to verbal and reasoning measures of scholastic aptitude.

### Should We Rock the Boat?

Before discussing in detail the proposed substitutes for intelligence tests, a brief summary of findings regarding the use of intelligence tests is appropriate.

First, there is no question but that persons in professional groups score much higher on intelligence tests than do other groups. The next highest scores are obtained by executives in business, industry, and government. These groups are followed by technicians and office workers; then, skilled and semi-skilled workers; and below these are the

scores of the unskilled laborers and farm workers. In unselected groups there is a high correlation between highest educational level reached and intelligence-test score.

A second general finding is that, in a wide variety of jobs from executives to clerks in offices, intelligence-test scores predict job success to a significant, though moderate, degree. There are few school children who do not take some type of intelligence test every three or four years. Most business and industrial organizations as well as the military services require an intelligence test of all applicants.

In the face of this wide-spread acceptance and use of intelligence tests, what substitutes are proposed to replace these tests in various civil service examining programs?

### Relate the Test to the Job

It is specifically proposed that careful job analyses be conducted before each civil service examination is prepared. Such analyses should be translated into the required training, abilities, aptitudes, and other personal characteristics essential to superior performance in each job. Instead of stating the requirements in terms of generalities, such as "good intellectual ability" or "broad knowledge of the field," specific items should be included, such as "ability to write a clear and precise report" or "the ability to comprehend technical materials in a specific field."

**Office Clerk.** By applying job-analysis procedures to the position of office clerk, for example, it can be expected that a number of specific skills—namely, checking, filing, sorting, maintaining records, and obtaining information from tables—will be found to be important requirements for effective performance on the job. It seems much more appropriate to examine for these job requirements directly by using tests that sample tasks as similar to those needed on the job as possible.

There are prototype tests available for most of these tasks, such as clerical checking, sorting, filing, and table reading. The inclusion of a measure in the form of a reading test which would sample ability to comprehend and follow the simple type of

## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

directions usually used for tasks in a position of this type would be desirable here. It would also seem appropriate to include some items requiring the use of a limited amount of judgment and ability to reason in making choices or classifying materials.

On the other hand, it would seem quite inappropriate to give a girl extra credit on literary vocabulary or ability to handle difficult arithmetic problems in a test selecting workers for the position of office clerk, where the job analysis did not indicate a need for either the ability to solve difficult arithmetic problems or knowledge of esoteric literary terms.

**Auto Mechanic.** In examining for the position of auto mechanic, if the job analysis suggests that the important factors making for job success are "understanding of mechanical relations," "ability to visualize relationships of moving parts," "ability to read scales," "knowledge of tool functions," and "the ability to understand technical descriptions and diagrams of mechanical and electrical devices," the civil service examination might include tests such as the following: mechanical principles, visualization in three dimensions, scale reading, and information about tools and other types of mechanical procedures. The tests might also include a measure of the ability to interpret diagrams and descriptions of mechanical devices.

Here again, it hardly seems that literary vocabulary or difficult arithmetic problems are appropriate types of items for selecting persons to work as auto mechanics. Similarly, other types of intelligence-test items such as number series, figure analogies, or verbal relations would seem inappropriate for selecting effective workers for these positions.

**Civil Service Examiner.** Although the above suggestions may sound reasonable to some, they may raise a question as to whether such an analysis would also hold for a job such as, for example, civil service examiner. Let us suppose that an analysis of this position indicates such requirements as: "conducts job analyses, develops specifications for examinations, constructs test items, edits test items, administers tests, carries

out statistical analyses of the results, and writes reports interpreting results."

The examination for this position might well include information regarding the candidate's knowledge of job-analysis procedures, appropriate specifications for examinations, rules for writing test items, an examination on the editing of test items, appropriate procedures used in administering tests (including items requiring the candidate to show judgment regarding appropriate actions to take in emergency situations), knowledge of statistical theory and ability to solve appropriate types of problems in statistics, test items measuring the candidate's ability to organize and present materials effectively, and items measuring the ability to interpret data and draw correct inferences.

### "It Ain't Necessarily So"

The argument usually advanced for using a test of general intelligence in such examinations as these relates to the permanence of the ranking of candidates in terms of their performance on the measures set.

A common example is the clerk on the local staff who is familiar with office procedures, nomenclature, and preferences, but lacks training in fundamentals and ability to learn. Such a person, with little depth of understanding but a good deal of superficial familiarity with the procedures and terminology, would obtain a high score only if the examination were set at a very superficial level. The kinds of test exercises listed above would reveal his lack of qualifications even more clearly than a general intelligence test.

Another example sometimes advanced for using a test of general intelligence is that a candidate from a distant university, for instance, having high ability to learn in addition to sound training in fundamentals, might not do well on a locally constructed examination. Again, this would be the case only if the local examination required great familiarity with local terms, routines, and biases. Examination materials of the type mentioned above, if properly constructed, should reveal the true level of ability of a strong candidate even better than a test of general intelligence.

### Before and After

The inefficiency of selection procedures which rely heavily on tests of general intelligence is not serious when qualified applicants are plentiful. The importance of selecting for each job on the basis of the specific aptitudes required by this job is crucial when there is competition for highly qualified personnel in many specialties.

Consider the first two examples mentioned earlier—the office clerk and auto mechanic. Suppose that in examining for these positions we use the same test of general intelligence and have only 100 applicants available to fill the two jobs. The passing mark on the test is set at 70 for office clerk, and 25 people are qualified and placed on the eligible list. If the passing mark is also set at 70 for auto mechanic, the same 25 people will also be placed on that list of eligibles.

Now, suppose that instead of this test of general intelligence, tests such as those recommended were used. The two eligible lists would be quite different. The correlation between the scores for these two lists would probably not exceed .50 or .60. Using these specific aptitude patterns for the two jobs would result in the list of 25 persons for office clerk containing only 12 of the 25 persons on the list for auto mechanic. Therefore, 13 persons on the list for mechanic would still be available on the eligible list after we placed all 25 office clerks.

Or, if it was decided to divide them equally, 19 eligibles could be placed as office clerks and 19 as auto mechanics without reducing the standards in any way. Actually they would, in fact, be somewhat more effective in performance on the job because they were selected on the important requirements for these jobs.

Even if the correlation between the scores on the two lists were as high as .90, the use of these two different composite aptitude scores for office clerk and auto mechanic, instead of using a general intelligence-test score for both jobs, would produce six more

eligibles meeting the qualification levels specified than would be available if the intelligence-test scores were used for both groups.

### Summary

It is proposed that usual types of intelligence-test items be replaced in all specific examinations by content directed at those aptitudes and abilities required for effective performance in each job. It is believed that this procedure will both focus attention on those aspects of the factors most relevant to the job and also contribute to weighting these factors more nearly in accord with their importance for predicting performance.

The goal of civil service selection procedures is to obtain the best personnel available for each job. Using a variety of aptitude tests tailored to the specific job needs, rather than using the same general intelligence tests for many jobs, will improve the overall on-the-job effectiveness of a basic group of candidates by taking advantage of each individual's specific pattern of aptitudes.

Only through full use of differential patterns of specific aptitudes can we continue to meet the demands for technical specialists of all types with the same high standards which now prevail. The demands of the future place a greater responsibility on public personnel experts to improve the quality of the new employees selected through efficient use of specific aptitude and ability patterns.

It is worthy of note that there are today several outstanding public personnel programs and practitioners using the differential approach to aptitude testing outlined in this short paper. One purpose of this paper, however, is to focus attention on the lag that still exists in the field as a whole in applying these techniques. Overcoming this lag is an important step in the direction of improving the total effectiveness of public personnel selection procedures.

# The Public Service in Iran

Richard W. Gable

*Adapting Western-style personnel practices to a government with a centuries-old heritage of Persian tradition.*

IRAN is predominantly an agricultural country. Over 70 per cent of the people derive their living from agriculture—far more than can be supported under the country's existing agricultural methods. The non-agricultural labor force is estimated to number about 1,065,000, according to a J. L. Jacobs and Company survey.

Approximately 70 per cent of the non-agricultural labor force is employed by smaller businesses. These businesses are run on a patriarchal basis and are characterized by low wages, long working hours, unpaid overtime, and a minimum of social benefits. Larger enterprises are somewhat more enlightened in their treatment of employees. Those employers who pay higher wages also generally provide better fringe benefits. The government is by far the largest single employer of non-agricultural labor.

## Supply and Demand in the Labor Market

The supply of available unskilled labor greatly exceeds the demand, which accounts in part for the very low rates of pay. There are few industrial enterprises of any size in any single area; hence, the employable manpower can never be absorbed. The potential labor force is expanded still more by including women and children who must work, if possible, to supplement the meager income of the men, thereby further increasing the supply beyond demand. Women and children, as in many countries, work at much lower rates than men.

Skilled labor of any real ability is virtually non-existent. Such skilled labor as is available receives wages which bear a direct relation to the level of skill. The educated elite have almost no career opportunities other than in the public service, therefore civil service jobs are much sought after.

One out of six persons in the non-agricultural labor force works for government and the ratio may run as high as one out of four or five in the urban labor force. The demand for public employment far exceeds the supply of jobs.

## Job Security, Traditions, and Legislation

Employment in Iran affords a kind of security in the midst of great insecurity. This security is an extreme effort to assure some kind of stability where the government and the economy can otherwise provide little. Both public and private employment provide job security and salary even when there is no work to perform.

A tradition of the country, strongly rooted in Islam's encouragement of almsgiving, is to give employment of some sort to as many persons as possible. Many employers take pride in employing more workers than are necessary because the religious, as well as the economic, code of the country requires that one should not allow his fellow men to go hungry. This attitude of employers creates an unusual stability in employment and employee turnover is found to be negligible.

The traditionally protective attitude toward workers has influenced the country's economic and welfare laws, such as the Labor, Social Insurance, and Hygiene Laws. These measures reflect many provisions in the model labor legislation compiled by the International Labor Office. However, these laws are not fully complied with, although they might be said to indicate the economic objectives of Iran.

## The Iranian Civil Service

The Iranian civil service includes all civilian employees of government, other



than elected officials and top-level appointive officials of the central and local governments. The civil service reaches as high as the undersecretaries of the ministries and also includes most officials of local government, who are commonly employed by the central government rather than by the various jurisdictions of local government.

No census has ever been taken of civil servants and the records are so inadequate that an accurate count of the total number is not possible. Dr. Arthur C. Millspaugh, when he was adviser to the Persian government, estimated that there were between 20,000 and 25,000 in 1927, and around 100,000 in 1943.<sup>1</sup> Today, the most frequently heard estimate is that between 150,000 to 175,000 persons are in the Iranian civil service.

Government jobs are greatly sought after, not only for economic reasons but also because, much like the continental European system after which the Iranian civil service is vaguely patterned, public service has carried considerable prestige.

### The Shifting Sands of Prestige

As the economy of Iran gradually expands, however, this tradition appears to be undergoing change. One personnel director, in a burst of typical Iranian cynicism, asserted that it is better to be a porter (one of the lowliest jobs in the Iranian economy) than to be a Director-General in a Ministry.

Many Iranians have expressed the belief that a materialist philosophy is coming to assume greater significance in a country which has been famous for its non-materialist approach to life. Today, merchants, landlords, and businessmen are gaining prestige and are replacing public servants in the hierarchy of Iranian society which rates first professors, medical doctors, lawyers, and then engineers. The reason for this transition is the improved material well-being which a person can obtain in the business world. Nevertheless, there are still many who look down on such prosaic and material pursuits.

Any society undergoes gradual change

<sup>1</sup> Arthur C. Millspaugh, *Americans in Persia* (Washington, D. C.: The Brookings Institution, 1946), p. 89.

and it will be a long time before the tradition of high prestige in the public service will be completely lost, if, indeed, it ever will be. Thus, the prestige of public employment continues to attract persons to government.

### Security No. 1 Motive

But even more important is the security afforded in the public service. Once a person has been appointed to a civil service position, he is virtually assured an income for life. In fact, under current law, a civil servant cannot be discharged. At most, he can be put on a permanent leave of absence in which case he draws one-half his salary if he is a low-grade employee and one-third his salary if he is in the higher grades.

It should be emphasized, however, that job security and partial salary retention does not mean security in specific positions. There is a consistent, rapid turnover in key positions which produces a marked degree of uncertainty for the average employee. A change of one person near the top of the hierarchy may be reflected in a change of personnel throughout the entire organization. This practice has retarded management progress and has contributed to government service.

### Total Personnel Picture in Need of Retouching

Personnel costs are the largest single item in the Iranian budget, but the government and the people often do not benefit from this expenditure. Employment of personnel is generally unrelated to management needs. Jobs are vaguely defined. Employees are classified according to rank. There are few qualification requirements or performance standards. Little attention is given to merit, either in initial hiring or in promotion. Few persons are trained after they have been employed.

The skills and talents of many persons with specialized advanced education are often wasted or misused. Influence, family connection, good fortune, and seniority guide personnel actions. Consequently, the initiative of the average employee is suppressed. Furthermore, minority cultural and

religious groups are sometimes discriminated against.

The *Majlis* (House of Representatives) has not faced up to the most pressing personnel problems and has never reviewed the total personnel system since its establishment. The basis for the Iranian personnel system is contained in the Civil Employment Law enacted in 1922,<sup>2</sup> in subsequent amendments, separate laws, cabinet decrees, and numerous regulations. The personnel laws, decrees, and regulations have never been codified. Only civil servants with long years of service in either accounting or personnel offices, and with good memories, appear to be able to recall the relevant provisions of the law, decrees, and regulations and to find proper references.

In place of a thorough revision of the system the legislature enacts laws dealing with special classes of employees from time to time. Piecemeal legislation results in an accumulation of inequities. In addition, a bewildering proliferation of red tape and a prodigious amount of legalism burden the administrative process. The American appointed as personnel director by Millspaugh during his second mission to Iran in 1943 found 15,000 personnel cases awaiting action.

### Low Pay, No Firing Breed Corruption

Pay is so low that corruption results or employees are forced to take part-time jobs to supplement their income. Sometimes the government job is regarded as the part-time job and a person may concentrate his principal effort on another job.

Because of the tendency to regard public employment as a means of charity to provide many persons a livelihood and because persons, once hired, cannot be fired, there is a great surplus of personnel. Some estimates place the number as high as 50 per cent of the total work force. A study conducted in the Ministry of Finance in 1954 revealed that there were 7,000 surplus employees on the rolls of that agency. Employment in the Railroad Bongah went up from 7,000 in 1943 to 32,000 in 1957 with-

<sup>2</sup> This law is thought to be a composite of various European laws of that time—German, Austrian, Russian—although no reliable information about its origin is now available.

out an appreciable increase in the amount of service provided by that agency.

Firing surplus employees would not reduce the budget appreciably because the persons who might be fired would be eligible to draw retirement benefits—and these are equivalent to the salaries currently being paid.

To counteract the effects of the law limiting dismissals, the government passed a law prohibiting hiring, except in certain categories such as school teachers, physicians, and government factory workers. The effect has been, on one hand, to magnify the burden of work for a decreasing number of employees in some agencies. In 1947 the University of Tehran had a staff of 2,500 with a personnel office of ten. By 1957 the university staff had increased to 5,500 but the personnel office had only three persons.

On the other hand, many jobs may go undone because some employees are totally unproductive. Since persons are promoted strictly on the basis of seniority, the public service consists of "many chiefs but few Indians." Higher grade employees will not demean themselves by performing the work of the lower grades. When a person vacates a position by being promoted, retiring, or dying, the position remains unstaffed. As a result there may be no one to do some jobs. One personnel director complained that his organization has so few typists that it is impossible to get the job done.

Furthermore, some people may report to work only to collect their salaries—and do nothing more. In some instances, it is not even necessary to put in an appearance to receive the money. There have been cases where civil servants have sold their year's salary at a discount of 15 to 20 per cent and then left the country, the purchaser continuing to collect the salary. In addition, overtime pay, per diem, hardship bonuses, and other special increments may be collected without a person meeting the requirements for these benefits.

### Organization for Personnel Administration

Although the government of Iran is highly centralized, its personnel system is not. There is no central personnel agency.

Personnel administration is handled by the personnel departments in each of the ministries and agencies.

The oldest of the personnel departments, such as those in the Ministry of Education and Ministry of Justice, date from 1906, the beginning of the constitutional period in Iranian history. Other personnel departments generally date from the establishment of the ministry in which they are located.

The personnel director is responsible to the Minister and Deputy Minister and, in some cases, to the Director-General for Administration. Because lines of authority and responsibility are often confused and unclear, the personnel director may report to one, two, or all three of these superiors at the same time. It is not uncommon for there to be direct contact and communication between the Minister and his personnel director.

The size of the personnel departments varies greatly, depending on the size of the ministry. The Ministry of Education, with over 60,000 employees who are responsible for all public education below the university level, reports a total of 126 personnel employees and 32 sub-grade employees, such as janitors and guards.

The Ministry of Justice has 69 employees in its personnel department; the Ministry of Post, Telephone, and Telegraph, 61; and the Ministry of Interior, 49. Among the smaller ministries and agencies, the Ministry of Roads has 29; the Tobacco Bongah, 19; the Ministry of Labor, 18; and the Ministry of Commerce, only 13.

All the ministries, except the Ministry of Education, feel that they are greatly understaffed. The Ministry of Education has adequate staff at present because authority to hire and perform other personnel functions has been delegated to the provinces. But if this authority were ever withdrawn, the present staff of the personnel department would not be adequate. The personnel director feels that this decentralization is improper and would like to see personnel authority centralized in Tehran.

### **The Personnel Director and His Department**

The personnel director is usually appointed by the Minister, and he can be re-

moved at any time at the discretion of the Minister. In some cases the actual selection may be left to the Director-General for Administration. Formal appointment may require a royal decree from the Shah. There are no special requirements or standards for choosing a personnel director. Generally, an effort is made to select persons with more than a high school diploma who have some personnel or other administrative experience.

A survey of the previous experience of the present personnel directors reveals that approximately half of them had worked in the personnel field before becoming personnel director, several for as many as 15 to 20 years. On the other hand, a number of them had no prior personnel experience. A majority have been personnel directors for only a few years, although one man held the position for 18 years.

The operating authority of these personnel departments is derived from the Civil Service Law of 1301 (1922), and subsequent amendments, by-laws, and administrative decrees. The personnel directors almost uniformly take a limited and legalistic view of their authority under these laws and regulations.

They regard their function, and the authority of their department, as that of simply applying the law without exercising any discretion whatsoever. A personnel director of one of the major ministries responded to a suggestion that they convene for monthly meetings to exchange ideas about more effective ways of performing their jobs by saying: "The basis for all personnel action is found in the law. What is there to discuss?"

The execution of personnel laws and regulations includes issuing personnel actions when persons are hired, fired, promoted, or transferred. If any training is carried on, it is usually performed by another department. If new personnel legislation is being considered, the personnel department may be consulted, but frequently it is not. A few years ago a new personnel bill was under consideration in the *Majlis*. This bill was prepared out of contact with the personnel directors, then circulated to the directors for their comments. Only a



few of the comments were considered when the bill was revised.

### Authority, Staff, and Funds—Minus Items

The position of a personnel director is largely a ceremonial one without significant power because of the limited functions of the personnel office. The personality of a personnel director and his relationship to his minister are crucial. If he is aggressive and if the minister knows him and wants to work closely with him, he may have a larger role to play.

Since there is no budgetary system in the government of Iran, it is almost impossible to get accurate information about the size and scope of the budget for the personnel function. The personnel departments do not have any definite budget, except for the salaries of their own personnel, and that budget is prepared elsewhere in the ministry. Funds for equipment and supplies are in the control of the accounting department of the Ministry of Finance so the personnel departments have no control over them and little knowledge about them.

The personnel directors see as their principal problem the lack of adequate authority, staff, and funds. They have no authority to determine staff needs or to work toward improvement of personnel administration in their departments. They have no authority over their funds. In the case of simple personnel actions they often take no action on their own. Such a matter as an internal transfer or a three-day leave requires the approval of the Director-General for Administration.

### Proposals for Reorganization

From time to time, especially in recent years, efforts have been made to reorganize personnel administration and create a central personnel agency. As long ago as 1925 Dr. Millspaugh, on his first mission as an adviser on finances to the Persian government, commented on the inadequacy of the then new Civil Employment Law.<sup>3</sup> Some attempts were made to change the law in the thirties but to no avail.

<sup>3</sup> Arthur C. Millspaugh, *The American Task in Persia* (Washington, D. C.: The Brookings Institution, 1925).

In 1945, William Brownrigg, who was serving as Director-General of Personnel in the Ministry of Finance in the second Millspaugh mission, prepared a new civil service bill and urged its enactment. The following year a prominent Iranian, Dr. Ahmad Moghbel, wrote a book recommending a complete reorganization of the personnel system and called attention to new personnel legislation in France and other Western European countries.

Little action appears to have resulted from these proposals and it is difficult to learn what else occurred in the late forties and early fifties.

In 1953 a High Council of Personnel, composed of various directors-general and other officials in government, was appointed to prepare a new civil service bill.

Mr. Brownrigg, in his recommended legislation, located the proposed central personnel agency in the Ministry of Finance. The High Council of Personnel was uncertain whether a new central personnel agency should be a part of the Ministry of Finance or the Prime Minister's office. As executive leadership through the Prime Minister has been strengthened in recent years, there has been a tendency in various proposals to locate a new central personnel office in the Prime Minister's office.

### The Moghbel Bill

In 1956, Dr. Moghbel, Minister Without Portfolio under the Ala government, drafted a measure which would create a strong central personnel agency—the State Personnel and Retirement Administration—attached to the Prime Minister's office. This agency would be responsible for establishing uniform government personnel policies and procedures for the operating personnel agencies to be guided by in the hope that improved personnel administration could result. One of the principles enunciated was that entry into the service would be on the basis of competitive examinations.

The State Personnel and Retirement Administration would be headed by a well-qualified director with at least fifteen years' administrative experience who would serve a three-year term. He would be assisted by

an advisory council whose duty would be to consult on general and overall employment affairs and other activities performed by the State Personnel and Retirement Administration.

The Moghbel bill was extremely long—almost fifty pages—and contained a number of provisions which might have been more appropriate in administration regulations. In any case, the measure was introduced in the Parliament in 1957 just a few weeks before the cabinet changed and Dr. Moghbel lost his ministerial position.

### **Fate of the Moghbel Proposal**

The new Prime Minister, Dr. Manucher Eghbal, indicated his desire to press for changes in Iran's personnel system. A High Council of Administrative Undersecretaries was established at this time. The Moghbel bill was sent to the High Council for study. Members of the High Council were strongly opposed to a central personnel agency. They objected to a supervisory or control office established outside their ministries and did not appear to be willing to relinquish prerogatives held by the ministries in personnel matters.

As a result of its deliberations, the High Council tabled the Moghbel bill and wrote an entirely new measure. It provides for the creation of a Civil Service Agency under the Administrative Undersecretary to the Prime Minister and looks upon the agency as another coordinating arm of the High Council of Administrative Undersecretaries. The Agency's executive officer would be called "Chief," without the stature of "Director."

The new bill contains a watered-down version of the duties of the Civil Service Agency as compared to the previous bills. The Agency would prepare regulations on various aspects of the total personnel program for Council of Ministers approval.

### **Central Personnel Office Strongly Opposed**

The success of this, or similar legislation, cannot be predicted, but this much is certain: the resistance to creation of a central

personnel office is great and it will not be established without a struggle.

The personnel directors are about evenly divided in their views on the desirability of establishing such an office. Those who oppose its creation give a variety of reasons for their position. The most common one is that they feel it would create delays and communication problems. As one director pointed out, "Cooperation is not easily reached in Iran."

Other reasons are that a central office does not know the needs of each ministry, that each ministry has different functions and must have personnel qualified to do specific jobs, and that each ministry is in a better position to perform the personnel functions than a central office. Furthermore, it is felt that if the basic laws and regulations are uniform, the ministerial personnel offices can execute them without a central personnel office.

### **The Real Problems Remain**

Such in brief is the general character of the public service in Iran. Any comments which may appear to be adverse or critical are not intended that way and should not be generalized to apply to each and every civil servant. As in any public service, there are numerous capable, industrious and devoted persons.

Unfortunately, a burden which is not humanly possible to bear falls on these individuals because of some basic problems which pervade the public service. These problems are real, and, although they have been recognized not only by foreign observers but by countless thoughtful and intelligent Iranians seriously concerned about their country and its government, they pose a threat to the morale, integrity, and efficiency of government operations and service to the people.

Unless they are recognized and systematically dealt with, Iran may fail to bring itself abreast of the great social and economic changes which are occurring all over the world.

# Unions in City Government: The Cincinnati Story

W. D. Heisel and J. P. Santa-Emma

*Say the authors: "By grabbing the ball and providing for recognition, management will have less to undo later."*

MANY PUBLIC personnel administrators look with distaste on the union-organizing activities of public employees. Some officials have refused to recognize such organizations, and, backed by legal decisions, have stated that employment by government and participation in labor unions is incompatible. In other situations, courts have held against the alleged improper delegation of authority required in the collective-bargaining process.

If this were a learned article, we would by now have dotted the page with footnotes of all the cases arising on this controversial subject. This is not our purpose. We aim only to show that, regardless of laws, regardless of courts, regardless of unfavorable administrative attitudes, you *will* have unions! We intend to give our reasons why, and, through our own personal experience, also to point out that unions do not necessarily take title to city hall as soon as they are recognized.

## Unrealistic Approach Not the Answer

The utilization of such theories as state sovereignty and "improper delegation of authority" may delay unionization but will not prevent it. Unionization is moving ahead at a fantastic rate.

The AFSCME (American Federation of State, County, and Municipal Employees) is the fastest growing union in the labor movement today. It exists in Philadelphia, where it has a contract; and it has members in Virginia and in Alabama (which prohibits unions). It has all forms of recognition, ranging from the contract down to a confused *de facto* acceptance.

Many government units, instead of taking a definite stand, have adopted a "wait-and-

see" attitude, in the hope that unions will somehow disappear. Some have fought them openly, but, in the meantime, the AFSCME continues to enroll more and more members.

Of the approaches mentioned above, the one with the worst ultimate implications is the "wait-and-see" approach, which provides an arms-length tolerance but no regulation of the union-management relationship. This permits the establishment of precedents which ultimately will make it more difficult to obtain the type of relationship that is fair to management.

We speak from experience. In Cincinnati, unions had been allowed to exist without formal relationships for a long time. We had quite a problem in getting the kind of restrictions which we considered essential to good relationships, as will be pointed out later.

## Why Join Unions?

Why will you have unions in the public service? To answer this question requires answering another: Why do employees join unions?

The first and foremost reason, of course, is the unions' success in obtaining economic benefits. No one can dispute the fact that public employee unions, like their industrial counterparts, have succeeded in getting better wages and fringe benefits. They have acted like any other pressure group in dealing with legislative bodies—and the approach has worked.

Unions have also increased the feeling of security that workers need. True, many public employees get civil service security against dismissal, but the possibility of having a grievance to present or of being involved in disciplinary action in which the

penalty could be as drastic as dismissal is ever present. In such cases the employee wishes to have someone more articulate than he to speak for him; someone who is better acquainted than he with the civil service laws; someone who knows what has happened in previous cases. So he turns to the union business agent. The employee thus gains security from union participation.

A third, and perhaps the most important, reason for joining a union lies in the satisfaction of participation—the sense of belonging, the opportunity to be somebody. The average employee has no identity as an individual, especially in a large agency. True, we talk a lot about recognition. Maybe we give 25-year pins, or occasionally put workers' names in the house organ. But day-by-day recognition? We might as well admit we don't provide it.

By joining a union, the average employee gets the feeling that he is participating in formulating policy. Many doors which were effectively closed to him before now open if he becomes an officer or steward. He may attend conventions. He may see his name in the newspaper. He gains a social outlet—perhaps his only chance to join a social organization. This prestige—sense of belonging, of self-esteem, call it what you will—is a strong force in the union's organizing drive.

These are three important reasons why unions were created, and why employees join them. In effect, they are the reasons you have, or will have, unions to deal with.

### Why Recognize Unions?

Once a union organizes, management must then take a position. We believe there are a number of reasons why management should willingly recognize unions voluntarily formed by its employees.

The most important is the mere fact that the union exists. It is unrealistic to say you can ignore your own employees. These unions are not made up of third-party outsiders but of public employees. Individually, they have the right to appeal to management about their wages, job classifications, working conditions, etc. If we recognize these rights of individuals, it is impractical to deny them to *groups* of individuals. In

fact, it becomes far easier for management to deal with these individual employees if they voluntarily provide a systematic means of communication through officers and business agents.

Communication with employees is one of the areas in which good union-management relations can be made to pay off. Management can get information to workers through supervision or through publications, such as employee manuals or house organs. But unfortunately, when management tries to explain a policy, workers somehow are more prone to believe their peers than their superiors. Likewise, in the upward flow of information, individual workers are more likely to tell supervisors what they think supervisors want to hear. Collectively, however, they feel freer to speak their minds.

There is a more pragmatic reason for offering recognition to a newly formed union: the opportunity given management to set the conditions of representation. Who can the union bargain for? Are supervisors eligible for union membership? If members, can they be officers? Can they be included in the bargaining unit? What are proper subjects of bargaining? What are the rights of management?

Agencies keeping their heads in the sand may find that unions have enrolled supervisors, or have expressed themselves on matters far beyond the usual bargaining relationship, or wangled concessions from one supervisor contrary to the policy of the agency itself. Open, written recognition provides management with the opportunity to help set the ground rules of the union-management relationship. In fact, most unions are so anxious to get recognition that management can pretty well write the rules itself.

By grabbing the ball and providing for recognition, the alert management will have less to undo later. We faced that situation in Cincinnati. In the late forties, when unions began to organize city workers, management took no position on unionism, other than a willingness to listen to them just as it would to any taxpayer. The unions enrolled any employee willing to pay his dues.

By the time they became an effective force numerically, much damage had been

done. Supervisors talked their employees into joining—a very effective recruitment technique. Unions criticized the city manager's budget—hardly a negotiable item in private industry. Management did not know who was in and who was not in unions. We now have some ground rules, which we will describe later, and feel we are better off for that reason.

### Let's Have a Strong Union!

Another effect that denying recognition will have on the union is that it will be weakened. The union won't go out of the picture, but it will be deprived of its strength in two respects: (1) it will be smaller numerically and therefore not necessarily representative, just as a small statistical sample of anything is not likely to be representative of the whole; and (2) it will possibly be of poorer quality, and therefore inclined to be obstreperous, irresponsible, demagogic, extremist, or incompatible with management. If you express disapproval, the better employees may well stay away from unions. Or, if they do join, they may stay out of leadership positions. Thus, by default, its leadership goes to the malcontent.

To be representative of the whole, the union needs reasonable size, adequate leadership, and security. It can't do its job of representing workers if its energies are devoted to staying alive, as a weak union must. It must have a solid financial support—and that means payroll dues deduction.

Although union security is first and foremost financial, it also involves the need for a written agreement providing for exclusive bargaining. This is in part a concession to union tradition. Other unions get written contracts, why not us? But it is more than just window dressing. It is a status symbol in union circles that is a protection against raiding. Our worst union experiences were in those situations where we had two unions competing for the same groups of employees.

### Union Relations in Cincinnati

As indicated before, Cincinnati has entered the written-agreement stage of union-management relations only recently. Employees began to organize years ago. We first heard of the AFSCME in about 1939.

Recognition was provided only in the sense that if a business agent appeared, he was allowed to talk. Who did he really represent? We had no idea except his own somewhat generous estimates.

During the forties we were well aware of increased union activities, not only by the AFSCME, but also by other unions. They frequently competed for membership in the same departments. The city council first recognized unions in 1951, when it passed a resolution "Declaring a City Wage Policy." This resolution defined a system of collective bargaining between the city manager and employee representatives on all matters pertaining to wages and working conditions. It did not define, however, what a union was, or whether a majority was required before a union could speak for a group. There was no limitation placed upon the areas in which the union could operate.

In 1960, a series of meetings between the AFSCME and management culminated in a modification of the policy resolution and the ultimate signing of a written agreement. The policy resolution amendment required that the union have a majority before it could be recognized. It also permitted the city manager to determine the bargaining unit and whether the union has the required majority. In order to get a written agreement, the union had to delete supervision above the first level from the bargaining unit it wished to represent.<sup>1</sup> It also had to agree to certain other minor exclusions, such as probationary employees, confidential employees, and employees of the personnel department. The right of an individual to represent himself is guaranteed as well as a clause prohibiting discrimination for or against union membership.

The written agreement itself is an administrative type of document. It is very short. Some labor-relations experts consider that the length of a contract is in inverse relation to the amount of mutual trust existing be-

<sup>1</sup> This requirement has prevented the Firefighters Association and the Fraternal Order of Police from seeking written agreement. They refuse to give up their existing prerogative of representing officers. While this provides two "degrees" of union recognition in Cincinnati, it is relatively unimportant because of the high percentage of membership in these organizations and their relative immunity to "raiding" by other labor organizations.



tween the union and management. We believe that this agreement sets forth the basis for agreement on any issue, and that it is therefore unnecessary to "legislate" every conceivable matter in the agreement itself.

We also handled the potential problem of delegation of legislative authority by adopting ordinances into the agreement by reference. No working conditions are spelled out in the agreement, no salaries set forth, no fringe benefits described. This not only protects us against possible attack of delegation of authority, but it also prevents possible confusion in case a paraphrase of an ordinance unintentionally changed a meaning.

### Management's Policies

Immediately upon the signing of the agreement with the AFSCME, the administration did two important things: (1) the city manager issued a written statement of his policies with regard to the union; and (2) the writers held meetings with supervision of every level in each operating agency affected by the agreement for the purpose of explaining the agreement and the city policy.

The city manager's written statement was primarily a statement of attitude. He pointed out that recognition was city policy, requiring supervision's support. He sought to impress upon management that the concept of management prerogatives, included in the agreement, should not be stretched into a basis for refusing to discuss anything with unions.

The administration's willingness to consult was emphasized. The city manager also delegated to department heads the responsibility of dealing with unions on matters affecting only their own agencies, and gave to the personnel officer the obligation of review and approval of agency policies with regard to unions.

The meetings with supervision did not change policy; they served only to communicate it. About thirty meetings were necessary to reach about 500 supervisors, each of whom had previously received a copy of the agreement, the policy resolution, and the city manager's policy. As a result, this is probably the best-understood policy we have.

### What Can Management Now Expect?

Winning a contract is always considered, in union circles, as a great victory. Normally it is won over considerable resistance from management. It solidifies the union position, gives it security. We would be the last to deny that our union considers that it has gained a big advantage with the signing of the agreement. Seldom, however, do we stop to realize the gains that management makes, at least in our circumstances.

Our own gains must be examined from the viewpoint of where we stood before the agreement. We had recognized unions, but had set no ground rules—no requirement of a majority, no recognition of management rights, no exclusions from the bargaining unit.<sup>2</sup> The mere establishment of these ground rules helped management. And the agreement by the union to these ground rules is also significant.

But more important, in our opinion, is our increased ability to demand responsible action from the union. We believe that management gets the kind of union it deserves. If management wants to be tricky, it will bring to the fore union leaders who are tricky in return. If management holds the union to every comma of the laws and rules, unions will hold management just as tight. But if management is fair and open, it is setting a climate to get fair and open responses from its employees collectively, just as it can get such responses individually.

We are trying to impress our employees—union and others—with the fact that both management and rank-and-file must be sensitive to public opinion. We cannot believe that the public approves of bickering, trickiness, and constant wrangling. To the extent that labor and management work together for the good of the citizen—not in collusion, but in cooperation toward better service—we can expect the support of the public. Formalized, well-understood, properly communicated working relationships between management and unions can foster such cooperation.

<sup>2</sup> Dues check-off had been established pretty much by horse-trading. The unions wanted the security; we wanted the straight dope on union membership. We charge five cents for each monthly deduction.



## Two Case Studies in Salary Setting

Louis J. Kroeger

*Two situations in which the orthodox rituals of pay setting gave way to a fresh approach in applying basic principles.*

MOST OF US concerned with compensation have developed a sort of management schizophrenia. We have pondered principles in our reflective moments while following the old rituals which compromise these principles in negotiating rates as favorable as our bargaining power permits. We have wanted to innovate. We have had to stagnate.

There are, happily, always exceptions to the rule. The two cases I am about to discuss are exceptions in my recent experience. They may not be original or unique, but they are nonetheless real, and they are recent—so recent and so current, in fact, that I prefer not to identify them because final approval is still in the balance in both cases.

Both are examples from the public service. Some of their details may be peculiar to public service. Their basic principles are, however, applicable to private enterprise as well.

### Case No. 1

The first of these cases involves executive compensation in a county government. Executive compensation has been treated less systematically than has the pay of the rank and file by both the public service and much of business. The executive job is individual. It is closely identified with the man who holds it. Individual attention (or neglect) characterizes the treatment we give such jobs, and confusion and inconsistency are common results. In the typical county, all this is underscored by the fact that almost a dozen of the department heads are elected and several others are appointed for

fixed terms. In both cases the salary cannot be changed during the term of the incumbent.

In the case under discussion, the county board of supervisors decided to separate considerations of pay for 39 top jobs from the balance of their compensation plan. They asked for particular attention to ways in which the 39 top jobs could be systematically related to each other; to the pay plan for the rest of the employees; and to general pay levels in comparable counties.

We are all familiar with the orthodox technique of setting salaries by comparison. You conduct a simple nose count, calculate some averages and other statistical points of central tendency, and go along with the mob. The fact that others pay what they pay because we pay it, and that we pay what we pay because they do, even though aware that they do because we do, hasn't seemed to bother anyone.

However, knowing that the client in the present case was more concerned with logical internal relationships than with just aping the practices of others, we gave principal emphasis to applying factors that seem important in establishing those relationships. We ended up using a point system to apply these factors with some consistency.

### A Workable Point Plan

I admit to considerable reservations about point systems when attempted in many situations. I don't think they work well when there is a variety of kinds of jobs with a wide variety of key factors important to their evaluation.

What makes the point plan more acceptable in evaluating a given group of executive jobs is that they can all be judged by the same basic factors of administrative respon-

**Editor's Note:** This article is adapted from a paper presented at the California Personnel Management Association's Management Seminars in May, 1960.

sibility, even though the subject matter of their administration ranges from filing papers to deciding the fate of human beings.

In these circumstances we felt that a point plan could well be the discipline and guide to our judgment, and would offer a basis for comparison which the client could continue to apply in the future. It departs from the typical point plan in one very important respect: it does not attempt to evaluate a large number of specific duties.

**Responsibility.** Since we are dealing with administrative jobs, we concluded that the key was *responsibility* rather than duties, and that responsibility had a number of manifestations, each of which should be taken into account separately.

**Qualifications.** The one factor we used that can be related to responsibility by stretching only a bit is *qualifications*. We believe that the minimum standard of education required by the job, whether or not possessed by the incumbent, is one measure of the job itself. We assigned point values on an ascending scale for the high school graduate, college graduate, graduate engineer with state registration, law degree with admission to the bar, and medical degree with completion of residency and a license to practice.

**Elective Positions.** One other factor which is rather distantly related to responsibility is the need to stand for election. Ten of these 39 jobs are in that category. Being elective does give an office a measure of direct responsibility to the people; and, to be practical, it does put a burden on compensation by the cost of running for office. So we gave a modest plus-value for the elective character of the office.

**People, Money, and Discretion.** The balance of the formula divides into three main headings—people, money, and discretion.

People are counted twice. One scale applies to the total number of staff supervised. This is reduced to effective full-time personnel regularly employed to offset inflated budgets with vacant positions, and to discount departments using casuals for short-time jobs. The second set of values applies to the number of professional personnel on

the staff. The reason is that we simply find a relationship between the number of lawyers, engineers, social workers, planners, etc., on the staff, and the inherent complexity and responsibility of the job.

Money gets counted twice too. One set of points is assigned for the total operating budget. This gives credit in proportion to the responsibility for the day-to-day operations of the staff and the space, equipment, and supplies required by them in their work. Money's second influence is in proportion to non-operating budget. These are expenditures a department may plan or control, but which are not part of its day-to-day operations.

In a county government the welfare department, for example, on a moderate operating budget may have a substantial responsibility for allotting relief funds. A public works department controls considerable sums for construction. The important consideration here is that the expenditure must be planned or controlled. An annual appropriation for interest on bonds, for instance, gains nothing on the point scale since it is an automatic provision imposing no administrative responsibility.

Finally, we come to the most important single element in the plan—discretion. Discretion is very close to the heart of administrative responsibility. It is the decisions an administrator must make in deciding on a course of action, in pursuing that course and evaluating its consequences, that separate administration from routine operations. The consequences of that discretion are the real measure of the responsibility the administrator bears.

An important distinction in the scale of values applied to this discretion factor is between the interpretation and application of policy, and the shaping or deciding of policy. We obviously put the higher value on the latter.

Within each of these two general categories there is a refinement recognizing, in ascending order, the different character of responsibility for records, for the collection and custody of funds, for matters affecting property rights of the people, and those affecting personal rights. For certain of the staff jobs there needs to be some further

refinements based on responsibility for coordination and interdepartmental policy as distinguished from any of the line responsibilities just mentioned.

**Final Steps.** From here on, the procedure followed orthodox lines. The total point value for each job was determined, the jobs were arranged in groups according to their totals, and these groups were related to the existing basic pay plan of the county. In this stage of the process, due consideration was given to prevailing rates in the other counties to determine the general level at which these classes would be set, but with no attempt to rearrange the conclusions on the basis of data gathered on specific jobs.

### Proof of the Pudding

That the application of this analysis did not simply verify existing relationships among these jobs is best evidenced by the fact that in twenty cases the salary would become relatively higher, in sixteen cases relatively lower, and in only three cases remain the same.

The significance of this experience is, we believe, that it demonstrates that executive compensation can be taken out of the vague field of individual and personal treatment, and that this can be done by concentrating mainly on evaluation standards applied to the responsibility of the administrator as distinguished from his duties.

We like to think that business enterprises may become interested to a greater degree in the systematic analysis of management jobs and relate compensation to key characteristics of those jobs. We know, of course, that in different kinds of enterprises a completely different scale of values would have to apply, but the principles still hold good.

### Case No. 2

The second case involves a total compensation plan for a city. This city, in common with most other public agencies that have formalized their compensation practices at all, uses a basic pay plan in which each class of positions has a five-step salary scale. The first step is the normal hiring rate and the others are granted more or less

automatically for some poorly defined combination of normal growth on the job, exceptional service, and seniority.

It has long concerned us that these several factors of growth, exceptional service, and seniority are indiscriminately mixed in the increments of a single pay plan. It means that in one instance an employee gets the next step in the plan because he has enjoyed normal growth on the job, and in another case because he has done something unusual, and in yet another case simply because he has stayed around long enough to qualify.

With the encouragement of a city manager who shares this concern we are developing a plan which aims to treat these factors separately. In doing this we will also correct, to a certain extent, another fallacy in the setting of compensation.

Most public agencies and many private companies place a great deal of reliance on the surveys of what other public and private employers are paying for comparable work, to which I referred earlier. The common procedure is for a survey to be made from selected employers in the area to find out, as to each of several key classes of employment, how many individuals are working at each specific rate.

These results are then averaged, with particular attention to the median rate and to the so-called inter-quartile spread. This latter is a statistical device which excludes the extreme lower 25 per cent of the data and the extreme upper 25 per cent of the data, leaving the middle 50 per cent as a supposedly safe and solid central tendency on which to base a compensation plan.

There are a couple of things wrong with this procedure.

The first of these is that everybody is making such a survey at the same time. Thus, each in effect finally decides on a new plan based on data which is in part influenced by his own rates.

The other is that included in this single tabulation of data are rates being paid employees by different employers because of the length of service, the quality of their service, or any other combination of factors peculiar to individual operations. Averaging all of these together is neither statistically

nor practically defensible, however common it may be as a practice.

The most that can be said for these surveys is that the resulting data, if used cautiously, can keep us from getting too far out of line.

If we are able to separate considerations for normal growth or seniority or for exceptional service by independent devices, which I will describe in a moment, then that part of the process which depends on determining what the general level of compensation should be can be confined to a survey to determine the prevailing *hiring* rate for each class, limited to employers found to have comparable hiring standards. We will then be summarizing truly comparable data, all geared to the single situation of what it takes to attract someone to start working for us.

### Seniority

On the item of seniority, the plan under discussion proposes to add an annual increment of one-half per cent of the base salary (the hiring rate) for each year of service. Because in any one pay period this would be a negligible amount, it is proposed to pay this sum annually on December 1.

This annual payment and this particular date have two advantages. Being December 1, it can be the nearest thing to a Christmas bonus which is possible in the public service. Putting it on an annual basis and requiring that the employee be actually in the service on the date it is paid should have some tendency to stabilize employment—which after all is the one justification for compensating for longevity or seniority.

At this stage we provide for the build-up of the seniority credit without limit, mainly because we have not yet found a logical point to cut it off. There probably is such a point to be found at about the time in an employee's life and career when he is not likely to change jobs. An added seniority payment to keep holding him then appears superfluous.

### Exceptional Service

The increments for exceptional service will be awarded for a variety of reasons, ranging from individual acts of heroism to

unusual inventiveness and initiative on the job. The award for exceptional service may be 5 per cent or 10 per cent of the base salary. It may be awarded for three, six, nine, or twelve months, depending on the nature of the exceptional service, and can be renewed for additional periods without limitation as long as there is a repeated showing that the exceptional service is continuing. This will overcome one feature in many of our pay plans, in which presumably the top step or two of a pay plan is reserved for exceptional service, but once it has been granted it is continued regardless of what happens to the quality of the service thereafter.

### Growth

I have reserved discussion of the growth factor until last because it is the most involved of the three.

Increment for growth is the element in a compensation plan by which we pay for the increase in proficiency, or ability, or creative contribution, normally expected for a given class of employment. This growth has three characteristics; each has to be identified and treated separately to get the pay plan to produce the results intended.

**Frequency.** The first of these characteristics is the frequency with which growth can be measured and with which it is therefore appropriate to consider its reward. This frequency, in a general way, is related to the cycle of the job. If the job has a daily routine, without variation, it should be possible after relatively few days to determine whether the employee is developing at the normal rate.

At the other extreme, a job may have seasonal characteristics that require at least a full year before it can be determined whether the employee is equal to all its demands. One element, therefore, in providing the increment for growth is the provision that it may be awarded at the end of a quarter, or semi-annually, or annually, depending on the determined characteristics of the work cycle for each class of positions.

**Rate.** A second characteristic is the rate at which this growth takes place. In the case of a skilled craftsman, for example, he

is expected to come to the job with all of the skill and training required. The growth of which he is capable within the limits of that skilled trade job is principally one of becoming familiar with local practices and standards—something that can take place to a considerable degree within the period of time established for measuring the growth.

Again, at the other extreme, a job involving the interpretation and application of complex regulations might require slow and deliberate learning so that, within any given time span marked for the evaluation of growth, its normal rate would not be expected to be great. To recognize this varying rate, we are considering having increments of 3 per cent, 5 per cent, or 7 per cent.

**Total Span.** The third characteristic is the total span of time over which growth is normally possible. Again, in the case of the skilled craftsman or the office machine operator, there is not a great deal of total growth possible, unless the individual progresses to a higher class of job. In the case of certain professional and administrative jobs, it is quite likely that growth can continue for a long time. To recognize these differences the plan provides for salary scales having two or four or six increments of increase over the base salary.

**Coding.** In order to apply all of these considerations to each class of position in this city's service, we reviewed each of several hundred classes of positions separately in relation to each of these three characteristics of frequency, rate, and span. We have coded each class for the variables possible under each of the three characteristics.

The resulting code for a given class then may result in its recognizing growth to the slight extent of two 3-per-cent increments available on an annual basis, or to the considerable extent of six increments of 7 per cent available quarterly. I am not sure that the latter will show up for any class, but it is theoretically possible.

#### If All Goes Well . . .

In summary, then, when the plan is in full operation an individual will be em-

ployed at the hiring rate established on the basis of prevailing hiring rates in the community. This is his base rate for the purpose of computing the other increments. By the end of his first year of service, he may have one or more increments of increase for growth, ranging from 3 per cent to 7 per cent of his base salary, and may have as much as 10 per cent added for exceptional service, plus one-half of 1 per cent of his base pay for seniority. The least he will have is his base salary plus one-half of 1 per cent for seniority.

While the growth increment may come to be awarded automatically on the time interval established for each class, it is intended that it not be awarded unless the employee demonstrates the rate of growth normally expected for the class. It should be reasonable to say that if the employee does not grow at a normal rate he should be terminated. However, human nature being what it is, it is more likely that increments may be withheld, but the positive step of removal will not be taken.

There is a natural question about whether all of this may not be so involved mechanically that it will be difficult to administer. The plan having not yet been put to the test of actual operation, we are unable to say. In our mind's eye we believe we see the way of expressing the variables in this plan in a reasonably coherent and intelligible fashion, and we think that mechanically it will not be too difficult to apply and administer.

Certainly in any organization large enough to support modern electronic computers, the combining of all this data for individual cases would be no problem at all. It would be only a bit more difficult with those having standard key punch and tabulating equipment; and we think not a great deal more difficult for those having any kind of accounting machinery.

We optimistically believe that a plan of this character will help compensation fulfill its proper role—not merely as a matter of meeting the competition in the labor market, but one of encouraging and rewarding productive effort by the employee.



# Public Personnel Association Business—1960

Kenneth O. Warner

*A summary of Public Personnel Association business matters at the 1960 Annual Conference.*

AT THE 1960 ANNUAL CONFERENCE of the Public Personnel Association held at New York City, October 23-27, important Association business was transacted at both the opening session on Monday morning, October 24, and at the business meeting held Wednesday afternoon, October 26.

## 1960 Awards for Merit

Two Awards for Merit were announced at the 1960 opening session of the Annual Conference. The Award recipients and their citations were as follows:

### Austin J. Tobin

President Hawthorne announced that the first awardee was Austin J. Tobin, Executive Director, Port of New York Authority. He invited Mr. Albert H. Aronson to read the Award citation and to present the plaque to Mr. Tobin. The citation read as follows:

By this Award we recognize and commend your leadership in the achievement of an outstanding program of public personnel administration.

Keywords of both the program and your leadership have been encouragement and inspiration. The personnel program of The Port of New York Authority has been characterized, as has every other phase of its administration, by an energetic, restless pursuit of the best—the best standards, the best methods, the best results. To this pursuit, you, as Executive Director, have given not only your enthusiastic support and encouragement, but the inspiration of your personal example.

You have been among the foremost men in the public service to insist on the complete absence of political influence in appointments and promotions. On this fundamental tenet that only merit *can* earn reward and recognition, you have constructed a personnel program which strives with notable success to assure that merit *does* earn appropriate rewards and generous recognition.

Numerous examples, including your own, prove to Port Authority men and women that

they can, through demonstrated merit, rise through the ranks from Clerk or Laborer to executive status. Numerous opportunities are provided them not only to increase their knowledge, understanding and skills, but also to demonstrate these capabilities and their growth. Every member of the staff is thus inspired and encouraged to participate in the zealous quest for improvement.

As a result, the Port Authority has been able to attract, hold, and develop a staff of highly qualified and highly motivated men and women, whose concerted efforts have built an outstanding record of public service achievement. In many fields, including personnel administration, the Port Authority's programs have, in fact, served as inspiration and model for other agencies, both public and private.

The exemplary force of these programs derives not alone from the sound and effective results they achieve, but from the dynamic and imaginative approach they embody. As specific illustrations in the personnel field: Yours was the first public agency to use the In-Basket technique as one of many avenues to improved selection. Your agency has been in the forefront of experimentation with new techniques of management development, such as group dynamics and sensitivity training. The use of a unique computer program in your current re-examination of management salary scales represents another Port Authority "first." Your employee publications and employee suggestion system have won national awards and, like so many other Port Authority programs, the ultimate of imitation.

Such programs can flourish to full fruitfulness only under dynamic and dedicated leadership in which vigor and vision are combined. Because your exercise of just such leadership has been a source of inspiration and encouragement, not only to your own organization but to the entire field of public personnel administration, the Public Personnel Association is proud to present you with its 1960 Award for Merit.

Following presentation of the plaque, Mr. Tobin expressed his deep appreciation for the honor accorded him, mentioning particularly that he was happy to be associated



## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

with Governor Luis Munoz-Marin as a recipient of PPA's Award for Merit.

In his address, Mr. Tobin identified several significant forces and trends influencing the pattern of present-day personnel administration, both public and private. He cited the attention focused on employee relations in the private-industry sector occasioned by the wave of labor legislation passed in the thirties. During this same era, he said, the public personnel field was ahead of the times in such areas as testing, job classification, training, and standards of discipline.

In recent years, Mr. Tobin said, there have been many indications that personnel administration in private business is striving to catch up with government in the fields in which governmental personnel administration has been ahead. By the same token, government has found itself increasingly confronted with problems of labor relations. He foresaw a not-distant time when differences between personnel administration in the public service and private industry will be limited to relatively few areas.

Against this background, Mr. Tobin described the management philosophy and goals which have shaped the organization and policies of the Port of New York Authority personnel program. This management philosophy, he said, recognizes the employee as an individual, with a concomitant need for shaping personnel policies around this concept. He cited several illustrations of the philosophy in action, such as in recognizing superior job performance in salary administration, provision of opportunities for training and personal development, communication and settlement of grievances, and the active role of line supervisors in many phases of the personnel program. He also stressed the need for constant management evaluation of program effectiveness, as well as the need for planning ahead to meet changing situations in the dynamic world of today.

### Luis Munoz-Marin

President Hawthorne invited Past President Dr. William W. Shaw to read the citation for Luis Munoz-Marin, Governor, Commonwealth of Puerto Rico, as follows:

By this Award we recognize and commend your leadership in the achievement of an outstanding program of public personnel administration.

The name "Luis Munoz-Marin" is well known throughout the world, and particularly in the minds and hearts of people who cherish free, democratic institutions of government. As the first Governor of Puerto Rico elected by popular vote, you have served three successive terms from 1948 onward. During that time you have introduced a new concept in political relationships—The Commonwealth status of Puerto Rico, and you have brought about far-reaching reforms in government organization and operation, while at the same time you have been a leader in raising the economic and cultural standards of the people of Puerto Rico.

As the political and administrative leader of an important segment of the American commonwealth, you have consistently displayed deep and active devotion to the principles of the merit system in public employment. Entering office against a background of political abuses from past generations, you quickly exerted positive influence to bring about needed reforms, both in law and in practice. It was both your responsibility and opportunity to give life and substance to the newly enacted Puerto Rican personnel statute which became effective in 1947. During the ensuing years you have encouraged the development of an effective personnel program distinguished by modern, effective policies and techniques. Among these are: An extensive scholarship program for public employees, including special educational and training leaves; improved and stepped-up programs of recruitment; an incentive awards program consisting of cultural trips to other countries; and a modern retirement system.

Your deep and continuing devotion to the merit system as a basic tenet of democratic government is well illustrated in a quotation from your proclamation issued on the occasion of the 50th anniversary of civil service in Puerto Rico. In that proclamation to the people of Puerto Rico you said:

"The public service career, which is the essence of the merit system, should be a goal for which Puerto Ricans ought to strive as a means of contributing their talent and efforts to the achievement of the noble aspirations of our people."

For these achievements and for this dedication to the merit system in practice, the Public Personnel Association takes pride in presenting to you its 1960 Award for Merit.

In the absence of Governor Munoz, the Award plaque was received by Antonio Cuevas-Viret, Director of Personnel, Commonwealth of Puerto Rico. Mr. Cuevas ex-

pressed his own appreciation for the honor of receiving the Award on behalf of Governor Munoz and read a letter from the Governor expressing gratitude for the Award and his regret that affairs at home prevented him from receiving the Award in person.

### Business Meeting

The annual business meeting of the Public Personnel Association was held at 1:30 P.M., October 26. After calling the 1960 business meeting to order, Mr. Hawthorne first requested a report from the Nominating Committee, consisting of:

*Chairman:* ALBERT H. ARONSON, Chief, Division of State Merit Systems, U. S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare.

*Committee members:* J. EARL KELLY, Director of Classification and Compensation, New York State Department of Civil Service; RAY MULLINS, Director of Personnel, Jefferson County, Alabama, Personnel Board; THEODORE L. SHARP, Secretary and Chief Examiner, Glendale, California, Civil Service Commission (who served in lieu of HARRY P. PETRIE, Secretary and Chief Examiner, Los Angeles County, California, Civil Service Commission); and CHARLES S. WEBER, Training Director, Michigan State Civil Service Commission.

On behalf of the Nominating Committee, Chairman Aronson gave the report of the Committee as follows:

*For President:* CHARLES A. MEYER, Assistant Secretary and Chief Examiner, Detroit, Michigan, Civil Service Commission.

*For Vacancies on the Executive Council:* JOSEPH A. CONNOR, Regional Director, Seventh U. S. Civil Service Region, Chicago, Illinois; and WAYNE L. HIGBEE, Personnel Director, City of Santa Monica, California, Personnel Department, both for three-year terms; and for a one-year term on the Council made vacant by the resignation of ANGUS LAIRD, J. STANLEY FRAZER, Director, Alabama State Personnel Board.

Mr. Aronson presented the nomination of Mr. Meyer for President during 1961, which was duly seconded. There being no further

nominations, on motion duly made and seconded, the membership cast a unanimous ballot for Mr. Meyer.

Mr. Aronson then nominated Mr. Connor for membership on the Executive Council, which was duly seconded. There being no further nominations, on motion duly made and seconded, the membership cast a unanimous ballot for Mr. Connor. He then nominated Mr. Higbee for membership on the Executive Council, which was duly seconded. There being no further nominations, on motion duly made and seconded, the membership cast a unanimous ballot for Mr. Higbee.

Mr. Aronson then placed in nomination for membership on the Executive Council the name of Mr. Frazer, which was duly seconded. There being no further nominations, on motion duly made and seconded, the membership cast a unanimous ballot for Mr. Frazer.

The newly-elected officers were then invited to the platform and introduced to the membership. Each acknowledged the election with thanks.

At this point, Mrs. Mabel Chung of the Hawaiian Chapter of the Public Personnel Association presented the President and President-elect with leis from Hawaii and invited the membership to Hawaii at some future time.

### Honorary Life Membership

President Hawthorne placed in nomination for Honorary Life Membership the name of Angus Laird, formerly Merit System Supervisor, State of Florida. The nomination was duly seconded and the Secretary was instructed to cast a unanimous ballot in favor of the nomination.

J. Stanley Frazer, member of the Executive Council, and a former Chairman of the Southern Region, was invited to read the citation for Mr. Laird as follows:

### Angus Laird— Honorary Membership Citation

When you retired from active personnel administration and assumed the role of advocate emeritus of improved public personnel administration, perhaps your own physical well-being was benefited, but we of this organization suffered a great loss.

## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

Through the years your tireless efforts in the activities of our organization have helped advance it to the level at which it stands today. We are well aware that the last several years of your activities were carried on in spite of great physical pain, which would have discouraged a lesser man.

We are also aware of your long years as an educator and author in the fields of American history, government, and political science, in which you undoubtedly inspired and prepared young people to assume positions of responsibility in public service.

Your early dedication to better government led you to assume active leadership in the growth of the merit system idea in Florida. In 1941, you were part-time supervisor, while teaching college, of a system composed of two federally subsidized agencies. Then, in 1946 you served as full-time director of a consolidation of two merit systems serving four organizations. Your leadership helped prove the value of the system to the people of Florida, and in 1955 a statewide merit system enabling act was unanimously passed by both houses of the Florida Legislature. The merit system in your state now covers eighteen agencies, totaling over 12,000 employees. Credit for this progressive step is due in no small part to your personal influence, and the positive results of your leadership in building public confidence during the infancy and growth of the merit system in your state.

Your activities in and sponsorship of local and national professional, civic, and other public service organizations have reflected an enviable dedication to the advancement of better government through better personnel practices.

The people of Florida can take pride in your achievements, and we also take pride in the fact that while accomplishing these things, you were actively contributing to the growth of our Association.

In October of 1958, you accepted membership on the Executive Council of the Public Personnel Association, and served in this capacity until your semi-retirement in January of this year. We hope you intend to continue the advancement of the ideals of this organization through writing, your vast and influential acquaintances and friendships with key people in government administration, and through teaching young people at the university level. In recognition of your long and continued devotion to the goals of our Association, we are most honored to award you its Lifetime Honorary Membership.

Since Mr. Laird was unable to be present to receive the membership plaque in person, the Director was instructed to send it to him, with the high regards of the Association members.

## Proposed Bylaw Amendment

President Hawthorne invited William E. McCarthy, Chairman of the Eastern Regional Conference, to review the work of the Eastern Regional Executive Committee that had drafted and submitted a proposed amendment to Article 5 of the Bylaws to the membership in advance of the meeting. Mr. McCarthy explained the general features of the amendment and moved its adoption. The motion was duly seconded.

The President then called for discussion. There followed considerable discussion of the proposed bylaw amendment, and amendments to that amendment. The amendment proposed by the Eastern Regional Conference provided for an Executive Council of eleven persons, including a President, six elected on an at-large basis for three-year terms, and four elected by each Regional Conference in 1961 for two-year terms. Meanwhile present Regional Conference chairmen would serve until Regional Conference representatives were selected.

Executive Council Member Philip Berger suggested that the amendment be amended to provide for an Executive Council of nine members, consisting of the President, elected for a one-year term, four members elected at large for three years, and four members, elected by Regional Conferences, each for a three-year term, but with provisions for staggering their election. Mr. Berger explained that this provision would retain a majority of the Executive Council on an at-large basis and would also make all Executive Council terms uniformly three years. He stated that this proposal had the support of the Executive Council itself and also the Advisory Committee of Former PPA Presidents and Executive Council Members. He further said that it was the consensus that the membership should have an opportunity to vote on the amendment, as amended, by mail ballot so that it would become effective before year-end. A number of members thought that it would be quite appropriate to complete the voting on the proposed amendment, as amended, at the business meeting.

Mr. O. Glenn Stahl suggested that there be an alternate and separate vote on the selection of a Vice-Chairman of the Execu-

tive Council to serve as Vice-President for legal purposes. He pointed out that at the present time bylaw arrangements call for Regional Chairmen to serve as Vice-Presidents of the Association, and for the Executive Council to select from among the Vice-Presidents a person to act as President if the President is unavailable to serve. Thus, if this feature were to be retained in the bylaws, succession to the Presidency would be from among persons who had not had an opportunity to become fairly familiar with Association affairs. He therefore suggested that the added amendment be considered to provide for the selection of a Vice-Chairman of the Executive Council at its first meeting each year. The Vice-Chairman would preside over the Executive Council and the annual business meeting in the absence of the President, and would also serve as Acting President in the event the President should be unavailable. Finally, the establishment of the Vice-Chairmanship would meet legal requirements of the laws of Illinois respecting non-profit corporations, which require a President, Vice-President, a Secretary and a Treasurer.

After considerable discussion, a motion was made, seconded, and carried to refer by letter ballot to the membership the amendment as amended by Mr. Berger, with the provision suggested by Mr. Stahl incorporated in a separate companion proposal.

### PPA Committee Reports

President Hawthorne called for and received brief reports from various committees as follows:

**Committee on Personnel Function.** Chairman Tom Page presented the terminal report of this Committee which was established in October, 1956. He stated that during a four-year period, the Committee developed and widely circulated a research design for broad attack on this perplexing issue in personnel administration. The research proposal received full support of the Committee, was endorsed by a panel of research consultants, and was formally supported by the Executive Council of PPA. The proposal for an extensive grant of funds for research was considered by major foundations, but found no acceptance there.

Mr. Page referred to the publication *The Public Personnel Agency and the Chief Executive*, which was published by PPA and edited by the Committee chairman as Personnel Report No. 601. He commented on the increased activity and interest which had been generated by the Committee's activities.

Mr. Page said that, in discussing the possibility of sponsorship by PPA of the Committee's far-reaching research proposal, it was recognized, perhaps for the first time, what priorities must guide efforts by PPA itself, given scarce resources at its disposal from its own budget and foundation grants. Developmental activities of the Association itself, he said, are the first claim of Association time and money. Thereafter come applied research programs which yield marketable services by PPA to its member agencies. And only third come basic research projects in which the exact pattern of eventual findings cannot be confidently anticipated.

Mr. Page said: "In addition, the prospect that the basic research proposed, even under general objectives agreed to by PPA as a sponsoring agency, might treat some issues as unsettled which some members might prefer to see accepted as settled principles, caused some recurring anxieties. There are advantages, therefore, in just what the Committee has done—stimulated research efforts through other organizations than PPA itself on an issue as delicate but as perennial as the organization of the personnel function."

**Committee on Affiliation.** Mr. F. Arnold McDermott, Chairman of the Committee on Affiliation with the Public Personnel Association, reported for his Committee. He mentioned the objectives of the Committee, consisting of Chapter Presidents and Regional Chairmen, to be: (1) to improve relationships between Chapters, Regions, and the parent body; and (2) to increase individual membership in the Association. Very little, he said, had been done toward the first objective, although it was agreed that we need a better relationship pattern.

He pointed out that geography and communications (or the lack of them) are factors which still present problems as we strive toward greater cohesiveness. He cited

## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

the Eastern Region's recent efforts to broaden the scope of activities in establishing stronger bonds with chapters in that regional area.

Mr. McDermott pointed out that, although other Regions which have fewer Chapters do not feel the need for increasing Regional activity, they do join in asking for a strengthening of the lines of communication with the parent body and consultation with Chapters in preparation of both Regional and international Conferences. A careful review of relationships between Chapters and Regions should increase the strength of the Association and accomplish objectives better. The Chapter Presidents and Regional Chairmen affirmed their support of any bylaw changes that would strengthen relationships.

Mr. McDermott said the membership picture had become clearer and brighter during the last year. From July 1, 1959, when the Committee first began to function, to September 30, 1960, a total of 738 members were added. This resulted from close cooperation among Chapters, Agency members, Individual members, and the Secretariat. Thus the rate of membership growth had approximately doubled after the Committee and the Secretariat started working on the problem. The Committee hopes that this trend will continue.

#### Committee on Professional Development.

Chairman Wayne Higbee reported that the Committee met and concerned itself primarily with the standards for professional membership now under consideration. They recommended that the subject be discussed among Chapters and also within the Regions, and that recommendations in this area be made to the Executive Council.

#### Committee on Personnel Nomenclature.

(With special reference to sick leave matters.) Chairman Lew Fay reported that the Committee had discussed the subject at considerable length. It concluded that it

would be worthwhile for the subject to be discussed at each Regional Conference and given further consideration at the 1961 Annual International Conference in Denver, where the results of regional consideration could be evaluated and incorporated in the work of the Committee.

**Role of the Departmental Personnel Office.** A progress report was given by Committee Chairman Achille R. Albouze, Personnel Officer, California State Department of Social Welfare. Mr. Albouze mentioned that progress had been made in the development of a questionnaire, and that the Committee expected to circulate it during the next few months. He hoped to have a report based on this questionnaire for consideration by the Executive Council some time next year.

#### Director's Report

President Hawthorne called on PPA Director Kenneth O. Warner to comment on the Association's program. Mr. Warner said members would receive a full report on 1960 activities shortly after the first of the year. To save time, Mr. Warner handed out a brief statement about developments "since last we met." This statement, he said, would also be sent to all members.

#### A Word from the President

Mr. Hawthorne expressed his appreciation to the Association for the privilege of having served as President during the past two years. He said the experience had been most gratifying.

Mr. Hawthorne then introduced the President-elect, Charles A. Meyer, who acknowledged the honor conferred upon him and expressed his desire to press forward with useful programs during the coming year. He requested the cooperation and assistance of the entire membership.





# around the personnel world

## ● BRAZIL

### **All Roads Lead to Brasilia.**

The move of the entire Civil Service of Brazil from Rio de Janeiro to the new capital city, Brasilia, began in April, 1960, and will take a few more years to complete. Asked how the Brazilian Civil Servants were taking it, Luiz Cardoso, third secretary at the Brazilian Embassy in Ottawa, replied that reactions were mixed so far. "Some of them . . . aren't very happy about the move, but others are looking forward to an easier life in Brasilia."

### **Life in the Bush Country Was Never Like This!**

He reports several advantages in the brand-new city 600 miles from Rio in the hinterlands of Brazil: Civil Servants are paid more for doing the same job than they are paid in Rio; they have a five-day week instead of having to work Saturday mornings; rents are controlled and much cheaper than in Rio making it possible for anyone who wishes to buy his own house to do so very reasonably; the city is built with few intersections, which makes it one of the safest cities in the world so far as traffic is concerned.

Mr. Cardoso also noted that Brazilians customarily have two full hours for lunch—a tradition in the country that people expect—and although they have no coffee breaks, they can drink coffee all day long at their desks if they wish. (Abstracted from "The Civil Service" by Eileen Turcotte, *Ottawa Journal*, June 16, 1960.)

## ● INDIA

### **Recent Developments in Public Administration.**

An important recent change in the policy of the Government of India which is likely to have a great impact on the social system relates to the reference to caste and sect in official records. The Government of India has, in a recent communication to the States, asked them to delete the reference to caste or sect in registers or forms used for purposes of services, education, judicial proceedings, etc. The new forms or registers will seek information only on nationality, religion and whether a person is a member of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The column on religion will be retained because such information is likely to be useful in connection with the compilation of vital statistics and for the maintenance of records. (From *The Indian Journal of Public Administration*, April-June, 1960.)

### **Training for Civil Servants.**

In the context of a welfare State and the need for successful implementation of Five Year Plans, it has been considered essential that civil servants, particularly those belonging to the higher grades, should possess not merely professional skill and experience but also a wide outlook, greater adaptability and a fuller realisation of the obligations



## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

of public service. The ideal of service, as distinguished from mere exercise of power and authority, as the central motivation in a Welfare State, require to be explained, emphasised and made part of the mental make-up of the civil servants. With this object in view, a combined course of training for new entrants to the All-India Services and Central Services Class I in background and foundational subjects is now imparted in the National Academy of Administration which has recently been set up at Mussoorie.

In this Academy, arrangements have also been made for providing refresher courses to older civil servants in order that officers working in different capacities under the State and Central Governments may have opportunities to study, reflect and compare notes amongst themselves and thus equip themselves better to shoulder their responsibilities. It is also proposed to arrange seminars, conferences, etc. in the Academy on specific problems relating to planning fiscal policy, social security, etc. (From *Civic Affairs*, June, 1960.)

### ● JAPAN

#### **Recruiting, Efficiency, and Training**

In regard to the recruiting system governing the appointment of government employees, the Authority made every effort for an improved operation of the system in accordance with the principle of merit based on demonstrated abilities, conducted no less than 16 entrance examinations in the course of the year, and continued to give its ceaseless attention to the evaluation and improvement of the systems of these examinations. The entrance examinations administered up to the end of 1958 totaled 129, while the aggregate number of their examinees reached roughly 1,700,000.

The Authority conducted investigations and studies on evaluation of work performance, training, employee health, recreation, safety control and welfare, and at the same time played an active role in the over-all planning and coordination of programs for improvement of efficiency. On the other hand, on April 1, a new era was introduced in "administrative training," a training program initiated in October 1956 with the object of equipping middle-grade government employees with higher administrative abilities, by the establishment of its new administering agency, to be known as the Institute of Public Administration, in the Authority's Secretariat. Thanks to the understanding and cooperation of various ministries and agencies of government, this training had been made increasingly substantial with the passage of time until under the new setup it began to take a step forward on its path to further progress. (From 1959 Annual Report of the National Personnel Authority, Tokyo.)

### ● RUSSIA

#### **Teaching of Administrative Sciences.**

In the USSR, posts in public administration are filled either electively (by deputies of Councils of Workers' Deputies, members of Executive Committees of local councils, judges, etc.) or by specialists in the particular field with which the undertaking or organization is concerned (e.g., engineers in the case of factories, doctors in the case of medical establishments, etc.). Accordingly, no special provision is made for the training of professional administrators; a sufficient grounding in the necessary administrative sciences is acquired, in the relevant subject-fields, in general higher educational establishments. The fullest and most specialized teaching of administrative sciences is, of course, provided in the Schools of Law and Economics, since there is a fairly large demand for lawyers and economists in the administration of government departments.

### Organization of Teaching

The courses provided last four years in institutes of economics, five years in universities and technological, agricultural and other institutes of advanced studies, and six years in medical and other faculties.

The main subjects taught in institutes and university faculties of law, preparing students for work in government departments and organizations, the Law Courts and the Prosecutor's Office, are: the theory of the State and law, the history of political science, the history of the State and law, litigation statistics, principles of accountancy, constitutional law, administrative law, public finance, civil law, criminal law, land law, procedure in civil suits, criminal procedure, criminology, international law, family law, logic, the Latin language, etc. Social and economic subjects such as political economy, philosophy, etc., are also studied. Law students devote considerable time to the study of foreign languages, which they need in order to read the legal literature of other countries. The curricula of law faculties also make provision for physical education and sports.

In addition to the compulsory subjects, the curricula include a few optional items, such as history of the State and law of the individual Union republics, the civil and commercial law of foreign States, arbitration and arbitration practice, Soviet public works, industrial management and the development of agriculture, trade and Socialist culture, the principles of economics planning, etc. The list of optional subjects is drawn up each year by the Board of the faculty, with due regard to the students' wishes.

### Students

Admission to higher educational establishments in the USSR is governed by regulations which are published every year for the information of the public. In order to enter them, candidates are required to have undergone secondary education. The regulations prescribe no conditions relating to nationality or military service. Normal instruction is open to citizens up to the age of 35, and external courses to students of any age.

There is a competitive examination for access to higher educational establishments. In accordance with the conditions of this examination, those who obtain the best results have the first places. Preference is given to candidates who have acquired some practical experience.

Tuition is free in these establishments. Students at universities and institutes are maintained by a government grant. They have the use of student hostels, sports facilities, clubs and other cultural organizations attached to the establishments. They also take an active part in the social and political life of the country.

All higher educational establishments have clubs for the various branches of learning. These clubs join together to form student study societies. Membership of such clubs helps to broaden the students' outlook and extend their knowledge. The best papers written by the members of these clubs are awarded prizes and published in learned journals and reviews. External students are granted a month's paid leave every year, to sit for the examinations. (From *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, Vol. XXV, No. 4, 1959.)

## ● EUROPE

### Appeals Machinery in the Public Service.

In Europe, excluding the British Isles, there is a great variety of appeals machinery founded upon an equally great variety of historical, political and administrative traditions. Generally speaking, however, party political and legislative influence has been eliminated from the fields of promotion and discipline, and a group of officials is now responsible for these matters.

### Belgium

In Belgium, a *Conseil de Direction* has been established in each ministry or major department. This *Conseil* consists of the heads of divisions within the department, and in disciplinary matters it is assisted by a departmental *Chambre de Recours*. Half of the members of each *Chambre* are nominated by the public service associations, and half by the minister. The case against an officer is prepared by his immediate superior and is heard by the relevant *Chambre de Recours*. Appeals on points of law (administrative law) lie to the administrative courts, the highest of which is the *Conseil d'Etat*.

### Germany

In Western Germany, an elaborate system of federal disciplinary courts has been established and full-time prosecutors appointed. The courts of first instance are the *Bundesdisziplinarkammern*, which are set up by the Federal Minister of the Interior with members appointed by him. Each of these disciplinary courts has a full-time, legally-qualified chairman, a vice-chairman, and a number of assessors, half of whom have legal qualifications and half are appointed mainly on the recommendations of the public service associations.

Appeals against the verdicts of the *Bundesdisziplinarkammer* lie to a court of second instance, the *Bundesdisziplinarhof*, which may reject an appeal on legal grounds, return a case for further instruction, or hear a case again itself, when the same judicial procedure is followed. The penalty to be imposed is a matter for the *Disziplinarkammer* concerned.

### Other Countries

Normally, an officer charged with a disciplinary offence is entitled to be dealt with according to a special procedure. The normal limits of disciplinary action are similar to those obtaining in Sweden, where such action can be taken only for negligence, lack of skill or censurable conduct; for faults or negligence in the performance of duties, or failure to observe proper forms, or disobedience; and for conspicuous ignorance of the regulations which have to be observed or administered.

In minor cases, an officer's immediate superior is originally responsible for considering the offence, and he usually has the power to impose penalties of warning or censure, subject to appeal. Other cases are prepared either by the establishments officer, as in Switzerland, or by the officer's immediate superior, as in France and Italy. The case is then heard by a special administrative disciplinary committee or court. In Italy, this comprises a departmental *Commissione di Disciplina*, consisting of a director-general of a division and two inspectors-general. In France, *Commissions Administratives Paritaires* are specially constituted from the joint staff-official associations. In Switzerland, the *Conseil Fédéral* is in principle the highest disciplinary organ but delegates its powers to departments, which establish their own departmental disciplinary committees. (From *The Public Servant*, May, 1960.)

## ● EGYPT

### Efforts in the Field of Training.

Four main branches of training in the public service were introduced in Egypt.

### Generally Standardized Jobs

Started in 1956, and by January 1959, 25 training centres were in operation. The number of persons trained is now 5242. The courses of instruction included secretarial work, typing and shorthand.

### Specialized Jobs

Upon the recommendation of the Civil Service Commission, training departments were established in the majority of the government ministries. Besides being liaisons to the Commission, these departments study the training needs of their ministries. They follow up those who have had training and compare their standard of performance before and after training. The Commission has planned 14 training programs in the fields where they were most needed. Two thousand two hundred and seventy-eight officials have been trained in these programs.

### New Recruits

The Commission's policy for training new recruits is twofold:

1. A standard training program conducted in each ministry to provide basic information about the objectives of the ministry, its organization, the general requirements for holding a public position, the duties and responsibilities of public servants, and so on.
2. On the job training, conducted by the new recruits' supervisor.

### Supervisors

Due to the lack of trained supervisors able to handle technical problems of training, a program was established by the Commission similar to the regular program conducted by the Institute of Public Administration. The courses of the Commission's program included such subjects as human relations, job instructions and simplification of work.

It is also the policy of the Commission to encourage each ministry to train its own personnel. The Commission provides the heads of the training departments in the ministries with guidance and facilities which enables them to conduct training programs under supervision from the Commission. This policy will be carried out until such time as the training departments are fully equipped to perform on their own. The role of the Commission will then be one of guidance and coordination. (From summary of paper by Ehsan Hafez in *Problems of Administration*, Cairo, 1959.)

## ● AUSTRALIA

### Married Women in Industry.

The proportion of married women in the Australian work force has increased rapidly in the years since the war. Between 1947 and 1954 (the latest date for which figures are available), it rose from eight to 14 per cent, in absolute figures an increase from 139,780 to 288,549. While some of this rise is accounted for by a rise in the number of married women in the population, most of it came from increased availability of work and the greater willingness or need of married women to engage in employment.

As it was thought that a trend of this kind, coupled with the obvious differences in the circumstances of married and single women, might have led to employers making special provisions for married women, a survey was conducted to discover if this were so. The survey was confined to manufacturing industry, which employs about a quarter of all working women, and probably about the same proportion of working married women.

Twenty-two companies participated in the survey . . . [which] examined differences in the employment conditions of married and single women. While some differences were found in recruitment and retrenchment policies, none were found in policies concerning concessions and amenities. While some concessions were taken advantage of more often by married than by single women, the formal or implicit policy of each company was that all positions were available to all members of staff. (From *Personnel Practice Bulletin*, December, 1959.)

## personnel

## opinions

**I**MPORTANT QUESTIONS of personnel policy and practice seldom yield "cut-and-dried" answers. The editors have posed the question below to several persons representing different points of view to give readers guidelines in formulating their own policies.

## THE QUESTION

**"Is it desirable as a matter of broad public policy to facilitate mobility in the public service by enabling employees to transfer retirement credits from one retirement system to another?"**

**Says A. A. WEINBERG . . .**

*Chairman, Committee on Public Employee Retirement Administration of the Municipal Finance Officers Association of the U. S. and Canada, Chicago*

As a forerunner to any discussion of this subject, it would be well to review the basic purposes and objectives of a retirement system. These have been described by the Illinois Public Employees Pension Laws Commission as follows:

Retirement plans for public employees are undertaken to meet personnel efficiency objectives and social security purposes. As an employer, one of the functions of government is to promote efficiency and economy in administration by encouraging continuity of employment among its workers. It is also considered a legitimate objective of government to provide, without too great a public burden, for the socio-economic needs of its employees under the three major hazards facing its workers, namely, superannuation, disability and death.

The increasing complexity of governmental functions makes it of utmost importance to secure and hold the best type of personnel. A retirement plan helps to bring this about by making public employment a career for those attracted to the service who hesitate to enter into or to continue in such service because of the lack of a definite prospect of financial independence during their declining years.

The increasing inter-dependence among the various levels of government, occurring during recent years, dictates the need for greater mobility within public administration. Mobility will tend to encourage employees of proved ability and experience, possessing special talents and skills, to continue to serve the public to the end that maximum efficiency in all governmental operations may be achieved. Public administration, therefore, must be viewed in its broadest aspects, without reference to geographical boundaries, rather than in terms of the particular state or local governmental unit.

Over the long term it is conceivable and within the realm of probability that, under intra-state or inter-state reciprocity, either or both, a balance in migration, as between governmental units, may be attained, thus avoiding the imposition of disproportionate pension burdens upon any one governmental unit or any one state. It may take many years for such a balance to be reached, at least in a substantial form, but pensions are of long-term character and must be viewed in that light.

Intra-state reciprocity of pension credit is being planned in an increasing number of states. This is easier of accomplishment because of the closer working relationship among the several intra-state governmental units and the greater similarity of local policies. Inter-state reciprocity in the matter of



pension credits is more difficult to achieve since it will involve a much greater cooperative effort and the assumption of increased financial burdens in the financing of vesting rights in pension credits.

It is desirable as a matter of broad public policy to attempt to facilitate mobility and permit the accrual of retirement credits for all public employment in fulfillment of our national purpose and to achieve effective public administration at all levels of government and in all areas. Employees should be permitted (but not encouraged) to seek employment in public administration wherever their talents can be utilized to the greatest advantage. Public employers, likewise, should find it possible to recruit such personnel as may be required to improve the standards of their service.

The question arises as to whether the accrual of pension credits for all public employment is feasible, considering the variances existing in the benefit schedules, qualifying conditions, and other policy standards. In our opinion, these variances and apparent disparities in provisions are not so striking as to be regarded as serious deterrents to mobility.

Standards in pension policy are tending toward greater uniformity throughout the country, resulting in increased adequacy at all levels of government and for all occupational groups of public employees. This is a concomitant of the underlying economic and social trends during recent years. This trend may partially be attributed to the extension of social security to public employees. This is one important factor that is responsible for the revision of retirement benefits to greater adequacy, and the leveling of rates of benefit and qualifying conditions aiming at the attainment of standardization and uniformity.

Mobility is more prominent in some occupational classifications than in others. In the teaching profession, this trend is more prevalent than in other areas of public employment. The Teachers Insurance and Annuity Association has met this problem in the case of members of the academic staffs of colleges by its provisions for full vesting of pension credits without any prescribed qualifying period of service. This associa-

tion has in its membership the great majority of colleges in the United States, both public and private.

The subject of vesting gives rise to the problem of financing—a problem which transcends all others in any consideration of the accrual of pension credits to facilitate mobility in the public service. Vesting in a *functional* sense refers to a provision in a retirement plan whereby rights of an employee in the prescribed retirement benefit become effective after a specified period of service. Vesting in a *legal* sense means the creation of an undeniable legal right in an earned and accrued pension expectancy. If an accrued pension credit is to be provided as a vested right which is legally defensible, then the funds for the financing thereof must be properly allocated.

Vesting of pension credits implies full funding and is definitely interlocked with the financing of the retirement credits. This factor of financing takes prominence in the formulation of any plan to facilitate mobility. Because of this financial factor, only partial mobility may be achieved in most areas. Full vesting of pension credit from the first day of service may not be possible because of the financial burdens involved.

The financial obligation which vesting entails has made it necessary to prescribe a reasonably long period of service as a condition precedent to vesting, say 10, 15, or 20 years. With such qualifying periods in effect, mobility is curtailed and employees not having attained the minimum period of service are prevented from transferring employment to other areas of public administration.

To facilitate mobility and overcome the shortcomings of the plan of vesting, provision is frequently made for the purchase, by the employees, of direct pension credit. Such a plan is found in many teachers' retirement systems. Under this form of plan, a teacher terminates membership in the retirement system upon separation from service of one employer. He then is permitted to purchase pension credit for service with the first employer by a payment to the retirement system of the second employer equal in amount to the member's contribution in the second employer's retirement



system. Since the teacher's contributions may represent only about 30 to 50 per cent of the total cost of such pension credit, the second employer actually pays a premium for employment of the teacher by matching the teacher's contributions for the purpose of providing the full cost of the pension credit so purchased.

The foregoing plan of direct purchase is perhaps the most desirable arrangement from the standpoint of both the employees and employers. The employee is able to receive full pension credit for all previous service as contrasted with the requirement of a minimum service period under a plan of vesting. The employee also has his pension credit translated at retirement in the form of a benefit related in some measure to his earnings just prior to retirement. In the case of vesting, the pension benefit is predicated upon the earnings and formula in effect at the date of his previous separation from service which may have been some years prior to his retirement. Thus the pension expectancy, consisting of his previous vested benefit and the amount earned as an employee of the second employer, may be deficient or inadequate according to standards existing at the date of the employee's retirement.

From the standpoint of an employer, the direct purchase of pension credit has advantages because the last employer, who stands to receive the value of the employee's developed skills and experience, would pay therefor by assuming his proper share of the cost of the pension credit purchased by the employee. The plan has merit in that it distributes the cost burden equitably, and places that burden where it properly belongs.

The plan of direct purchase of pension credit may be open to serious legal question in many states. It may be challenged on the ground that the assumption of a financial obligation by the state or local government might be in conflict with certain constitutional or statutory provisions. This is a factor which has probably militated against the widespread adoption of this plan.

The continued operation of federal social security and its increasing extension to public employees may result in increased mo-

bility among public employees because of the full vesting feature of that program. Although social security provides for only part of an employee's pension expectancy, its operation has already had a profound effect in the formulation of pension policy for public employees with respect to vesting and other features of employee retirement plans.

The indicated basic trend is toward shorter periods of vesting of pension credits. This trend, aided by direct pension credit arrangements, wherever possible, may result, over a period of time, in greater mobility among public employees.

Says WARD ASHMAN . . .

*Executive Secretary, School Employees Retirement System, Columbus, Ohio*

A principal objective in the broad and ample benefits in public employee retirement systems is to provide fringe benefits whereby public employment can compete with private employment in obtaining and retaining capable employees. The pursuit of this objective would deter mobility in public service, rather than encourage it. However, we are a mobile nation today, and it would be folly to ignore this fact. If mobility can be used to serve this objective, then it is desirable.

I would look at the "matter of broad public policy" from the viewpoint of the particular public employer who is seeking to obtain and retain capable public employees to carry forward the particular public policy involved.

Assuming the desirability of "enabling employees to transfer retirement credits from one retirement system to another," as qualified above, the next question is whether such transfer is possible or feasible.

In pursuing the possibility or feasibility of such a transfer, we must look to the media of the transfer. Some systems are financed and administered on the local level, others on the state level, and still others on the federal level; not all have the three basic benefits—retirement, disability, and survivor. Some provide these three basic benefits, while others use some combination with Social Security.

The same benefit formulas in two or more systems are a rarity. In fact, to my knowledge, only the three Ohio Plan Systems have identical benefits and benefit formulas. Some have mandatory retirement ages, while in others it is optional. Some provide vesting or deferred benefit allowances after separation from service based upon benefit credits at the time of separation, while others cancel all benefit credits upon separation. Very few systems have the same member contribution rate, and these rates may be a combination with Social Security. Few, if any, have the same employer contribution rate; some systems will not refund employee contributions upon separation from service, while others provide only a partial refund. Some are on a funded or actuarial basis, others are on a pay-as-you-go basis. If the above does not present near insurmountable obstacles, then consider the further complications of reciprocity between inter-state systems.

With all these complications, I would like to point out what the state of Ohio has done to implement the desirability of obtaining and retaining capable public employees through mobility. The policy has been to use the Ohio Plan Retirement Systems to: (1) encourage recruitment from private employment through broad and ample benefits; (2) encourage recruitment of out-of-state public employees through the benefits provided, and by recognizing and granting certain benefit credits for such public employment; (3) provide complete mobility in the employment area covered by these systems; and (4) provide deferred benefits to those employees desiring to seek employment outside these systems without making the separation too attractive.

The three Ohio Plan Systems cover in excess of a quarter-million public employees, excepting policemen, firemen, and highway patrolmen. Specifically, these systems cover: (1) teachers and faculty members in public schools and colleges; (2) non-teachers and non-faculty members in public schools and colleges; and (3) state, county, city, other governmental agency employees, and the judiciary.

Retirement, disability and survivor benefits are provided, and these benefits and

employee contributions are identical in all three systems. Members of the systems can purchase credit for similar service rendered in other states and the District of Columbia. They can move freely within employment covered by the systems, and all service and contributions are merged for benefit purposes just as if the employee had been covered by one system during his entire working career.

Members leaving the coverage of the systems can withdraw their contributions at any time, thereby canceling all membership and benefit credits, or leave the contributions on deposit and retain all benefit credits, within certain limitations, for which they were eligible at the time of separation from service. The limitations are (1) that the retirement benefit is reduced if the member has less than three years of Ohio Plan service within the ten years immediately prior to the date of retirement, (2) the survivor benefit is canceled if the member has less than one-quarter year of service within the two years prior to death, and (3) the disability benefit is canceled if the disability did not exist prior to the expiration of a one-year period following the last date of Ohio Plan service.

Assuming the desirability of the policy, a plan for a transfer of credits is not only possible and feasible, but has been accomplished with further refinements expected in the future. However, it is doubtful if such transfers can be accomplished on a reciprocal basis. It seems only possible through the objectives of the receiving system as incorporated in its laws and regulations.

**Says PATRICK HEALY, JR. . . .**

*Executive Director, American Municipal Association, Washington, D. C.*

Most of you are familiar with the careful process followed by the American Municipal Association in formulating its annual national policy statements. The thoroughness of the process and the wide representation of municipalities at the annual "American Municipal Congress" guarantee that these statements reflect the general position of municipal governments on matters of wide

## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

public interest. I should like to quote in full from AMA's 1960 *National Municipal Policy* on the question of transfer of retirement benefits from one system to another:

An inadequate number of capable young persons are preparing for careers in government. One reason for this is that state and local retirement systems do not encourage a career system. A professional employee has no incentive to move from smaller communities to larger cities with more responsibility and pay when every time he moves, he loses the accumulated retirement benefits and receives only the amount which he paid into the fund, plus a small amount of interest. In other positions, as in the ministry for example, an individual may move from one community to another in the same state, or to other states, and carry his retirement benefits with him. This is true also of librarians and most university and college faculty members throughout the country. Faculty members are participants in the Teacher's Insurance Annuity Association of America. The adoption of legislation by states to permit transfer of benefits through some sort of clearing house would benefit all local governments because it would encourage mobility and, therefore, professionalization of the service which, in turn, would attract capable young men to prepare for government service.

Two-thirds or more of the states have adopted statewide retirement systems for public employees including officers and employees of local governments. Such state-administered retirement systems eventually will be available in all or most of the states of the Union; and there is an increasing professionalization of the public service with attendant promotions to positions of larger responsibility between local units within the state and other states. Therefore, the American Municipal Association encourages officials of local governments to work through their state league of municipalities in obtaining legislation at the state level which would make possible the transfer of retirement benefits accumulated by officers and employees to another government position in the same state or in some other state, such transfers to include payments made by the officer or employee into the retirement fund and also payments made by the municipality.

Historically, retirement systems in municipal government were designed primarily to attract persons to service in local government, to retain them during their productive working lives, and to move them out

at the end of that period to open up career opportunities for others. Most of these came about as a means of making it easier for governments to compete with private enterprise for administrative and technical talent. As most major industries adopted retirement systems, it became more and more necessary for governments to do the same.

The post World War II years have witnessed a steady expansion of retirement systems in local governments. At the present time, almost 1,900 municipalities have such systems. Taken together with local employees covered by state systems, the 1957 Census of Governments indicates that almost three million local governmental employees are now under a retirement system. It is my belief that these systems have now become so common that they have lost most of their importance as a means of attracting and retaining personnel.

As retirement systems have lost much of their competitive value, they have developed a negative influence which is also consistently growing. In other realms, as the policy statement quoted above has indicated, retirement rights can be transferred; and the non-transferability feature of the retirement systems of local governments poses a sizeable obstacle to the ability of employees to move both horizontally and vertically.

Paralleling this development has been a shift in the manpower needs of local governments, due to factors and forces of urban change, much too numerous and complex to discuss here, which have put a premium on the acquisition of highly trained persons for positions of administrative and technical responsibility.

Local governments are in competition with all of private enterprise and other levels of government for the best trained and most competent persons to combat the complexities of modern life. It stands to reason that if these people can move freely from position to position in non-local governmental jobs, and cannot move freely from jurisdiction to jurisdiction to take advantage of greater opportunities in the governmental sphere, municipalities will be at a competitive disadvantage with others.

I think this is especially true of the younger people, who are choosing between

careers that become more and more glamorous and challenging as the years go by. These people want the opportunity to grow, they want open-ended opportunities, they want the ability to move. This certainly means the ability to move horizontally and vertically within the realm of governmental service.

Such mobility of personnel is not of importance just to the employees themselves. In this era of specialization and rapid change, every employer would be helped by a system which makes it possible to get the right man at the right time in the right job. Mobility and flexibility appear to be features of American life that are coming to characterize most of our relationships. It is my belief that the increase in the ability to transfer retirement rights from one jurisdiction to another, even between levels of government, would provide mobility and flexibility in the governmental personnel field that would be most advantageous to the people working in government, and of even greater importance to the governments themselves.

I am not unaware of the sizeable legal and financial problems involved in eliminating disparities and in building the legal framework for a system which will facilitate transference of pension credits between levels of government. I am certain these problems are not insuperable. The general progress being made in cooperation between states, the increasing interest in uniform state laws, and the success within several states of systems of intra-state transference of pension credits, all appear to justify optimism that inter-state and inter-level arrangements can be perfected.

Says EVELYN SHOLUND . . .

*Executive Secretary, Public School Teachers' Pension and Retirement Fund of Chicago, Illinois*

This question represents a matter which has been referred to retirement administrators frequently in recent years. An increased interest in the subject of reciprocity on the part of public administrators and members of public employee retirement systems undoubtedly is due to the challenge of the

Social Security program, which offers full continuity of service credits for transfers within covered employment, and to the impact of an inflationary economy on pension expectancies.

The *desirability* of facilitating mobility in public service by providing continuity of retirement credits is strictly a personnel matter which must be determined by the employer and not by the retirement system or the employees. This consideration is basic not only to an analysis of this subject but also to an evaluation of any proposal for revising the scope or amount of benefits from a retirement system.

The reason for emphasis on this point is that public personnel administration, in general, appears to have been seriously lacking in its understanding of the personnel implications of pensions and consequently has failed to fulfill certain responsibilities. As a result: public administration has not recognized the full advantages of a retirement system for its employees; arguments for additional revenue to finance revisions in benefits are too often not persuasive; and legal and technical obstacles are accepted as representations of insurmountable hurdles.

On the other hand, if a proposal, such as the one presently under consideration, were shown to result in more efficient personnel administration, public support probably could be obtained and effective techniques developed.

There is little doubt that the preservation of all or part of retirement credits would facilitate mobility in public service, but the desirability of such mobility may differ according to the occupational group. Continuity of pension credit would be advantageous for the particular governmental body if the public personnel administrator can say "Yes" to such questions as: Would recruitment of experienced personnel be facilitated? Would efficiency in administration be increased? Would continuity of pension credit have the effect of augmenting the field of public service? Would more job opportunities be created? Would capable recruits be attracted to the field of public service? Would there be greater motivation for young people to train for career employment in public service? Does outside experi-

ence in one field of public administration enhance the qualifications of prospective employees seeking positions in other types of governmental service? Would turnover in personnel be reduced? Would the increased availability of trained and experienced recruits improve morale . . . facilitate retirement of superannuated employees, etc.?"

These questions are general in nature and are presented only to illustrate what type of "test" might be made to determine the desirability of perpetuating and transferring pension credits.

Due to the professional character of the teaching service and the career aspects of the employment, school administrators throughout the country have advocated reciprocity of pension credits for many years. Consequently, the majority of teacher retirement systems in the United States offer protection on a limited basis, at least, to teachers who transfer from one public school system to another.

A recent study of these systems reveals a lack of uniformity in methods and a wide variance in the amount of retirement credits which can be transferred from one system to another, or otherwise preserved. Nevertheless, a study of these operations has value for those who are interested in this subject. The experiences of the teacher retirement systems not only reveal the complexities of this problem but also indicate certain factors which appear to facilitate the preservation of pension credits.

An analysis of teacher retirement systems reveals a wide disparity in the types of plans, the methods of financing, and legal restrictions. Obviously, the differences between retirement systems within a given state are less in these respects than between systems of other states. In some states, where constitutional limitations prohibit retroactive increases in benefits after service was rendered, it has been held that pension rights are fixed at the time contributions were made. However, in at least two states, constitutions have been amended recently to eliminate such restrictions; in others, court decisions appear to have become more liberal in their interpretation of vested pension rights of public employees.

Some retirement systems refund the employees' contributions—either with or without interest—but, in most cases, refunds on termination or transfer of employment are limited to the employees' contributions without interest. No retirement systems permit transfers of employer and employee contributions to other public employee retirement systems in another state. However, seven states do provide for such transfers on an interstate basis. In these cases, the retirement plans appear to be essentially the same and preservation of pension credits offers no problem. If an employee transfers from one system to another having exactly the same benefit provisions, the total pension expectancy would be the same as if there had been no transfer.

Most of the teacher retirement systems use several methods for preserving the pension credits of teachers regardless of whether the transfers are within or without the state. One method is by "vesting" pension rights after a prescribed period of service. The majority of such systems pay a deferred pension at age 60 after ten years of service. The service requirements for "vesting" may range from a minimum of five years to a maximum of thirty years, and the minimum age for payment of the pension from 55 to 70 years.

The advantages of this method are (1) that no transfers of monies are required and (2) that differences in retirement formulae of the various systems are unimportant. The great disadvantage lies in the fact that the deferred pensions are related to the economy, salaries, and standards in force at the time of transfer rather than at the time of retirement. Since pensions at best reflect only a fraction of final salary, this method usually results in a low rate of pension and therefore offers only a limited amount of protection to persons transferring from one system to another.

In addition to the "deferred pension" method, many teacher retirement systems permit the purchase of direct credit for outside teaching service. Most systems limit the amount of such service credit to ten years. The range appears to be a minimum of five years and a maximum of total serv-



ice. This method has the advantage of not requiring a transfer of public money. Furthermore, it permits the additional time to be used as a basis for increasing the pension according to the salary and formula in force at the time of retirement.

It should be pointed out, however, that this method produces the most favorable results in systems operating on a fixed benefit formula, which provides a pension based on average salary for the last few years of service—usually five. Teachers' payments for such credits generally are related to rates of salary and contributions in force at the time of the transfer. The additional financial responsibility, assumed by the last system, is explained and justified as a necessary cost of recruiting trained and experienced teachers, thereby improving the operation of the public school system.

In conclusion, it should be emphasized

that the desirability of preserving pension credits must be determined first by personnel administrators in terms of their needs to recruit and retain employees in public service. In general, the mechanics can be facilitated by standardizing contribution and benefit provisions of public employee retirement systems and by permitting the last retirement system to use total credits in the computation of pensions, preferably on a reciprocal basis.

Actual transfers of service and contribution credits between systems appear impractical, but employees can be expected to share the financial obligation of the retirement system which accepts "outside" credits. Although this problem involves many complexities, its solution is not insurmountable, provided the objectives are recognized as an aid to efficient public administration.

### Questions First—Shoot Later . . .

Originality in finding a solution to a problem is a desirable goal, but in practical everyday problem-solving, complete newness of pure originality, is usually not needed or may not even, in fact, be wanted. The creative attribute of originality can be developed, to the point where it meets the requirements of successful business operations. The secret is in the systematic use of questions. One of the most noticeable characteristics of highly creative people is their overwhelming curiosity. They are always questioning the things they see around them, but such a questioning approach to life is largely a matter of habit, therefore, it is something that can be learned. The object of creative questioning is to uncover new possibilities for better ways of doing things. The person who asks a creative question does so with the intention of trying to find the answer himself. Here a checklist of operational questions that challenge the obvious aspects of a problem can be helpful, but just a mechanical use of a checklist does not produce originality. The purpose of such questions is to provide challenges to the obvious ways of doing things.—From the *NIMC News Letter*, May, 1960.

the

## bookshelf

**The Scientist in American Industry: Some Organizational Determinants in Manpower Utilization.** Simon Marcson. Industrial Relations Section, Princeton University, P. O. Box 248, Princeton, N. J., 1960. ix, 158 pp. \$3.00.

This is the first of a series of studies of organizational environments as they affect scientific personnel in industry, in government laboratories, and in universities throughout the country. Dealing with the problems encountered by the scientist in industry, the present study's central theme is the need for entirely new principles of management in the industrial research laboratory. Of interest to the personnel man is the section on "Means of Recruitment."

**Organizing Your Job in Management.** Carl Heyel. American Management Association, 1515 Broadway, New York 36, N. Y., 1960. 208 pp. \$5.25/AMA members: \$3.50.

A handbook written to show managers the way to more profitable use of their time, how to direct tensions into productive channels, analyze their work habits, get the most out of meetings and conferences, and delegate assignments effectively.

**Police Systems in the United States** (2nd rev. ed.). Bruce Smith (revised by Bruce Smith, Jr.). Harper and Brothers, 49 East 33rd St., New York 16, N. Y., 1960. xiv, 338 pp. \$6.00.

A new edition of the handbook on law enforcement first published in 1940. Covering such important aspects of American police systems as their structural organization and operational costs; the regional distribution of crime, which has undergone a great change in late years; property losses and recoveries; arrests and convictions; police training, promotion, and compensation, it includes the latest changes and improvements in procedure as well as an entirely new chapter on municipal police patrol supervision. Twelve charts and graphs, four tables, and an index are included.

**Modern Organization Theory: A Symposium of the Foundation for Research on Human Behavior.** Mason Haire, Editor. John Wiley and Sons, 440 Fourth Avenue, New York 16, N. Y., 1959. x, 324 pp. \$7.75.

A collection of 11 papers first read at a symposium held in February, 1959, by the Foundation for Research on Human Behavior at Ann Arbor, Michigan, representing a diverse range of ideas on the latest and most significant factors in research and theory related to organizations. Topics and contributors are: "Introduction—Recurrent Themes and General Issues in Organization Theory," Mason Haire; "Concept of the Social Organization," E. Wight Bakke; "A Behavioral Theory of Organizational Objectives," R. M. Cyert and J. G. March; "A Logical Task as a Research Tool in Organization Theory," Anatol Rapoport; "Understanding Human Behavior in Organizations: One Viewpoint," Chris Argyris; "An Interaction Approach to the Theory of Organization," William Foote Whyte; "A Motivation Approach to a Modified Theory of Organization and Management," Rensis Likert; "Stability of Human Organizations," Robert Dubin; "The Potential Contribution of Graph Theory to Organization Theory," Dorwin Cartwright; "Biological Models and Empirical Histories of the Growth of Organizations," Mason Haire; "Efficient and Viable Organizational Forms," Jacob Marschak.

**America's Capacity to Govern: Some Preliminary Thoughts for Prospective Administrators.** George A. Graham. University of Alabama Press, University, Alabama, 1960. xiv, 159 pp. \$3.00.

A series of lectures given by the author in Tuscaloosa, Alabama, in 1958 to students of the Southern Regional Training Program then at the University of Alabama, this small volume asks whether man can by nature govern and be governed and whether democratic government is consistent with man's nature. Chapter 4, "Leadership and the Public Service" (pp. 83-123), discusses the problem of supplying the kind of creative leadership in the national administration that the United States needs if it is to keep up with the demands of the times. Other chapters are "Is Man a Political Animal?"; "Is Democracy Viable?"; "How Can Capacity to Govern Be Measured?"; "How Good is the Best Society?"

**Classics in Management.** Edited by Harwood F. Merrill. American Management Association, 1515 Broadway, New York 36, N. Y., 1960. 446 pp. \$9.00/ AMA members: \$6.00.

A collection of writings by 16 pioneers of management heretofore unavailable "under one roof." Beginning with Robert Owen (1771-1858) and concluding with George Elton Mayo (1880-1949), this anthology provides the professional manager with a useful history of management philosophy written by the makers of that history. Each selection is preceded by a brief statement about the author to follow, and about the times in which he practiced his profession. A valuable selected bibliography of other works of each of the authors is also included.

### PERSONNEL BIBLIOGRAPHY

This feature is possible through the cooperation of the U.S. Civil Service Commission. It was prepared by the staff of the Commission's Library under the direction of Mrs. Elaine Woodruff, Librarian. Selections are made on the basis of (1) general availability, (2) pertinence to the public service generally, and (3) recency of material.

### Recruitment for the Public Service

#### Executive and Administrative Personnel—Public Service

Corson, John J.

Executives for the federal service; a program for action in time of crisis. New York, Columbia University Press, 1952. 91 pp.

Pinpoints the critical nature of the lack of an adequate career system for top-ranking civilian executives. Tells what numbers and types of executives are needed, how they are recruited, and problems involved in retaining and utilizing them.

Harvard Business School Club of Washington, D. C.

Business in government; an appraisal of experience. Washington, D. C., 1958. 44 pp.

Study was undertaken to determine what part businessmen play in government at the present time and what their future role should be. Recommends that government, political leaders, business, and education coordinate their activities in order to recruit the best qualified men for government service.

## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

Lawlis, Don C., and Preston P. LeBreton.

Meeting the manpower requirements of a state government. *Public personnel review*, vol. 21, no. 1, January 1960, pp. 33-35.

Recommends that states combine manpower forecasting, source analysis, and active recruiting in order to obtain the best qualified personnel to staff their agencies.

Mandell, Milton M.

Obtaining administrative personnel for defense agencies. *Public administration review*, vol. 16, no. 4, Autumn 1956, pp. 269-271.

Discussion of procedures and results of U. S. Civil Service Commission's federal administrator exam announced during the Korean emergency for the purpose of identifying federal employees with administrative ability at grades 12 and above for possible transfer to defense agencies.

Meyner, Robert B.

Recruitment of young professionals for state government. *State government*, vol. 29, no. 6, June 1956, pp. 99-101, 114.

Tells how the New Jersey State Civil Service recruited new young blood for entrance positions, and lists the strongest "selling" points for public employment in New Jersey.

### Personnel opinions.

What factors need to be weighed by the personnel agency and the operating department in reaching a decision on filling a key upper level vacancy either (a) by closed promotion from below; (b) by opening it up to other local residents; or (c) by recruiting without residence restrictions? *Public personnel review*, vol. 16, no. 3, July 1955, pp. 174-177.

Four public administrators express their views. Consensus is that getting competent person is major objective and using promotion from within is most desirable if competent persons are available.

Piatt, Richard B.

Nationwide recruitment for a personnel director. *Public personnel review*, vol. 19, no. 4, October 1958, pp. 289-295.

Summary of procedures and costs of St. Louis' nationwide recruitment for a personnel director for its Sewer District. Includes tables and discussion of drafting job specification, analysis of applications, tests and their preparation, and interviewing.

U. S. Congress. Senate. Committee on Government Operations.  
Subcommittee on National Policy Machinery.

Mobilizing talent for government service. *In* Organizing for national security. Hearings . . . 86th Congress, 2nd Session, May 11-13, 1960. Part III. Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1960, pp. 413-558.

Focuses upon problems of recruiting and retaining topflight political executives for government service.

Statement by Chairman Jones, U. S. Civil Service Commission, examines some of the present practices which make it difficult to obtain and retain both political and career personnel, pp. 434-454.

### Executive and Administrative Personnel—Business and Industry

Acme reporter. (Periodical)

Recruiting for potential executives. New York, Association of Consulting Management Engineers, Inc., 1958. 5 pp.

Lists and discusses important steps in a recruiting program to select, solicit, and hire top manpower.

Charlebois, Joseph A., and Lawrence C. Hackamack.

Personnel managers discuss management manpower questions. *Personnel journal*, vol. 37, no. 6, November 1958, pp. 213-216.

Interviews with ten personnel managers of the Springfield, Massachusetts, area reveal their feelings regarding the shortage of managerial talent, and their methods of recruitment.

Gellerman, Saul.

Where to find action-getters. *Nation's business*, vol. 47, no. 10, October 1959, pp. 88-90.

Measures which will help a company to find and develop self-starters include: (1) Organize a search; (2) Learns to identify latent initiative; (3) Make the company attractive to enterprising men.

Habbe, Stephen.

What about executive recruiters? *Management record*, vol. 18, no. 2, February 1956, pp. 42-44.

Presents both pro and con opinions on the advisability of making use of firms which devote full time to the business of finding executives for companies.

How firms will recruit new managers.

*Management methods*, vol. 18, no. 4, July 1960, pp. 20-22.

Survey among sampling of American Management Association members shows types of executives most in demand, methods used to procure them, and advantages and disadvantages of using a search firm. Article includes a six-point plan for reference checking of executive resumes.

Larke, Alfred G.

New look in management recruiting. *Dun's review and Modern industry*, vol. 67, no. 5, May 1956, pp. 52-54.

Reports that business is recruiting more and more from the liberal arts colleges since it has found that it is as "easy (or easier) to train a liberal arts man in what specialized knowledge he may require as an administrator, as it is to convert the man with specialized education into a generalist." Tells in some detail how Scott Paper Company, Chester, Pa., conducts its recruitment in this area.

Larke, Alfred G.

Picking executives for their big blue eyes. *Dun's review and Modern industry*, vol. 67, no. 1, January 1956, pp. 42-44.

Examines some of the mistakes made by companies when recruiting for executive positions. Points out that many traits which cause people to be rejected for a position have nothing to do with ability to handle an executive job. Many executive recruiters are cool toward tests of various kinds that are intended to determine psychological or other kinds of fitness for administrative jobs when they are used as sole judge.

McMurry, Robert N.

How to pick capable men. *Nation's business*, vol. 48, no. 2, February 1960, pp. 48-50, 52, 56.

Presents principles to be followed in carrying out an effective recruitment and development program for middle and top-level personnel.

Maurer, Herrymon.

The worst shortage in business. *Fortune*, vol. 53, no. 4, April 1956, pp. 147-149, 200, 202, 204, 206, 209.

Points out that while shortage of well trained scientists and engineers is acute, the dearth



## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

of management talent in all fields is as critical and will probably remain so. Advocates planned program for obtaining college-trained men picked according to ability to hold starting jobs at supervisory levels and for potential capacity to fill middle and top management posts. Examines trends in industry which show how various companies select, utilize and advance college graduates.

### National Industrial Conference Board, Inc.

Selecting company executives. New York, 1957. 54 pp. (Studies in personnel policy no. 161)

Reports on practices which selected companies are following in locating, selecting, and identifying executive talent.

### Strong, Lydia.

Executives wanted: the managerial manhunt. Management review, vol. 46, no. 2, February 1957, pp. 53-68.

The shortage of executive personnel continues, forcing companies to recruit from the outside by means of business contacts, personal recommendations, advertising, consulting firms, and commercial employment agencies. Discusses the cost of this type of recruiting and how it can best be done.

## Scientists and Engineers

### Baumgartner, Leona.

New needs and old personnel methods. Good government, vol. 74, no. 1, January-February 1957, pp. 1-4.

A frank diagnosis of the failings of civil service in today's competitive struggle to attract and hold scientific and technical talent. Emphasizes the problems of the New York City Health Department.

### Canada. Department of Labor. Information and Publicity Branch.

Wanted . . . more experts! Ottawa, 1958. 54 pp.

Eleven leading Canadian executives from fields of industry, education, science, and government give their views on questions concerning the supply and demand of technical and professional manpower.

### Curtis, McDonald H.

How to recruit engineers. Public personnel review, vol. 15, no. 2, April 1954, pp. 67-71.

Describes development of engineering recruitment service organized by Los Angeles County Civil Service Department in an attempt to solve problem of engineer shortage.

### Drury, Peter J.

What we are doing about the engineering manpower shortage. New York State Department of Civil Service, 1956. 3 pp.

Tells how New York State Department of Civil Service developed a new classification and salary plan, streamlined hiring procedures, and instituted a vigorous recruitment program.

### Fogiel, Max.

Attracting and keeping engineers. Personnel journal, vol. 38, no. 10, March 1960, pp. 377-381, 385.

Stresses importance of proper hiring techniques, and establishment of policies for correct use of engineering employees. Examines job specification, advertising for engineers, arranging for interviews, evaluating applicants, stockpiling and use of engineers.

**Industrial Research Institute.**

Research is people; a discussion of the recruitment, motivation, recognition, rating, and evaluation of research personnel. New York, 1956. 69 pp.

Partial contents: Recruiting top-ranking college and graduate students, by F. C. Nix; A professor looks at recruiting, by E. M. Schoenhorn; How to hire the wrong man, by G. N. P. Leetch; It's a job to find a job, by R. D. Crozier.

**Irons, Warren B.**

"Uncle Sam's talent hunt." Government employees' exchange, vol. 12, no. 26, July 22, 1959, pp. 1, 7, 12.

Describes operation and results of two specialized recruitment programs designed to attract scientific and management talent to government service: the Federal Service Entrance Examination and the Research Scientist Examination.

**Jones, Roger W.**

Innovations in the federal personnel process for meeting scientific manpower needs of the government. In U. S. Civil Service Commission, Recruiting scientists and engineers for the United States Civil Service. Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1959. pp. 42-46.

Outlines responsibilities of the U. S. Civil Service Commission for recruiting and retaining scientists, sums up steps taken to improve the recruiting situation, and indicates what remains to be done.

**Lester, D. R., and John J. Wright.**

What GE learned from its technical recruiting program. Personnel, vol. 34, no. 1, July-August 1957, pp. 23-31.

Cites General Electric's experience while recruiting technical personnel for its Evendale plant, and points out the effectiveness of various recruiting sources and methods.

**Oganovic, Nicholas J.**

Requirements of the federal government for scientists and engineers. In U. S. National Science Foundation. Scientific manpower—1958. Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1959, pp. 41-44. (NSF 59-37)

Cites the federal government's improved recruitment situation insofar as scientific and engineering personnel is concerned, the reasons for this, and the need for continued emphasis on quality in recruitment.

**Siciliano, Rocco C.**

Meeting the scientific manpower problem. In U. S. Civil Service Commission, Recruiting scientists and engineers for the United States Civil Service. Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1959, pp. 11-12.

Considers factors in addition to pay which inhibit the government's recruiting program. Calls attention to progress which has been made and points out some of the challenges and opportunities offered by the federal service.

**Skamser, Harold P.**

Ivory hunting. Journal of college placement, vol. 17, no. 1, October 1956, pp. 81-82, 94.

Suggests means for getting engineering students interested in opportunities offered by less well-known companies. Also lists some of the factors which seem to have most influence in deciding the student about his place of work.

## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

Torpey, William G.

A measure of shortage of scientific personnel. Public personnel review, vol. 18, no. 2, April 1957, pp. 104-108.

Reviews briefly "the use of a special placement facility of the American Institute of Physics as a direct recruiting technique" and describes the experience of the Naval Research Laboratory with this recruitment facility.

U. S. Civil Service Commission.

Flexibility in the federal personnel system; a guide to more effective recruitment and retention of scientists and engineers. Prepared by Lewis E. Vaughan. Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1958. 22 pp. (Personnel management series no. 14)

Describes a number of positive steps the U. S. Civil Service Commission has taken to facilitate examining and recruitment of scientists and engineers for federal government positions.

U. S. Civil Service Commission.

Recruiting scientists and engineers for the United States Civil Service. Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1959. 46 pp.

Report of proceedings of a Conference on Scientific Manpower, Washington, D. C., April 28-29, 1959.

Partial contents: Enhancing the competitive position of the federal government in the acquisition and retention of scientific talent, by Dr. Ralph D. Bennett; Improving the government's scientific service, by Dr. James R. Killian, Jr.; Selecting for quality (panel discussion); Creativity and technological process, by Dr. C. Guy Suits; Identifying research potential through the examining process, by Dr. John G. Darley.

U. S. Congress. House. Committee on Post Office and Civil Service.  
Subcommittee on Manpower Utilization.

Personnel procurement costs of selected defense contractors for recruitment of engineers and scientists, fiscal year 1959. Washington, D. C., U. S. Govt. Print. Off., 1960. 9 pp. (H. com. print, 86th Cong., 2nd sess.)

U. S. Department of the Air Force.

Help meet labor market shortages in professional skills. Washington, D. C., 1959. 16 pp. (Air Force pamphlet no. 40-15-4)

Suggestions as to how Air Force installations can aid in attracting recruits into those fields in which personnel shortages are acute: engineering, science, and technology.

Williams, Douglas.

Attracting topflight scientists and engineers. Personnel, vol. 34, no. 6, May-June 1958, pp. 79-81.

Lists 13 criteria commonly used by professional people in appraising an institution as an employer, or potential employer.

### College Graduates—Public Service

Frye, Don B.

The government's recruiting handicap—real or myth? Journal of college placement, vol. 20, no. 3, February 1960, pp. 28-29, 100, 102.

The habit of "viewing with alarm" the inability of the government to obtain top college graduates to staff agencies needs to be reconsidered. As an example, a case history of the successful Housing and Home Finance Agency recruiting program is presented. While this particular agency has some peculiar advantages such as small size, locations, glamour, and opportunity, other federal government agencies have also developed worthwhile recruiting programs.

Pockrass, Jack.

A better mousetrap for college recruitment. *Personnel administration*, vol. 18, no. 4, July 1955, pp. 10-13.

Outlines program for streamlining recruitment, examination and appointment job. Recommends practical innovations in areas of examination, contact, and establishment of registers.

Pollock, Ross.

Everybody wants the new college graduates. *Personnel administration*, vol. 19, no. 5, September-October 1956, pp. 42-44.

Points out that competition for the college graduate is great in both business and government, and that so far as recruitment by federal agencies goes, success varies greatly. Feels that one of the answers is new stress on manpower planning and college recruitment.

Porter, George R.

An agency evaluates its college recruitment program. *Personnel administration*, vol. 16, no. 1, January 1953, pp. 20-22.

Reports on recruitment program of the National Bureau of Standards and makes recommendations based on this experience.

Reappraising the federal career recruitment program.

*Journal of college placement*, vol. 19, no. 3, March 1959, pp. 22-23, 106, 108, 110.

Describes the first all-agency college recruiting conference held in Washington, D. C., in February 1959, sponsored by the U. S. Civil Service Commission.

Society for Personnel Administration.

A guide to college recruitment. Washington, D. C., 1956. 15 pp. (Pamphlet no. 12)

Points out that a positive, aggressive, and continuing recruitment program is necessary to attract and retain college graduates. Outlines a program which is designed to attract high-caliber college talent in administrative, scientific, technical, and professional areas.

U. S. Department of the Air Force.

Effective college recruiting. Washington, D. C., 1956. 27 pp. (Program supplement no. 24)

Offers guides for use in planning college recruitment activities. Tells step-by-step how to plan and organize a recruiting program and how to apply and evaluate the results. Includes samples of procedures and forms developed by Air Research and Development Command.

### College Graduates—Business and Industry

Chamber of Commerce of the United States.

Principles and practices of college recruiting. Washington, D. C., 1957. 10 pp.

Statement of recommended recruitment practices indicating responsibilities of employer, college, and student.

College recruitment—an aid to public and personnel relations.

*Journal of college placement*, vol. 17, no. 1, October 1956, pp. 15-17, 100.

Examines some of the practices which have developed in college recruitment in terms of their soundness and their effect on employees, stockholders, educational institutions and the general public.

Endicott, Frank S.

Trends in the employment of college and university graduates in business and industry, 1960. Evanston, Ill., Northwestern University, 1959. 9 pp.

## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

Hill, Karl A.

A look at college recruiting. In American Management Association. Building an effective workforce. New York, 1955, pp. 13-23. (Personnel series no. 165)

Some of the things which can be done to improve college recruiting include: broadening the base of recruiting; adopting toward men subject to military service policies that recognize the realities of the situation and that protect company's investment in campus interviewing; planning recruiting program carefully, developing close and more permanent relationships with faculty and administrative officials as well as placement people.

Jamie, Wallace.

A model program for corporate recruitment. Journal of college placement, vol. 17, no. 3, March 1957, pp. 99-138; vol. 17, no. 4, May 1957, pp. 113-124, 127-132.

Broad study and survey of the field of college recruitment. Following a general introduction stressing the importance of recruitment and the pitfalls the new recruitment program may encounter, the article examines typical placement facilities on college campuses and the adequacy of their operation. Then explores typical company procedures in collegiate recruitment.

Knudson, Harry R.

The all-American boy. Personnel journal, vol. 39, no. 2, June 1960, pp. 56-57, 67.

Points out wastefulness of companies hiring outstanding college graduates when positions to be filled are not challenging and do not have executive potential. Shows how two companies cut recruiting costs and reduced turnover by hiring above-average graduates only for those positions with management possibilities, filling other jobs with "average" candidates.

Midwest College Placement Association.

Annual recruiting survey, 1959. Journal of college placement, vol. 20, no. 1, October 1959, pp. 70-72, 74, 76, 78, 80.

Concentrating on salaries, personnel requirements, and recruiting and employment practices, the annual survey shows the happenings of the past year and serves as a guide to the trends for 1960.

National Industrial Conference Board, Inc.

Employment of the college graduate. New York, 1956. 39 pp. (Studies in personnel policy no. 152)

Reports on methods used by 240 American companies in recruiting, selecting and training college graduates. Discusses salaries and salary trends for the last 15 years and includes ideas and attitudes of company executives on various recruiting practices.

Selecting and training the college recruit.

Journal of the American Society of Training Directors, vol. 9, no. 6, November-December 1955, pp. 14-17, 47-52.

Reports on efforts of industry to do a more professional job of college recruiting and tells some of the techniques they are using. Includes lengthy bibliography on recruiting, technical training and non-technical training.

Shaw, Reid L.

College recruiting: vital first step in management development. Management review, vol. 49, no. 5, May 1960, pp. 23-27, 81-84.

Stresses importance of relationship between recruiting and management development.

"Determining future manpower needs, identifying and providing career opportunities, establishing effective training programs, maintaining consistently high standards for candidates, and employing effective recruiters—all are critical to success in recruiting men with the potential to lead the company in the challenging years that lie ahead."



**Talent hunt methods that win.**

Nation's business, vol. 45, no. 3, March 1957, pp. 107-111.

Lists and discusses five questions which business will have to answer in order to compete effectively for college talent.

**The Campus Interview**

**Bryant, Royce R.**

Placement of college graduates: 8-point improvement program. Personnel journal, vol. 38, no. 2, June 1959, pp. 58-61.

Lists and discusses eight steps which might be taken to improve the placement of college graduates. Recommends greater cooperation between recruiters and college placement personnel.

**Bunin, Sanford.**

The campus recruiter. Advanced management, vol. 25, no. 1, January 1960, pp. 23-25.

Presents insights into current practices of campus recruiters as they appear to students evaluating recruitment interviews. Six general patterns emerging are: salesman, interrogator, busy man, columnist, repeater, and big time operator.

**Calvert, Robert, Jr.**

Six steps to more effective recruiting of college graduates. Public personnel review, vol. 20, no. 3, July 1959, pp. 214-217.

Suggests six steps which should help overcome weaknesses in current governmental recruiting procedures: give recruiter more authority, use a more professional approach, establish a recruiting coordinator, speed up to meet competition, "sell" the program, and develop and cultivate campus contacts.

**Carlston, Herald L.**

Audio-visual recruitment on campus. In American Management Association. Assuring adequate reserves of key personnel. New York, 1956, pp. 34-42. (Personnel series no. 169)

Discusses new, inexpensive, and effective audio-visual communication system introduced at the University of Utah as a recruitment aid.

**How to recruit college graduates.**

Management methods, vol. 11, no. 5, February 1957, pp. 12-13, 56-58.

Most clearly defined criticism voiced by placement officers surveyed by Management Methods was leveled at company personnel who do the on-campus recruiting. Article presents critical analysis of campus recruiting and makes suggestions for improving the process.

**Kopff, Richard G.**

Special problems of the campus interview. Personnel, vol. 32, no. 6, May 1956, pp. 538-543.

Lists six important respects in which the college interview differs from the usual personnel interview, explains in detail each of the six differences and notes their effect on the interview and on some other related personnel practices.

**Krech, Edward M., Jr.**

What students think of campus recruiters. Personnel, vol. 35, no. 2, September-October 1958, pp. 72-76.

Survey of a graduating class of the Cornell Graduate School of Business Administration revealed that students felt they met far too many campus recruiters who were inefficient. Discusses specific weaknesses revealed in campus interviews.

## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

Lambert, Don E.

The common ground. *Journal of college placement*, vol. 17, no. 1, October 1956, pp. 19-20, 85.

In an effort to determine what the major problems are and how to solve them, the article reports what 45 major colleges and 35 oil companies have to say about modern college interviewing practices.

North Carolina. State College.

College recruiting for small industry, by Marie P. Wicker. Raleigh, 1957. 21 pp. (Facts for industry series, Bulletin no. 6)

Direct college recruiting has become a necessity for the small as well as large company. Suggests careful planning of campus visits, adherence to schedules, and individual follow-up.

Qualifications for college recruiting.

*Personnel journal*, vol. 36, no. 10, March 1958, pp. 384-386.

Outlines personal characteristics, knowledge and abilities that will make a successful college recruiter.

Shackel, Leith.

Mistakes made in recruiting college graduates. *Office executive*, vol. 31, no. 6, June 1956, pp. 21-22.

Opinion Research Corporation's survey of 626 graduates in 81 colleges revealed that most common criticism was leveled at poor attitude of interviewer. Other criticisms of interviewers were that they were unqualified, did not know how to interview, were not frank, showed discrimination because of sex, draft status, or race, and did not make proper follow-up of the interview.

Uhrbrock, Richard S.

Recruiting the college graduate: a guide for company interviewers. New York, American Management Association, 1953. 31 pp.

Zabka, George M.

Getting better results from college recruitment. *Personnel*, vol. 31, no. 4, January 1955, pp. 364-371.

Sets up a program designed to aid the small and medium-sized company in its college recruitment programs. Explains what type of company brochure would be most helpful, how to contact the college, how to select the company representative, and how to conduct the interview.

**A Survey of the City Manager Plan in Canada.** John M. McIver. *Canadian Public Administration*. September, 1960.

The idea of the council-manager form of city government, which originated in the United States, was introduced to Canada in 1913 in Westmount, Quebec. Each decade, with the exception of the depression of the thirties, has shown an increase in the number of Canadian cities adopting the plan. Quebec has more cities administered in this way than all the other six provinces with cities operating under the plan combined. In Canada, as in the United States, cities with populations between 25,000 and 50,000 are the principal users of this plan.

Data, which were obtained from 43, usable responses to a questionnaire sent to 57 city managers, indicated that most managers:

1. are between 40 and 50 years of age, are university graduates (generally professional engineers), and are members of the International City Managers Association
2. were appointed from another locality, are serving without specific tenure contract, and receive lower salaries than their American counterparts
3. have no mandatory retirement age but do have a pension plan
4. have somewhat circumscribed powers to appoint departmental heads.

Many Canadian cities, using the council-manager plan, deviate in one or two unimportant respects from the recommended plan proposed by the Model City Charter. In some instances these differences are attributable to compliance with provincial statutory provisions.

Generally, Canadian government tends to be more pragmatic than American government and hence, willing to accept minor deviations from model plans. Municipal government in Canada is usually non-

partisan. Taking all factors into consideration, we do have the essentials of the council-manager plan in Canada. (The article has twenty tables of research results.)  
—J. FRED DAWE.

**Department Changes Ahead? Get Ready Now!** Peter C. Reid. *Supervisory Management*. June, 1960.

The phrase "Employees instinctively resist change" is generally accepted and unquestioned. But is this statement really true? Resistance and confusion need not accompany departmental changes. Careful planning for scheduled changes will allay most of these difficulties.

The effective supervisor can beat the bugaboo of resistance to change by applying four basic planning principles.

First, it is important to get a head start on change in order that the supervisor have time to plan details, anticipate problems, and prepare employees.

Second, the supervisor must get the facts. Keeping himself informed and ascertaining the details of changes will enable the supervisor to coordinate changes in his department with those in other units and to communicate plans to employees.

The supervisor must then consider the departmental changes in view of an overall pattern. It is helpful to prepare a chart indicating how changes will affect each current and new employee as an aid to preparing each employee for changes. This step entails training in new methods, consideration of the need for transfers or adjustments in jobs, consideration of the need for recruiting, and consideration of the best way to win employees' acceptance of change. Communication and consultation with employees result in their identifying themselves with the problems and in gleaming valuable suggestions from them.

After this preparation, the supervisor should set up a schedule on changes to in-

## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

sure that the sequence of phases of change are logical.

Application of these planning principles will make department change an orderly rather than a chaotic process. Change does not have to be a scare word.—DOROTHY E. EVERETT.

**Morale During Personnel Cutbacks.** John T. Bair. *Personnel Administration*. July-August, 1960.

No personnel problem, from the worker standpoint, has received more attention than how to gain or retain full employment and how to reduce the consequences of unemployment when it does come. This article, however, concerns the equally great problem of sustaining morale during periods of personnel cutbacks for those employees who have lost their jobs, as well as those still employed but anticipating lay-off.

As a matter of fact, it has been found that anticipating a disaster may be more demoralizing than the actual blow itself. Studies of the unemployed reveal the development of a state of mind described as "giving up." When all forms of activity seem closed, the individual surrenders his will.

An extreme of this attitude occurred during World War II on Guadalcanal. The men, after being left there for about a year without relief, developed an attitude of despair, hopelessness, and depression, and, in severe cases, the condition continued long after relief and was labeled "Guadalcanal Neurosis."

The man in industry and government who has lost hope of bettering his condition develops an attitude of resignation. All aggression has been temporarily blocked and his low morale results in social neutrality. Such statements as "I've stood it this long and can't wait until I retire" or "It's always been this way and it will always be this way" are characteristic of the hopeless and the apathetic. They depress others and lower morale.

It is a fairly common assumption today that the more anxious an employee is made, the harder he will work. Studies show, however, that there is a definite relation between anxiety and the kind of work being performed. Apparently, the anxious ditch-digger will dig longer and harder than the unanxious one—if you can keep him in the ditch. The executive's efficiency, however, is quickly impaired by anxiety.

The most important conclusion to be

drawn from the studies is that industrial morale is not determined simply by such material considerations as pay, hours, etc. The extent to which the employee enjoys the psychological satisfactions on the job that come with recognition and respect for his personality day by day, hour by hour is equally important. Foremen, department heads, and others having direct supervision over workers play a tremendously large part in the determination of morale.

Both business and government have paid far too little attention to the qualifications for personnel administration in selection of supervisors. The routine part normally played by a personnel department is necessary, of course, but a complete personnel program must extend into the area of supervisor-worker relationships to provide a maximum degree of intangible satisfaction as well as satisfaction of basic needs. This, in the last analysis, is a line function. Each supervisor must be developed to be the personnel officer for his own people. (Article contains certain research conclusions which are put in the form of recommendations.)—RUTH L. OLSON.

### Understanding Improves Communications.

Thomas Farrell. *Personnel Journal*. July-August, 1960.

Cementing the good business relations which account largely for management's success depends more upon subordinates than upon top management. Outweighing in quantity and magnitude the effects of the whole range of management's "carefully phrased formal utterances" are the daily contacts of sales persons with customers, secretaries with visitors, office employees with clients, and supervisors with workers. Successful experimentation in in-service education in communication with sales girls, with middle management, and with whole organizations points up the fact that lack of understanding rather than lack of skill is the basic fault.

Six sales girls, an experimental group, in one department of a large department store were chosen to attend a seminar in communications; the other seven, a control group, were not. The seminar objective was to lead the girls to discover what was their communication job with customers and to develop successful methods of accomplishing it.

The effectiveness of the training produced improved sales, improved job attitudes and

job interest, more overt manifestation of liking for people, notably lowered returns and exchanges, and repeat-call customers. Even more significant to management was the fact that within three weeks the spread between the experimental and the control groups dropped "due to a rise in the efficiency of the control group." The new understanding of the girls in the experimental group was being "communicated" to the other members of the sales group. Side benefits, such as absence of frictions and tensions and of requests for transfers, further enhanced the worth of the seminar experimentation.

Another experimental seminar in communication was conducted among middle-management men responsible for operations in a branch of a manufacturing corporation. To identify and describe clearly the communication job, to devise effective and efficient production methods, and to develop skill in the application of those methods was the seminar objective. Rewarding results were achieved and detailed.

Still a different type of experimentation was conducted within one organization where communications were so poor that "different groups sometimes worked separately on the same task without ever discovering others' concern with it." Also, unaware that the most knowledgeable people in some fields were their own colleagues, members of the organization almost always went outside for information they needed. Though communications were made available to all, there was no central clearing of information. Management, insecure itself because of frequent management changes, kept all policy information within its small orbit, merely announcing operating instructions.

Middle management viewed staff meetings as "the place where you go to hear announcements of accomplished facts." Senior management complained about "lacks" of cooperation, production, and contributing and supporting suggestions. Clients were dissatisfied with both quality and quantity of product but had no competing markets to shop. Management's communications were presentations without interpretations, and were rarely adapted to the needs of the receivers.

A three-pronged offensive against the incoherence and ineffectiveness of all communications was launched. Senior management sought to interpret its role through an

annual report and through a series of management letters. Middle management worked through seminar groups. Communications began to improve and group meetings of various levels of operating and management employees were scheduled to conceive other devices for further improvement.

Personnel directors, aware that much of the executive work of management is communications, must evaluate their internal and external communications to insure that the myriad daily relations, which management can't possibly supervise, are handled well by employees, by supervisors, and by executives who understand and know how to perform effectively their communication jobs. Experimentation has proved the worth of in-service communications. Continued investment of time, effort, and money for improved public and employee relations and higher company-wide morale is urged.—HELEN THOMPSON.

#### **Measuring the Work of a Personnel Department.** Stephen J. Carroll, Jr. *Personnel*. July-August, 1960.

How can management know if personnel people are working effectively? Most work-measuring techniques are inappropriate. Continuous observation reveals only overt behavior. Desk-audit interviews rely too much on the subject's memory. The diary method (personally logging work activities as they occur) is tedious, unreliable, and wasteful of productive time. Work sampling, however, eliminates many of these disadvantages.

With work sampling, observations are made at random intervals, from which inferences are drawn about the total function. A University of Minnesota study with a large manufacturing company proved the applicability of work sampling to personnel activities. Observers were the participant-subjects themselves. This unorthodox procedure readily supplied the required background understanding. At a given signal, all participants wrote observations on their own work simultaneously, noting on prepared slips what they were doing, the other persons involved, and the purpose. Random samplings were made approximately every half hour for three weeks.

The observation notes were then classified as to work activity, persons involved, and area of responsibility. Tabulated findings furnished several guideposts for improvement. Opportunities for mechanization were



## PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

discovered, and the need to improve selection tests became apparent.

Work sampling can lead to realistic unit-cost estimates. Signals for work simplification and better program planning are abundant. Management can set reasonable performance standards. Finally, work measurement answers that most vital question: Are personnel objectives being fulfilled? (Three statistical tables.)—LEW FAY.

**Ability vs. Seniority in Promotion and Layoff.** Dale D. McConkey. *Personnel*. May-June, 1960.

Seniority as the basis for determining promotions and layoffs is the cornerstone of union membership and is the outgrowth of a system in which promotions, layoffs, and other tangible results of the employment relationship were too often based on favoritism and discrimination. One of the most serious shortcomings of the seniority system is its effect on employee initiative. If a promotion may be gained merely by "putting in time," few people will trouble themselves to prepare or qualify for such an advancement. However, promotions based on seniority and ability afford the employee due recognition for his years of service and at the same time provide him with an incentive to qualify for advancements.

Although many collective-bargaining agreements provide for the recognition of ability with seniority as a determining factor in promotions and layoffs, such changes are still made on the basis of seniority alone. Some of the reasons for this situation are expediency based on the premise that strict adherence to the seniority principle promotes peaceful labor relations and the lack of established criteria for measuring ability.

The issue of ability vs. seniority, although usually associated with promotions, is equally applicable to layoffs. Temporary reductions during periods of technological change require that qualified employees are retained, otherwise costly training will need to be undertaken to minimize employee disruptions during the transition period. Ability is particularly necessary in determining who should be retained during layoffs as these persons will later be bidding for promotions.

The measuring criteria of ability must be used to offset charges of using poor selection procedures and considered in the light of how they might be reviewed by arbitra-

tors. The test put by arbitrators on measuring criteria is that they are reasonable, pertinent to the job, and are not applied in a discriminatory manner.

Measuring criteria which may be used to evaluate an employee's ability are: (1) written and performance tests, (2) number and nature of written warnings on the employee's conduct, (3) commendations, (4) age, (5) experience, (6) production record, (7) merit ratings, (8) education and training, (9) physical condition, and (10) absence and tardiness record.

To ensure that only qualified employees are selected and retained, ability with seniority must be used as a determining factor in changing employee status. As necessary elements of such a system, the measuring criteria and a systematic procedure for evaluating ability need to be formulated and put into practice—LORETTA K. FUKUDA.

**Management in the USSR—Comparisons to the United States.** Marshall E. Dimock. *Public Administration Review*. Summer, 1960.

Russian management is considered under several broad areas of administration. Since administration is basic in determining a nation's way of life, the handling of these major issues may ultimately decide the difference between the success of our system and theirs.

Soviet management motivates its workers by a detailed form of planning and goal-setting, with administrative leadership at the local level. Local officials have the authority to select the methods they employ. This is similar to the thinking of large corporations in the United States.

At each level of Soviet administration there is a planning officer and an operating official; both are party members. When policy disagreements arise, they are resolved either by the intercession of the local party organization or reference to higher authority in the organizational structure. There is evidence that not all top-level decisions are being faithfully performed at lower levels.

Since 1957 Russian government discovered it was essential to decentralize in order to avoid the breakdown of administration. As a result, Khrushchev's policy was to establish economic councils throughout the country, "like a continuous series of TVA's." To coordinate these councils, the All-Russian Economic Council was established. Some control methods of Soviet administra-

tion are similar to ours, such as the use of audits and inspections. In addition, party members function as coordinators and "watchdogs" of professional civil servants.

With regard to education, the Russian system is producing "a scientific society, run by a managerial class." In comparison, our administrators are trained to be generalists. Soviet management is employing incentives to increase production by the piecework system whereby income varies with output. On the other hand, "we seem to be dropping it—perhaps more than we should."

The challenge presented to management is which form of administrative structure is most likely to survive.—BABETTE G. GOLD-SMITH.

#### **What's Ahead—In Personnel and Training.**

Wilbert E. Scheer. *Personnel Journal*. September, 1960.

Personnel administration is really scientific management applied to human relations. Many personnel practitioners become adept at methods, but where technicians leave off is where personnel administration first begins.

As operations become more complex, companies attach new significance to their personnel functions. Training, wage administration, and benefit counseling have expanded with the expansion of industry, the growth of labor unions, and the increasing complexity of legislation.

Where once the personnel man symbolized weakness in an organization, he now symbolizes strength, and he needs to understand not only the personnel functions but also their purpose, for personnel is no longer in the periphery of the organization but closer to the center where the hard decisions are made.

Signs that personnel practices are being improved are evidenced, first, in the lessening of discrimination against the employment of minority groups, women, and older workers. Companies are realizing that ability knows no restrictions and that unfounded prejudices are costly and wasteful.

Second, personnel management is attracting better caliber people. While the field is still characterized by all sorts of people operating under various titles with varying degrees of effectiveness, as demands for professional-type service increase, misfits are being replaced by more competent technicians, better trained in skills and better equipped in the field of human relations.

Finally, those personnel executives who are making a contribution to the field are beginning to develop a philosophy of what the work is all about.—GENEVIEVE M. LIND.

#### **What's Wrong with Today's Personnel Administration?** S. Vincent Wilking. *Management Review*. September, 1960.

Personnel administration is still something of a Johnny-come-lately compared with the old, accepted business functions. Sometimes its value is "discovered" only when the very survival of the business is threatened. When conditions return to normal, it reverts to its second-class status, concerned with people-tinkering in highly specific and restricted areas. It is seldom regarded as a unified comprehensive function crucial to the welfare of the business.

Part of the blame for this lies with the personnel practitioners themselves who may have become specialists in the worst sense of the word and have thus failed to gain rapport with management. There is also a natural tendency for a manager to discount the need for specialized assistance in selecting, compensating, counseling and developing staff—he is usually sure he can do these things better and more quickly himself. They are delegated only when they become burdensome and time-consuming. As a result he pays relatively low salaries, obtains mediocre people in the personnel department and, not surprisingly, finds they can handle only routine assignments.

If personnel is to make its full contribution to the business enterprise it must be guided by a unifying set of principles that can challenge the best of its practitioners. The following eight principles are suggested:

1. The human assets of any company are of great economic value to be conserved, cultivated, and enhanced if it is to grow and prosper.
2. The line is primarily responsible and accountable for the effective and enlightened use and treatment of all people in the organization.
3. Specialized staff is needed to assist and counsel the line in its many responsibilities, including personnel.
4. The personnel staff is available to counsel and assist the chief executive and line officials in the formulation of objectives, plans, policies, procedures, and practices relating to the maximum effective use of the organization's human resources.

5. The personnel staff must continually study, analyze, evaluate, and review all aspects of the personnel program.
  6. The personnel staff must be informed of, and have access to, plans and activities at all levels and in all departments so that it can provide counsel and advice concerning the human relations aspects involved.
  7. It must apply approved personnel policies equitably and consistently throughout the organization.
  8. It must keep abreast of philosophies and techniques in its specialized area.
- J. STUART STEPHEN.

**Planning for Survival.** Leo A. Hoegh.  
*National Civic Review*. September, 1960.

The question of civil government surviving a nuclear attack is no longer academic since the possibility of such an attack grows with each passing crisis in the field of international rivalry.

In cooperation with the Council of State Governments, the Office of Civil and Defense Mobilization in 1957 prepared the Continuity of Government Program based upon the principle that state and local governments must provide the framework upon which emergency governmental operations shall be based in the event of a nuclear attack. The proposals are concerned with the selection of temporary successors to elective officers who might be killed or rendered incapable of performing their required functions; the removal of state and local governments to other locations as required; and, by constitutional amendments, grant to state legislatures all necessary authority to provide for the continuity of government during an emergency.

Recently, two additional measures have been proposed to state legislatures dealing with the selection and preservation of those state and local government records which are essential to continuity of government at any level, and with the development of an efficient and economical system of records management.

While many jurisdictions have some records legislation, it is generally inadequate in that these laws fail to distinguish between records essential to continuity of government and records that may have no value. Other omissions in such legislation are failure to permit removal of records from one location to another when events require relocation of the seat of government,

inadequate recognition of the legality of photo-duplicated records, and no central authority to direct preservation of public records.

Four states have already accepted constitutional amendments dealing with continuity of government and fourteen others will act in the November, 1960, election. Impressive support of the Continuity of Government Program has come from both labor and political parties, organized labor, community service organizations, veterans groups, and various organizations of public officials at local, state, and federal levels.

It is vital that the people move now to prepare to meet emergencies that would be a part of nuclear war; it will be too late to prepare once the attack has taken place.—MURRAY BOOKBINDER.

#### Abstracters for 1961

The following members of the Public Personnel Association have accepted the editor's invitation to serve as abstracters of articles for the "Personnel Literature" section of *Public Personnel Review* during 1961:

**Murray Bookbinder**, Personnel Officer, Police Department, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.

**J. Fred Dawe**, Civil Service Commission of Canada, Ottawa.

**Dorothy E. Everett**, University of California, Berkeley.

**Lew Fay**, Personnel Director, San Diego, California, City Civil Service Commission.

**Loretta K. Fukuda**, Recruiting and Examining Supervisor, Hawaii Department of Civil Service, Honolulu.

**Babette G. Goldsmith**, Civil Service Examiner, San Francisco City and County Civil Service Commission.

**Genevieve M. Lind**, Training Officer, Oregon State Civil Service Commission, Salem.

**Ruth L. Olson**, Bureau Personnel Officer, Bureau of Aeronautics, Department of the Navy, Washington, D. C.

**J. Stuart Stephen**, Director of Personnel, Province of Ontario Civil Service Commission, Toronto.

**Helen Thompson**, Assistant Personnel Director, City of Atlanta, Georgia.

## HISTORY OF THE UNITED STATES CIVIL SERVICE

**Paul P. Van Riper, Cornell University.** The first history of the civil service of the federal government to be published in more than fifty years. Especially impressive are the chapters analyzing the problems of the civil service at the end of World War II and in the Eisenhower administration. Belongs in the professional library of every personnelist. 588 pp. \$7.50\*

## LEADERSHIP IN ADMINISTRATION: A Sociological Interpretation

**Philip Selznick, University of California, Berkeley.** "... happily devoid of a single word of jargon and deals in stimulating fashion with a subject that has been neglected in the current literature of organizational theory . . . the Selznick volume deserves special recognition for its readability and for its suggestive, stimulating ideas."—Marver Bernstein, Princeton University, *American Political Science Review*, March 1959. 162 pp. \$4.00\*

## GROUP DYNAMICS: Research and Theory

**Dorwin Cartwright and Alvin Zander, University of Michigan, Editors.** A practical guide for people who work with groups—administrators, personnel officers, chairmen, social workers, individual psychologists, and others. *Second Edition.* 832 pp. \$7.25\*

\*15% discount postpaid to A.S.P.A. members if check accompanies order.

## ROW, PETERSON AND COMPANY

Publishers of Good Books in Evanston, Illinois, and Elmsford, New York

### EDWARD N. HAY & ASSOCIATES

*Management Consultants*

121 S. Broad St., Phila. 7, Pa.

*Write for Brochure:*

ORGANIZING  
and MANAGING  
for RESULTS

## GRIFFENHAGEN-KROEGER, INC.

The merger of two long-established firms offers  
60 years of combined experience

Personnel policy and methods • Job classification  
Compensation plans • Training • Evaluation • Executive  
Selection • Testing • Group insurance

64 Pine Street  
San Francisco, Cal.

Other Offices: Los Angeles, Chicago,  
New York, Philadelphia, Washington, D. C.

- Administrative Surveys
- Organization Analysis
- Systems and Procedures
- Salary and Classification
- Manpower and Staffing
- Office Mechanization
- Performance Budgeting
- Records Administration

### BARRINGTON AND COMPANY, INC.

230 Park Avenue—New York 17

Member, Association of Consulting Management Engineers

Brochure on Request

### J. L. JACOBS & COMPANY

*Counselors in Personnel Administration  
Since 1915*

POSITION CLASSIFICATION—SALARY PLANS  
RECRUITING AND EXAMINATION  
STANDARDS  
EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE RATINGS  
PERSONNEL RECORDS SIMPLIFICATION  
RULES AND REGULATIONS  
PERSONNEL MANUALS

53 West Jackson Blvd. Chicago 4, Ill.

### LEE ASSOCIATES INC.

*Public Administration Consultants*

An experienced staff of public personnel specialists available for surveys and installations.

JOHNSTON BLDG., CHARLOTTE  
CANDLER BLDG., ATLANTA

### JAMES O. YARGER AND ASSOCIATES

PERSONNEL AND MANAGEMENT SERVICES

Services for all units of government:  
Position Classification and Salary Plans  
Retirement Systems  
Personnel Ordinances and Regulations  
Employee Selection and Evaluation  
Administrative and Fiscal Surveys

An experienced senior staff for your use

309 Walnut St., Falls Church, Virginia

### PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION SERVICE

*A Unique Service to Governments*

- A record of more than three hundred successful personnel surveys and installations at all levels of government.
- Consulting services in all areas of governmental management.
- Pertinent publications in many branches of public administration.

1313 East 60th Street, Chicago 37, Illinois



**SAVE TIME!**

**INCREASE EFFICIENCY!**

**IMPROVE MORALE!**

The Institute for Training in Municipal Administration offers eleven courses and books especially prepared for officials in the city hall:

- The Technique of Municipal Administration
- Municipal Finance Administration
- Municipal Fire Administration
- Municipal Public Works Administration
- Municipal Police Administration
- Local Planning Administration
- Municipal Recreation Administration
- Municipal Personnel Administration
- Supervisory Methods in Municipal Administration
- Management Practices for Smaller Cities
- Administration of Community Health Services

Clothbound

\$7.50 Each

Training Kits for Discussion Leaders are also available for use with each of the ICMA training courses. \$10.

For information write to:

INSTITUTE FOR TRAINING IN MUNICIPAL ADMINISTRATION

conducted by

THE INTERNATIONAL CITY MANAGERS' ASSOCIATION

1313 East 60th Street

Chicago 37, Illinois